

SSAC Operational Procedures Version 5.0



The Operational Procedures of the ICANN Security and Stability Advisory
Committee
FINAL 20 June 2016

Preface

These are the Operational Procedures of the Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC). The SSAC advises the ICANN community and Board of Directors on matters relating to the security and integrity of the Internet's naming and address allocation systems. This includes operational matters (e.g., matters pertaining to the correct and reliable operation of the root name system), administrative matters (e.g., matters pertaining to address allocation and Internet number assignment), and registration matters (e.g., matters pertaining to registry and registrar services such as domain name registration data directory services). SSAC engages in ongoing threat assessment and risk analysis of the Internet naming and address allocation services to assess where the principal threats to stability and security lie, and advises the ICANN community accordingly. In general, in providing its security advice, the SSAC specifically excludes consideration of non-technical factors (e.g. financial, political, etc.). The SSAC has no official authority to regulate, enforce, or adjudicate. Those functions belong to others, and the advice SSAC offers should be evaluated on its merits.

These Operational Procedures document how the SSAC has carried out its own work and the accumulated rationale. These Operational Procedures are not a substitute for the SSAC Charter or any formal rules derived from the ICANN Bylaws. If there are conflicts between this document and either the SSAC Charter or formal rules derived from the ICANN Bylaws, the latter interpretation shall supersede this document.

Table of Contents

1. Who We Are and What We Do	6
1.1 Relationship to ICANN	7
1.2 Purpose of This Document	7
1.3 Background	7
1.4 SSAC Charter	8
1.5 Formal Structure	8
1.5.1 SSAC Administrative Committee	9
2. SSAC Membership	9
2.1 Member Participation	10
2.1.1 Confidentiality of Deliberations	10
2.1.2 Withdrawals and Dissents	10
2.2 Membership Committee	11
2.2.1 Membership Committee Selection	11
2.2.2 Membership Committee Quorum	12
2.2.3 Membership Committee Operation	12
2.3. New Member Selection	12
2.4 Departing Members	15
2.5 Annual Review Process	16
2.5.1 Annual Review Process Schedule	19
2.6 Protection of and Access to Information	20
2.6.1 Affirmation of Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure	20
2.7 SSAC Member Services	21
2.7.1 Wiki Workspace	21
2.7.2 SSAC Mailing Lists	21
2.8 SSAC Roles	22
2.8.1 Chair	22
2.8.2 Vice-Chair	24
2.8.3 SSAC Outward Liaisons	24
2.8.4 SSAC Inward Liaisons	26
2.8.5 ICANN Support Staff	26

2.8.6 Invited Guests	27
3. SSAC Publication Procedures	28
3.1 Proposing, Selecting, and Planning a Work Product	28
3.1.1 Request from the ICANN Board of Directors or Other ICANN Advisory Committees or Supporting Organizations.....	28
3.1.2 Requests from ICANN Staff.....	28
3.1.3 Self Tasking.....	29
3.2 Study and Primary Work.....	29
3.2.1 Establishing a Work Party.....	29
3.2.2 Work Party Leader Obligations	29
3.2.3 Developing an Initial Draft Work Product.....	29
3.2.4 Preliminary Review.....	31
3.3 Developing Final Drafts, and Previewing Recommendations	31
3.3.1 Developing Final Drafts.....	31
3.3.2 Review by ICANN Legal Staff.....	32
3.3.3 Previewing Recommendations.....	32
3.4 Publication, Promulgation, and Publicizing	33
3.5 Tracking, Review, and Follow-Up.....	34
3.5.1 Work Product Numbering.....	34
3.6 Types of Publications	35
3.6.1 Reports.....	35
3.6.2 Comments.....	35
3.6.3 Advisories	35
3.6.4 Comments to the ICANN Public Forum.....	35
4. SSAC Work Plan and Activity Reporting	36
5. SSAC Meetings.....	36
5.1 Administrative Committee Meetings	37
5.2 SSAC Internal Meetings.....	37
5.3 SSAC Public Meetings at ICANN Meetings	38
5.4 SSAC Workshop	39
5.6 Special Meetings.....	40
APPENDIX A: SSAC HISTORY	41
APPENDIX B: SSAC MEMBER DISCLOSURE OF INTERESTS	44

Definitions.....	44
Timeliness	44
Content	44
APPENDIX C: SSAC NEW MEMBER BOARD SUBMISSION COVER LETTER.....	46
APPENDIX D: ICANN BOARD SUBMISSION FORM FOR SSAC APPOINTMENT/REAPPOINTMENTS.....	48
APPENDIX E: ICANN BOARD SUBMISSION FORM TO THANK DEPARTING SSAC MEMBER	51
APPENDIX F: AFFIRMATION OF CONFIDENTIALITY AND NON-DISCLOSURE	53
APPENDIX G: SSAC NOTIFICATION OF SSAC LIAISON TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS	54
APPENDIX H: SSAC PUBLICATION SUBMISSION COVER LETTER.....	55
APPENDIX I: SSAC WEB SITE, WIKI PAGE, AND CALENDAR.....	56
APPENDIX J: SSAC LOGO	57

1. Who We Are and What We Do

The Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC) is a semi-autonomous body of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Number (ICANN) consisting of technical experts who review incidents, issues, and topics that are broadly related to the security and stability of the Internet's naming and address allocation systems. The SSAC is chartered as an Advisory Committee under the ICANN By-Laws, Article 12, Section 12.2(b).¹ The SSAC is one of several ICANN Advisory Committees, which together with the several Supporting Organizations represent the stakeholders in ICANN's multi-stakeholder model of operation. See below for additional information on SSAC's formation and charter.

The SSAC produces reports, advisories, and comments on a range of topics. Reports are longer, substantive documents, which usually take a few or several months to develop. Advisories are shorter documents produced more quickly to provide timely advice to the community. Comments are responses to reports or other documents prepared by others, i.e. ICANN staff, Supporting Organizations, other Advisory Committees, or, perhaps, by groups outside of ICANN.

The SSAC advises the ICANN community and Board of Directors on matters relating to the security and integrity of the Internet's naming and address allocation systems. This includes operational matters (e.g., matters pertaining to the correct and reliable operation of the root name system), administrative matters (e.g., matters pertaining to address allocation and Internet number assignment), and registration matters (e.g., matters pertaining to registry and registrar services such as domain name registration data directory services). The SSAC engages in ongoing threat assessment and risk analysis of the Internet naming and address allocation services to assess where the principal threats to stability and security lie, and advises the ICANN community accordingly. In general, in providing its security advice, the SSAC specifically excludes consideration of non-technical factors (e.g. financial, political, etc.).

The SSAC generally prepares its publications for use by Internet security experts, the ICANN community, and the public. Most of the SSAC's work is for unrestricted distribution, but when circumstances require it (e.g., disclosure of sensitive information might interfere with a study or put a service or individual in jeopardy), access may be restricted to SSAC members or the ICANN Board of Directors. The SSAC has no formal authority. Its effectiveness comes from the quality of the advice it provides and whether others accept and follow that advice.

See Appendix A for a brief history of SSAC and ICANN.

¹See <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-bylaws-27may16-en.pdf>.

1.1 Relationship to ICANN

Article 12 of the ICANN Bylaws established the SSAC.² The SSAC is composed of volunteer members. The members are recognized experts in the domain name, addressing, and/or security areas. All members provide independent advice and are expected to call attention to circumstances when the comments they offer are not their own. All members provide biographical information that is linked to the SSAC public web site and provide a disclosure of interest statement.³ SSAC members determine the content of documents. If members wish to withdraw support from a document, or register a dissent, these positions are included at the end of the document to which they apply.

The SSAC appoints a non-voting liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors for a three-year term. The liaison attends Board meetings, participates fully in Board deliberations, and is bound by the same confidentiality and fiduciary responsibilities as voting Board members. See Section 2.8.3.1 for details.

1.2 Purpose of This Document

This document describes the SSAC's Operational Procedures. Article 12 of the ICANN Bylaws establishes the Charter of the SSAC, but the SSAC develops its own operational procedures. When it was established in 2002 the SSAC operated informally without documented procedures. In 2009, the SSAC decided to document its operation to improve its procedures and enhance communication between the SSAC and other ICANN structures. This document describes the day-to-day operation of the SSAC and various circumstances that have arisen during its operation to date. It provides useful guidance to new SSAC members. The SSAC will review these Operational Procedures each year to ensure they are current.

1.3 Background

At its 15 November 2001 meeting, the ICANN Board of Directors approved Resolution 01.117, directing the ICANN President “to appoint a President’s standing committee on the security and stability of the Internet’s naming and address allocation systems. The President [was] directed to develop a proposed charter, with at least a focus on risk analysis and auditing thereof, in consultation with the President’s standing committee, and to submit it to the ICANN Board of Directors for its approval.”⁴

² ARTICLE 12: ADVISORY COMMITTEES, Section 1. GENERAL, The Board may create one or more “Advisory Committees” in addition to those set forth in this Article 12. Advisory Committee membership may consist of Directors only, Directors and non-directors, or non-directors only, and may also include non-voting or alternate members. Advisory Committees shall have no legal authority to act for ICANN, but shall report their findings and recommendations to the Board. See: <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-bylaws-27may16-en.pdf>.

³See <https://www.icann.org/groups/ssac>.

⁴See Third Annual Meeting of the Board Minutes, 15 November 2001 at <http://www.icann.org/en/minutes/minutes-15nov01.htm>.

1.4 SSAC Charter

At its 14 March 2002 meeting, the ICANN Board of Directors approved the Charter of the ICANN Committee on Security and Stability.⁵ On 13 May 2002, the ICANN Board of Directors approved Resolution 02.63 to establish the SSAC as an ICANN advisory committee under Article VII, Section 3 of the ICANN Bylaws.⁶ According to the SSAC Charter, the Committee on Security and Stability will advise the ICANN community and Board of Directors on matters relating to the security and integrity of the Internet's naming and address allocation systems. Reporting directly to the ICANN Board of Directors, the Committee is chartered is to undertake the following tasks:

1. To communicate on security matters with the Internet technical community and the operators and managers of critical DNS infrastructure services, to include the root name server operator community, the top-level domain registries and registrars, the operators of the reverse delegation trees such as `in-addr.arpa` and `ip6.arpa`, and others as events and developments dictate. The Committee will gather and articulate requirements to offer to those engaged in technical revision of the protocols related to DNS and address allocation and those engaged in operations planning.
2. To engage in ongoing threat assessment and risk analysis of the Internet naming and address allocation services to assess where the principal threats to stability and security lie, and to advise the ICANN community accordingly. The Committee will recommend any necessary audit activity to assess the current status of DNS and address allocation security in relation to identified risks and threats.
3. To communicate with those who have direct responsibility for Internet naming and address allocation security matters (IETF, RSSAC, RIRs, name registries, etc.), to ensure that its advice on security risks, issues, and priorities is properly synchronized with existing standardization, deployment, operational, and coordination activities. The Committee will monitor these activities and inform the ICANN community and ICANN Board of Directors on their progress, as appropriate.
4. To report periodically to the ICANN Board of Directors on its activities.
5. To make policy recommendations to the ICANN community and ICANN Board of Directors.⁷

1.5 Formal Structure

All SSAC members participate as equals in SSAC activities. Although the SSAC recognizes a small set of roles, these roles usually do not convey any special privileges or rights on SSAC

⁵ See Minutes of Regular Meeting, 14 March 2002 at <http://www.icann.org/en/minutes/minutes-14mar02.htm>.

⁶ See Minutes of Special Meeting, 13 May 2002 at <http://www.icann.org/en/minutes/minutes-13may02.htm>.

⁷ See the Security Committee Charter, 14 March 2002 at <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/charter-1f-2012-02-25-en>.

members. SSAC members are asked to provide both biographical information and a disclosure of interest. These are linked to the SSAC web page.⁸ See Appendix B for a list of current and past members.

The SSAC membership is comprised of the following roles: Chair, Vice-Chair, SSAC members, SSAC outward and inward liaisons, and Invited Guests. If and when applicable, any member serving in a role may be asked to clarify whether their remarks represent SSAC or personal positions. The ICANN Board of Directors appoints the Chair and the SSAC members. The SSAC members appoint all other roles. See Section 2.8 below for a description of each role.

An individual who has been invited by the SSAC to become a member, but who has not been appointed by the ICANN Board of Directors, may participate in the SSAC as an Invited Guest (see Section 2.8.6) at the discretion of the SSAC.

ICANN assigns staff to be the SSAC Support Staff to assist the SSAC in the production of its work products, which includes an assigned Director, SSAC Support. ICANN also may assign a Research Fellow to support the SSAC. In addition, ICANN staff members with areas of technical expertise relevant to SSAC activities may request to participate on the SSAC. The Membership Committee evaluates these staff following the procedure for new members as described in Section 2.3 below. The ICANN staff that are approved to participate on the SSAC are not considered SSAC members and they must be re-evaluated each year.

1.5.1 SSAC Administrative Committee

The SSAC has an Administrative Committee comprised of its Chair, Vice-Chair, Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors, and the SSAC Support Staff. The Administrative Committee meets several times per month. It considers issues that may be of interest to the SSAC and oversees all tasks undertaken by the SSAC throughout their entire lifecycle. The Administrative Committee may request Work Party leaders and other SSAC members to participate in its meetings as needed. Any SSAC member may participate on the Administrative Committee. The Director, SSAC Support, posts the current activities of the SSAC Administrative Committee on the SSAC wiki and updates the wiki after each SSAC Administrative Committee meeting.

2. SSAC Membership

The ICANN Board of Directors appoints the SSAC Chair and its members. The Board appoints the SSAC members to three-year terms with potential for renewal indefinitely. The SSAC submits membership recommendations for consideration by the ICANN Board. In addition, the SSAC accepts inward Liaisons from the other ICANN Advisory Committees and Supporting Organizations, although these Liaisons must apply and be approved as SSAC members according to the process described in this document, including abiding by operational procedures described in this document.

⁸ See <https://www.icann.org/resources/pages/ssac-biographies-2016-05-31-en>.

Members are encouraged to become familiar with the SSAC Operating Procedures. Members are expected to participate in SSAC activities according to their technical expertise or interest, including attending meetings, participating in work parties, participating on the mailing list, and contributing to and reviewing publications.

2.1 Member Participation

The ICANN Board appoints members of the SSAC as individuals, not as representatives of their respective organizations. It is further a responsibility of SSAC members to speak and express themselves in a way that represents the best solution based on the values and goals of SSAC as described in the charter of SSAC.

The views expressed by a member will of course be influenced by the views of whatever other organizations the member has interactions with, just as the views of those organizations will be influenced by the views of the member.

The opportunity to express a view that is sometimes different from that of a member's employer is based on a combination of at least the facts that members participate as individuals and that SSAC deliberations are confidential (unless special circumstances are arranged in advance).

2.1.1 Confidentiality of Deliberations

SSAC deliberations are confidential unless explicitly made public. If a member believes he or she has a responsibility of greater care than that member is obligated to report that to the SSAC as soon as it is known to exist. Members may directly ask the individual that brought information to SSAC whether that information can be shared outside of SSAC, either with attribution or under Chatham House Rule. In all cases, before the information is shared, explicit approval must be requested and received. In addition, any member may ask if any other SSAC member is complying with the confidentiality of deliberations.

2.1.2 Withdrawals and Dissents

SSAC members are expected to withdraw if they believe they have a responsibility of greater care that conflicts with their ability to act as an individual or maintain confidentiality. A member who cannot respect the principles regarding confidentiality and membership is expected to withdraw. The withdrawal may be from a specific work item or from SSAC as a whole. Withdrawals from a specific work item are understood to be an ordinary occurrence. Withdrawing from the SSAC as a whole is a very extreme action, as each individual member of the SSAC is needed based on his or her skills and other attributes as identified by the Membership Committee and approved by the Committee as a whole.

Any member at any time who is not part of the consensus position may provide a dissenting point of view. The SSAC works hard to reach consensus but when that is not possible the dissenting point of view may be included with attribution in the appropriate SSAC work product if the dissenter(s) so request.

2.2 Membership Committee

The SSAC Membership Committee manages the SSAC new member selection process and makes its recommendations to the SSAC. The Membership Committee also manages the annual review of the SSAC membership and makes recommendations for renewal to the SSAC to consider. Recommendations that are approved by the SSAC are submitted to the ICANN Board for their consideration.

The Membership Committee is comprised of the following members:

1. A Chair who also is the SSAC Vice Chair as a non-voting member;
2. The SSAC Chair as a non-voting member;
3. The SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors as a non-voting member; and
4. Five volunteers from the SSAC as voting members who are not subject to the current year's annual review process. If there are more than 5 volunteers a poll will be held to elect the 5 members.

The voting members of the Membership Committee serve for a period of one year beginning in January of each calendar year. Membership Committee members may renew their membership each year with no limit to renewals, except that no member may serve as a voting member during any year in which they are subject to the annual review process. The Membership Committee meets via teleconference and at ICANN meetings as schedules allow and when there is work to be done.

The Membership Committee provides to the SSAC quarterly reports of its activities that include the number of interviews it conducted, the number of candidates it recommended for membership, the number of new members the SSAC approved, and progress on the Annual Review Process. The Director, SSAC Support, provides staff support for the Membership Committee including scheduling calls and meetings, taking and distributing notes in a timely manner, and performing other duties as appropriate.

2.2.1 Membership Committee Selection

The Membership Committee is reconstituted each year. Members from the prior year are encourage to volunteer again, if eligible, in order to facilitate some continuity in the activities. The Director, SSAC Support, sends a message to the SSAC list asking for volunteers at the beginning of each new term. If there are not enough volunteers, the SSAC Vice Chair may approach individuals and encourage them to volunteer. If there are more than five volunteers, a poll is conducted with SSAC members indicating their support for up to five preferred candidates. The Membership Committee begins its work as soon as its voting members have been selected.

If a voting member of the Membership Committee departs for any reason during their term a replacement must be elected from the SSAC using the usual process for electing members to the Membership Committee. The Membership Committee may continue its work while the vacancy is being filled except that it may not conduct any vote until the vacancy is filled.

2.2.2 Membership Committee Quorum

As mentioned above, there are five SSAC members on the Membership Committee who are voting members. A quorum is four voting members. Votes are taken for all actions of the Membership Committee. In general, the Membership Committee seeks unanimity in all of its decisions.

2.2.3 Membership Committee Operation

The decisions of the Membership Committee are determined by conducting a vote with the voting members. The following process applies whenever a vote is conducted.

1. The vote will be conducted via email and will be open for two business days. The results of the vote will be recorded in a summary message sent to the Membership Committee mailing list.
2. A valid vote cast must be either “yes”, “object”, or “abstain”.
3. If there are any objections the grounds for the objections will be recorded.
4. Abstentions will not count as “no” votes, i.e., they will count as a valid vote with no positive or negative value.
5. At least a quorum of votes must have been cast at the close of the vote for the vote to be valid. The vote will be repeated until at least a quorum of votes has been cast.
6. A simple majority of “yes” votes will decide the vote in favor of the question.
7. If the voting results in a tie, the SSAC Chair shall cast the deciding vote. This provision shall not apply if no affirmative votes have been cast.
8. Voting details other than the outcome will not be disclosed outside of the Membership Committee.

Operational matters not otherwise specified in this document are decided by the Membership Committee according to this voting process.

2.3. New Member Selection

The Membership Committee considers and may recommend to the SSAC new SSAC member candidates at any time during the calendar year. The Membership Committee evaluates these candidates individually, rather than collectively. The Membership Committee may learn of interested candidates in several ways: an SSAC member may recommend a candidate, a candidate may contact the Director, SSAC Support via the SSAC web site, or a community member may make a recommendation to the SSAC. In every case, the following procedure will apply:

1. Prospective candidates are required to make a self-nomination. When a recommendation comes from a third party, the nomination is recorded and the nominator is directed to encourage the prospective candidate to express their interest directly.

2. The Director, SSAC Support contacts interested candidates and collects information requested by the Membership Committee to support its decision process. The candidate will have at most two weeks to provide the following information:
 - a. Resume, curriculum vitae (CV), or biography;
 - b. A brief statement of interest describing why they are interested in joining the SSAC and what skills they would bring to the committee;
 - c. A completed skills survey as provided;
 - d. A Disclosure of Interest (see Appendix B);
 - e. Links to presentations, publications and other information that can be used to evaluate the work produced by the candidate; and
 - f. Other information as requested by the Membership Committee.

If the information is not provided in a timely manner consideration of the candidate will be discontinued without prejudice.

3. The Director, SSAC Support provides the package of information to the Membership Committee to review and determine if the candidate should be interviewed or rejected.
4. If an interview is requested, the Director, SSAC Support arranges for an interview between the candidate and the Membership Committee at a mutually convenient time.

On the basis of the candidate's information and interview the Membership Committee reviews the candidate against the current SSAC members' skills. In particular, the Membership Committee seeks to answer the following primary questions:

1. Is the candidate sufficiently familiar with the SSAC and its work?
2. Can the candidate devote time to participate in the SSAC, including participating in regular meetings, work parties, and in the development of work products?
3. Does the candidate bring to the SSAC skills and experiences needed within the SSAC?

In addition to the primary questions, the Membership Committee compares the candidate against secondary issues as follows:

- Relationship to other organizations inside ICANN;
- Relationship to other organizations outside ICANN; and
- Geographic, gender, and other diversity.

The Membership Committee Chair will inform via email those candidates that the Membership Committee decides are not currently suitable for SSAC membership. It is important to note that the names of candidates who are not recommended for membership are not disclosed outside of the Membership Committee. However, a candidate is not prevented from contacting SSAC members concerning the process. If a candidate appeals the decision, the SSAC Chair and Vice Chair shall determine how to address the appeal on a case-by-case basis; the decision of the Chair and Vice Chair shall be final. Candidates who have not been recommended for membership may not re-apply for at least 12 months after the date of submission of their initial application.

For those candidates whom the Membership Committee decides to recommend for membership to the SSAC, the following procedure will apply:

1. The Director of SSAC Support will send a message to the SSAC list with the Membership Committee's recommendation, including all of the supporting information except the skills survey results, and allow at least one week for any SSAC member to respond with an objection, which must include the grounds for the objection. The message will make it clear that if no objections are received on the SSAC list the candidate will be considered as a member of the SSAC as an Invited Guest, subject to review by the ICANN Board. If during that period an objection is received, the procedure is interrupted at this point and the alternative procedure described below is followed.
2. The Membership Committee Chair will send an email message to the candidate welcoming them as an Invited Guest.
3. The Director, SSAC Support, will confirm the candidate's preferred email address for SSAC participation.
4. Upon receiving confirmation of the candidate's email address it will be added to the SSAC list by the Director, SSAC Support, who shall also send a message to the SSAC list welcoming the new subscriber.
5. The Director, SSAC Support, will add the Invited Guest to the SSAC wiki.
6. The Director, SSAC Support, will prepare the following documents for submission by the SSAC Board Liaison for consideration by the ICANN Board of Directors at its next feasible regularly scheduled meeting:
 - a. A cover letter from the SSAC Chair sent via the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors requesting Board consideration of the SSAC's recommendation, including the prospective member's biographical information and Disclosure of Interest; and
 - b. A Board Submission for the Board resolution to appoint the new member for a term of three calendar years commencing on 01 January of the next year and ending on 31 December of the third year following the start. (See Appendices C and D.)

Until the ICANN Board of Directors appoints the member candidate and prior to the beginning of the prospective member's term of membership on the SSAC, he or she participates on the SSAC as an Invited Guest. If the Board appoints the new SSAC member, the Director, SSAC Support shall add the member to the list of SSAC members on the web page and will post the biographical information with the Disclosure of Interest on the SSAC member biographical page.

For candidates that receive any objection from any SSAC member, the following procedure will apply:

1. The SSAC Chair shall moderate a review of the Membership Committee decision among the SSAC Membership.
2. The Membership Committee Chair is permitted to share with the SSAC the relevant substance of the Membership Committee's deliberations without attribution.
3. The SSAC Chair shall have the responsibility to identify and declare the SSAC consensus position of the review of the Membership Committee's decision.
4. The SSAC consensus position shall be final.

If the ICANN Board rejects a candidate the Membership Committee will consider the objections and seek to resolve them. If a resolution is not forthcoming the candidate's Invited Guest status shall be revoked.

The Membership Committee Chair will inform via email those candidates that the SSAC decides are not currently suitable for SSAC membership. If a candidate appeals the decision, the SSAC Chair and Vice Chair shall determine how to address the appeal on a case-by-case basis; the decision of the SSAC Chair and Vice Chair shall be final. Candidates who have not been recommended for membership may not re-apply for at least 12 months after the date of submission of their initial application.

2.4 Departing Members

Individual members may resign at any time for any reason. In the case of a departing member, the following procedure will apply:

1. The departing member, at his or her own discretion, may send a notification of their resignation to the SSAC mailing list. If appropriate, any member of the SSAC Administrative Committee may send the announcement.
2. The Director, SSAC Support, removes the departing member from all SSAC lists and removes access to all SSAC member only materials and services as appropriate.
3. The Director, SSAC Support, will prepare the following documents for submission by the SSAC Board Liaison for consideration by the ICANN Board of Directors at its next feasible regularly scheduled meeting:
 - a. A cover letter from the SSAC Chair sent via the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors requesting the Board to consider thanking the departing member; and

- b. A Board Submission for the Board resolution to thank the departing member for their services. The request includes the beginning and end dates of the departing member's tenure on the SSAC.

2.5 Annual Review Process

The Membership Committee conducts an annual review process for those members whose terms expire at the end of the calendar year. The following process applies:

1. The first action for the current year's Membership Committee is to set a schedule for the annual review process and review the requirements to be completed by each SSAC member subject to the annual review process.
2. The Director, SSAC Support, publishes the schedule to the SSAC list along with the requirements set forth by the Membership Committee.
3. The Director, SSAC Support, tracks the completion of the requirements and provides a summary to the Membership Committee as soon after the deadline set in the schedule as is practical. The Membership Committee may decide not to review the membership of an SSAC member who does not complete the requirements by the deadline.
4. The Membership Committee reviews the level of participation and the completion of the requested tasks of each member subject to the annual review process.
5. Based on its review the Membership Committee decides whether or not to recommend the renewal of a member's membership.

Members who are currently being reviewed are expected to complete at least the following requirements:

- Complete a skills survey as provided by the Director, SSAC Support.
- Review and update, if necessary, biographical information on the SSAC web site.
- Review and update, if necessary, their Disclosure of Interest statement on the SSAC web site.

The Membership Committee will consider as much information as is reasonably available in its review of a member's level of participation. The following primary criteria will be included in the information reviewed:

- Attendance at SSAC meetings and workshops (as provided by support staff using a tracking tool);
- Participation and roles in work parties (leader, contributor, and reviewer, as tracked by support staff);
- Contributions to and reviews of SSAC work products;
- Engagement on SSAC mailing lists (main list, work party lists, and other task-based lists);

- Comments from work party leaders in which members have participated during or are participating in their current term; and
- Comparison of the skill survey results with the summary of SSAC skills.

The Membership Committee should not conclude that the level of participation of a member has not been as expected unless there is clear information to support this conclusion. The lack of information supporting a member's level of participation should not be used to conclude that a member has not been participating.

The Membership Committee will consider special and secondary criteria that are important to evaluating participation or represent characteristics that are important to SSAC. These criteria include at least the following:

- Life events;
- Job considerations;
- Geography;
- Gender; and
- Other diversity considerations.

The decision of whether or not to extend a term of membership to a member is shared by the SSAC Chair with the respective member.

For those members the Membership Committee decides to recommend for membership renewal to the SSAC, the following procedure will apply:

1. The Director, SSAC Support, will send a message to the SSAC listing those members that the Membership Committee is recommending for membership renewal, allowing at least one week for any SSAC member, including the member to whom the recommendation applies, to respond with an objection regarding one or more of the recommendations, which must include the grounds for each objection. The message will make it clear that all recommended members without any objection on the SSAC list would be considered as a member of the SSAC, subject to review by the ICANN Board.
2. The Director, SSAC Support, will prepare the following documents for consideration by the ICANN Board of Directors at its meeting during ICANN's Annual General Meeting:
 - a. A cover letter from the SSAC Chair sent via the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors requesting Board consideration of the SSAC's recommendation for membership renewal; and
 - b. A Board Submission for the Board resolution to reappoint the members for a term of three years commencing on 01 January of the next year and ending on 31 December of the third year following the start.

For those members the Membership Committee decides not to recommend for membership renewal, the following procedure will apply:

1. The decision will be referred to the SSAC Chair who will discuss the decision with the

member. The concerns of the Membership Committee will be explained and the member will be asked to resign from the SSAC.

2. The member may ask for a review of the decision with the Membership Committee. The review meeting will be conducted as follows:
 - a. The review meeting will be conducted via teleconference at a mutually convenient time.
 - b. The SSAC Chair, the SSAC Vice Chair, the SSAC Board Liaison, and at least a quorum of voting membership committee members must be present during the review meeting with the member.
 - c. The Membership Committee will deliberate privately after the review meeting and conduct another vote, using the same process described above.
3. If the Membership Committee revises its decision to recommend membership renewal, then the procedure described above shall apply.
4. If the Membership Committee does not change its decision and decides not to recommend membership renewal, the decision will be referred to the SSAC Chair who will discuss the decision with the member. The member will be informed that they may object to the decision when it is reported to the SSAC.
5. The Director, SSAC Support, will send a message to the SSAC listing those members that the Membership Committee is not recommending for membership renewal, allowing at least one week for any SSAC member, including the member to whom the recommendation applies, to respond with an objection regarding one or more of the recommendations, which must include the grounds for each objection. The message will make it clear that if no objection is received then the member's term of membership will end on the last day of the current calendar year.

For those members for whom an objection is received from any SSAC member regarding any decision of the Membership Committee, the following procedure will apply:

1. If the objection is against a recommendation of non-renewal by the Membership Committee, the affected member must agree to a review of the Membership Committee decision by the SSAC. If the affected member does not agree to the review the decision of the Membership Committee shall be final.
2. If the objection is against a recommendation of renewal by the Membership Committee, the review by the SSAC must proceed.
3. The SSAC Chair shall moderate a review of the Membership Committee decision among the SSAC Membership.
4. The Membership Committee Chair is permitted to share with the SSAC the relevant substance of the Membership Committee's deliberations without attribution.
5. The SSAC Chair shall have the responsibility to identify and declare the SSAC consensus position of the review of the Membership Committee's decision.

6. The SSAC consensus position shall be final.

2.5.1 Annual Review Process Schedule

The SSAC seeks to submit its recommendations for consideration by the Board at its Annual General Meeting (AGM), the date of which varies each year. In addition, the SSAC seeks to submit the results of the annual review process to the SSAC at its Annual SSAC Workshop.

As of the date of this publication, ICANN's AGM is typically held around the month of October and the Annual SSAC Workshop is held around the month of September. This suggests that the Annual Review Process needs to complete by the end of August each year. The following schedule is provided as a guiding template for the Membership Committee to use to set its actual schedule each year.

Activities and Approximate Timeline:

January:

1. The Director, SSAC Support calls for volunteers to join the Membership Committee; a poll is conducted if there are more than five volunteers.
2. The Membership Committee reviews ICANN staff that are currently participating on the SSAC.

February-March:

1. SSAC Staff Support compiles a summary of member engagement for all members based on attendance records, work party participation, and participation in document production.
2. The Director, SSAC Support conducts an anonymous survey of members up for annual review. All SSAC members may respond to the following three questions for each member up for annual review.
 - a. How have you worked with this person in the SSAC?
 - b. Describe the person's interaction and participation in the SSAC.
 - c. How do you believe this person will contribute to the continued success of the SSAC?
3. The Director, SSAC Support prepares a member engagement report for all SSAC members. The member engagement report consists of the summary of member engagement and, for those members up for annual review, the anonymous survey results.

April:

1. The SSAC Chair shares with each member his or her individual engagement report.

May:

The Director, SSAC Support shares the member engagement report for members up for annual review with the Membership Committee.

June-July

1. The Membership Committee will conduct its annual review of members.
2. The Membership Committee will vote on the question of whether or not to offer another term of membership to each member up for annual review. The vote will be conducted as described above.

August:

1. The decision of whether or not to extend a term of membership to a member is shared by the SSAC Chair with the respective member.
2. The member may ask for a review of the decision with the Membership Committee. The review meeting will be conducted as described above.

September:

The Membership Committee at the Annual Workshop communicates the results of the annual review to the SSAC.

2.6 Protection of and Access to Information

On occasion SSAC members may need to access certain technical data or information that is commercially valuable and not generally known in its industry of principal use (collectively referred to as “Proprietary Information”) pursuant to the SSAC’s performance of its tasks. The following procedures provide guidance to SSAC members in the protection of, and access to, Proprietary Information.

2.6.1 Affirmation of Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure

The SSAC may need to take measures to protect Proprietary Information in order to perform its tasks. The following procedures are established to provide guidance to SSAC members in the protection of Proprietary Information:

1. SSAC members are expected to use reasonable care to hold in confidence and not disclose any Proprietary Information disclosed to them. Written information provided to SSAC members shall be considered Proprietary Information only if such information is clearly marked with an appropriate stamp or legend as Proprietary Information. Non-written information shall be considered Proprietary Information only if the discloser of such information informs the SSAC at the time of disclosure that the information being disclosed is of a proprietary nature. Such verbal disclosure should be explicitly noted in any documented record of the meeting to ensure that members not in attendance are aware that the information is proprietary. An SSAC member may not disclose Proprietary Information outside of the SSAC unless the member obtains explicit permission from the owner of the Proprietary Information. The Director, SSAC Support, will maintain a list of all non-members who receive information in this exception circumstance.
2. SSAC members shall have no obligation of confidentiality arising from their membership in SSAC with respect to information disclosed to them if such information is:

- a. at the time of disclosure, already known to the SSAC member;
 - b. at the time of disclosure, in the public domain or such information thereafter becomes a part of the public domain without a breach of this Affirmation of Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure (see paragraph 4 below); or
 - c. known to the SSAC at the time it is disclosed to them; or
 - d. independently developed by the SSAC; or
 - e. received by the SSAC from a third party who had a lawful right to disclose such information to it; or
 - f. allowed to be disclosed with the written approval of the disclosing party.
3. SSAC members may be requested to sign a non-disclosure agreement (NDA) in order to access information to perform a specific study, research, or other SSAC task. If they decline to sign such an agreement, they will also be declining participation in the task requiring the execution of the non-disclosure agreement. Declining to sign an NDA is understood to be an ordinary occurrence.
 4. A Formal Affirmation of Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure may be required of SSAC Members if requested by the disclosing party. (See Appendix F.)
 5. No formal Non-Disclosure Agreement (NDA) is required for membership in SSAC.
 6. A separate email distribution list may be established for a specific project or issue which includes only SSAC members who have signed an NDA applicable to that specific project or issue.

2.7 SSAC Member Services

ICANN provides services to support the SSAC, its members, and the production of its work products.

2.7.1 Wiki Workspace

ICANN provides and maintains a Wiki Workspace for the SSAC and the SSAC Administrative Committee. Access is controlled by an individually unique login and password. This access is terminated when a member leaves the SSAC. SSAC members should not distribute to non-members any information posted to the Wiki Workspace.

SSAC members may use the Wiki Workspace for reference or to post comments. The Director, SSAC Support, is responsible for keeping the material on the workspaces current, including posting meeting agendas and minutes, documents, and presentations.

2.7.2 SSAC Mailing Lists

The SSAC is supported by mailing lists hosted by ICANN. The main list is ssac@icann.org, to which all SSAC members and candidate members who have been approved by the SSAC but are waiting for approval by the ICANN Board are subscribed. Whereas teleconferences and in-person meetings provide for focused and structured discussions of issues before the SSAC, the

SSAC mailing list provides an open forum for any member to raise any issue of interest. Issues are proposed, discussed, and by consensus may be selected for addition to the SSAC agenda. The SSAC mailing list is used for SSAC announcements, distribution of publications especially during the draft phase, and summaries of SSAC meetings.

Additional mailing lists may be created for Committees and Work Parties as needed. Mailing lists may be established for special projects requiring control of Proprietary Information as described in 2.6 above.

ICANN maintains a permanent confidential archive of all messages distributed on SSAC mailing lists. ICANN technical staff and the Director, SSAC Support, maintain the lists and the archive. Although SSAC members do not have direct access to the lists or the archives, they may request that the Director, SSAC Support, make changes on their behalf. In addition, they may ask the Director, SSAC Support, to provide information from the archives. The request must contain the following information:

1. Date range the information was posted to the list; and
2. Key words and names associated with the posting(s).

The Director, SSAC Support, may ask for additional information if that which is included in the request is insufficient to identify the requested posting(s). At all times any confidentiality requirements associated with the information will be respected and enforced at the sole discretion of the Director, SSAC Support. This may result in the request for information being denied.

2.8 SSAC Roles

In addition to the obligations of an SSAC member, some members may wish to take on the additional responsibilities of an SSAC role as defined below.

2.8.1 Chair

The Chair of the SSAC is a volunteer position filled by an SSAC member, elected by the SSAC members, and appointed by the ICANN Board of Directors at the recommendation of the SSAC. The Chair is responsible for working with the SSAC Administrative Committee and SSAC members to suggest priorities, conducting all meetings and gatherings of the SSAC, and serving on the SSAC Administrative Committee. The Chair also represents the SSAC to the public. The Chair is elected to a three-year term of office that is renewable indefinitely. This term is not required to align with the elected member's membership term.

2.8.1.1 Chair Election

The SSAC seeks to submit its recommendation for consideration by the Board at its Annual General Meeting (AGM), the date of which varies each year.

The term of the SSAC Chair shall begin on the first day of the next year following the election and shall end on the last day of the year two-years hence. If an election is being held because the Chair is no longer able to complete the term, regardless of the reason for the vacancy, the term shall begin immediately upon selection by the SSAC and appointment by the Board and shall end on the last day of the year three-years hence, i.e., the length of the term shall be three years plus the remainder of the calendar year in which the term begins.

As of the date of this publication, ICANN's AGM is typically held around the end of the month of October. This suggests that the Chair election needs to complete by the end of September in the year the election is being held. The following schedule is provided as a guiding template for the SSAC Administrative Committee to use to set the actual schedule for an election when it is needed.

Activities and Approximate Timeline:

10 weeks before the AGM:

The Director, SSAC Support, sends a message to the SSAC list beginning a two-week nomination period and requesting nominations to be sent to the SSAC list. To accept the nomination the candidate must provide a written statement of interest. The current Chair may volunteer to serve another term. Self-nominations are permitted.

8 weeks before the AGM:

The Director, SSAC Support, sends the final slate of candidates to the SSAC list and begins a one-week period during which SSAC members may ask questions of the candidates.

7 weeks before the AGM:

If there is more than one candidate, the Director, SSAC Support, shall initiate a poll and allow one-week for the poll to complete, announcing the results to the SSAC immediately after the poll closes. A simple majority in favor of a particular candidate shall select that candidate as the Chair.

If there is a tie among two or more candidates with the most indications of support, the tie shall be addressed using the same guidelines for addressing a challenge to the results of the poll.

If there is only one candidate, the candidate is selected by acclamation.

6 weeks before the AGM:

The Director, SSAC Support, shall open a one-week period during which any SSAC member may challenge the results of the poll.

5 weeks before the AGM:

If necessary, one-week is provided for resolving any challenge to the results of the poll that may arise.

4 weeks before the AGM:

The Director, SSAC Support, prepares the Board Submission for the Board Liaison to send to the Board for consideration of the appointment of the Chair.

If the election encounters any issues and fails to complete in a timely manner, the current Chair shall remain in office until the issues can be resolved. Election issues that are not discussed in this document shall be resolved according to a consensus of the SSAC. The Director, SSAC Support, shall seek a volunteer or appoint a member from the SSAC who is not running for office to serve as the leader of all election issue discussions; the first choice for the volunteer shall be the current Chair if they are not running for office.

2.8.2 Vice-Chair

The Vice-Chair is a volunteer position elected by the SSAC members. The Vice-Chair substitutes for the Chair as needed, serves on the Administrative Committee of the SSAC, and serves as the Chair of the Membership Committee. The Vice Chair is elected to a three-year term of office that is renewable indefinitely. This term is not required to align with the elected member's membership term.

2.8.2.1 Vice Chair Election

The Vice Chair election is conducted according to the same procedure and schedule as the Chair election, with the exception that the ICANN Board is not notified. The election is not required to be conducted simultaneously with the Chair election nor is the term of the Vice Chair required to align with the term of the Chair.

2.8.3 SSAC Outward Liaisons

There are three outward liaisons in the SSAC. These are 1) the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors; 2) the SSAC Liaison to the Root Server System Advisory Committee (RSSAC); and 3) the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Nominating Committee. The SSAC may choose to elect an outward liaison to other ICANN Advisory Committees and Supporting Organizations, at the discretion of a majority of SSAC members and with the agreement of the receiving Advisory Committee or Supporting Organization. Unless otherwise specified and agreed to by the SSAC, all outward liaisons are required to be SSAC members.

2.8.3.1 SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors

The ICANN Bylaws require that SSAC nominate a representative to serve as a non-voting liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors, with responsibilities and obligations as defined by the Bylaws.⁹ SSAC members elect the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors for a three-year term that may be renewed indefinitely. However, the Liaison serves on the Board for a one-year term. The period of the appointment is from the conclusion of an ICANN AGM to the conclusion of the following AGM. Thus, the SSAC must submit to the Board each year its Liaison during that member's three-year SSAC term as Liaison.

⁹ See ICANN Bylaws, Article 7, Section 7.9. (Non-Voting Liaisons) at <https://www.icann.org/en/system/files/files/adopted-bylaws-27may16-en.pdf>.

The following are the duties and responsibilities of the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors:

- Report regularly to the ICANN Board of Directors on the SSAC's activities;
- Represent the SSAC at all ICANN Board of Directors' functions as required by the Board;
- Deliver all SSAC work products to the ICANN Board of Directors;
- Serve on the SSAC Administrative Committee;
- Provide brief reports to the SSAC Members on relevant issues considered by the Board, as Board confidentiality permits.

2.8.3.2 SSAC Liaison to the RSSAC

SSAC Members may choose to elect a Liaison to the RSSAC for a three-year term that may be renewed indefinitely.

The following are the duties and responsibilities of the SSAC Liaison to the RSSAC:

- The SSAC Liaison should have some interest in and knowledge of one or more of the areas in which the interests of the SSAC and the RSSAC overlap, including DNSSEC deployment and root server scalability and stability;
- The SSAC Liaison should be able to attend all meetings and functions of the RSSAC as required by the RSSAC;
- Provide brief reports to the SSAC Members on relevant issues considered by the RSSAC, as RSSAC confidentiality permits.

2.8.3.3 SSAC Non-Voting Liaison to the ICANN Nominating Committee

Under the ICANN By Laws, the SSAC is required to elect a non-voting liaison to serve on the ICANN Nominating Committee. ICANN's Nominating Committee invites Statements of Interest and candidate recommendations from the Internet community for key leadership positions to fulfill ICANN's technical and policy coordination role. The SSAC member is expected to attend and participate in the face-to-face meetings of the ICANN Nominating Committee. Each year the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors receives an invitation from the Chair of the ICANN Nominating Committee for the SSAC to elect one of its members to serve on the ICANN Nominating Committee for one year.

The following are the duties and responsibilities of the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Nominating Committee:

- Attend all ICANN Nominating Committee meetings and functions; and
- Provide brief reports to the SSAC Members on relevant issues considered by the Nominating Committee, as Nominating Committee confidentiality permits.

2.8.3.4 SSAC Outward Liaison Election

The election of an Outward Liaison is conducted according to the same procedure and schedule as the Chair election with the following changes:

- The election is not required to be conducted simultaneously with the Chair election nor is the term of the Outward Liaison required to align with the term of the Chair.
- The start or end of the schedule may be dictated by the requirements of the receiving organization.
- The ICANN Board is not notified of the election, except in the case of the SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors.
- The Chair of the SSAC notifies the receiving organization of the elected Outward Liaison according to a procedure specified by them.

2.8.4 SSAC Inward Liaisons

Various ICANN Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees and related panels and entities (“groups”) have asked to send liaisons to the SSAC. The SSAC generally welcomes inward liaisons but requires that an inward liaison be a full-fledged member of the SSAC. These inward liaisons represent the community of their appointing group in a general sense, not as an authority speaking on their behalf. Inward liaisons provide information about the community and offer insight and context as needed to SSAC activities. Similarly, inward liaisons will learn about the SSAC and its activities by participation in SSAC and, within the constraints of confidentiality, may mention or comment on these activities to their appointing groups. Inward liaisons may be asked to facilitate communication with those groups.

The groups with which the SSAC chooses to liaise are selected by the SSAC. Groups are selected based on an identified need to maintain a cooperative relationship. An inward liaison to the SSAC participates as a full member of the SSAC. An inward liaison participates in the other group according to the mutual agreement of both groups when the liaison relationship is established. Unless otherwise established by the mutual agreement of the SSAC and the other group, inward liaisons are expected to affirm their commitment to the obligations of SSAC membership as previously specified.

2.8.5 ICANN Support Staff

ICANN provides Support Staff for the SSAC. The staff are employees of ICANN and report to ICANN. SSAC members who have concerns or questions about the SSAC Support Staff should bring them to the attention of the SSAC Chair for resolution.

2.8.5.1 Responsibilities

The responsibilities of the Support Staff with respect to the SSAC include the following:

- Participation in SSAC discussions;

- Drafting of publications on matters under consideration by the SSAC;
- Researching the status of the issues of concern before the committee, including the gathering of relevant material;
- Assisting the Director, SSAC Support, as needed; and
- Other duties as assigned by the Chair.

The Support Staff serve on the SSAC Administrative Committee.

2.8.5.2 Director, SSAC Support

The responsibilities of the Director, SSAC Support, with respect to the SSAC, include the following:

- Managing the SSAC budget requests;
- Managing the SSAC work plans and activity reports;
- Managing the agenda and priorities of the Committee's activities;
- Preparing and posting minutes of all meetings;
- Preparing periodic reports of the SSAC Administrative Committee meetings for the SSAC Chair to send to the SSAC;
- Managing the logistics of all SSAC meetings and gatherings, including announcements, invitations to speakers, and developing programs;
- Managing the Chair's SSAC and DNSSEC meeting schedules at ICANN meetings;
- Preparing SSAC work products, arranging for submission to the ICANN Board of Directors and selected affected parties, including drafting the accompanying transmittal letters, publishing work products to the SSAC web site, and tracking work products after publication; and
- Other duties as assigned by the Chair.

The Director, SSAC Support, serves on the SSAC Administrative Committee.

2.8.6 Invited Guests

The SSAC may choose by consensus to invite individuals to participate as full members when they have expertise or experience desired by the SSAC, e.g., during the development of a specific work product. Unless otherwise established by the mutual agreement of the SSAC and the invited guest, he or she is expected to affirm their commitment to the obligations of membership as previously specified. At the completion of the activity the membership of the Invited Guests ends. Invited Guests may submit a request to be considered for membership in SSAC.

SSAC member candidates whom the ICANN Board of Directors has not yet appointed to the SSAC, or whose terms have not yet commenced, may serve as Invited Guests.

3. SSAC Publication Procedures

The following is a description of the procedures for SSAC publications. Table 1 provides a general guide.

3.1 Proposing, Selecting, and Planning a Work Product

The SSAC operates as a semi-autonomous body of technical experts producing timely and relevant documentation on topics for the Internet community. The ICANN Board of Directors may assign topics to the SSAC or requests to review issues may come from various sources. SSAC work products are published on the SSAC web site unless they are deemed to be confidential.

The Director, SSAC Support, tracks requests or topics that have come before the SSAC, either in email archives or in the notes from discussions at SSAC Administrative Committee meetings that are maintained on the Wiki Workspace. The Director, SSAC Support, will endeavor to maintain a high degree of accuracy with respect to the tracking of substantive issues. The Director, SSAC Support, will include in the notes from the meetings of the SSAC Administrative Committee any requests of topics or issues for the SSAC to consider. Those topics that are not addressed in a meeting may be recorded in discussions on the SSAC list.

3.1.1 Request from the ICANN Board of Directors or Other ICANN Advisory Committees or Supporting Organizations

The ICANN Board of Directors, ACs, and SOs may request that the SSAC review a specific topic or issue. These requests may be in the form of an informal request from a Board, AC, or SO member to the SSAC Chair, or may be in the form of a formal motion or resolution approved by the Board, AC, or SO. The SSAC Chair is responsible for presenting these requests to the SSAC and ensuring that they receive a timely response. The Director, SSAC Support, shall maintain all correspondence relating to these requests on the SSAC Wiki Workspaces and shall publish all formal responses from the SSAC on the public SSAC web site.

3.1.2 Requests from ICANN Staff

The ICANN Staff may request that the SSAC review issues of interest to the Staff. These requests are submitted to the Director, SSAC Support, or to the Senior Security Technologist, who forwards the request to the SSAC Administrative Committee for consideration. The SSAC Administrative Committee considers whether the request warrants a formal or informal response from the SSAC or whether an SSAC Support staff response is appropriate. Discussions of these requests and decisions concerning how to handle them will be captured in the notes on the SSAC Wiki Workspace and reported to the SSAC. If the request warrants a response from the SSAC, the SSAC Chair is responsible for presenting the request to the SSAC and ensuring its timely completion. The Director, SSAC Support, shall maintain all correspondence relating to these requests on the SSAC Wiki Workspace and shall publish all formal responses from the SSAC on the public SSAC web site.

3.1.3 Self Tasking

Any SSAC member may propose an issue for review by the SSAC. The issue, its description, and the reason why it is appropriate for SSAC to review are posted to the SSAC mailing list for discussion. Since the mailing list is open to all SSAC members, there is no formal acknowledgment or response to an issue suggestion. However, the discussion of the request and the response are published on the SSAC Wiki Workspace.

3.2 Study and Primary Work

3.2.1 Establishing a Work Party

Once the SSAC has agreed to study a selected topic or issue, the SSAC Administrative Committee invites SSAC members to participate in a Work Party to study the topic or issue in one of the following roles: as either a leader, contributor, or reviewer. All SSAC members are welcome to participate in any Work Party although members with particular skills and experience related to the issue are particularly encouraged to participate. The SSAC members participating in the Work Party establish its purpose and goals, select its leader, and establish the milestones and schedule. An SSAC Staff Support member provides support to the Work Party, assists the members in the development of documentation, and provides regular updates to the SSAC Administrative Committee and the SSAC. Staff also will establish a wiki for the Work Party where the latest documents and minutes, including attendance, are posted. The Work Party membership may evolve and will cease its work when the issue it is formed to address is completed.

3.2.2 Work Party Leader Obligations

Work Party leaders are expected to further the work of the group by managing the Work Party's meetings, assigning tasks, participating in the development of the work product, and providing monthly reports on progress to the SSAC Administrative Committee. Work Party leaders should seek advice from the SSAC Administrative Committee if the work is languishing either through lack of volunteer participation, lack of staff support, or for any other reason. As noted in Section 2 above, Work Party leaders may also be asked by the Membership Committee to provide information concerning a member's level of participation. If a Work Party leader cannot fulfill the duties outlined above, the SSAC Administrative Committee may decide to ask a Work Party leader to step down and ask another SSAC member to accept the position.

3.2.3 Developing an Initial Draft Work Product

The Work Party will develop, via teleconference and on the list, an initial draft of a work product. SSAC Support Staff may assist in this process by producing a Concept Paper (without recommendations or findings) for the Work Party to consider. This may involve conducting research and consulting with experts outside of ICANN. The Work Party also may consult with members of the ICANN community affected by the issue under study. (See 3.2.3 below.) In the course of its study, the Work Party may need to access sensitive or proprietary information in

order to do its work. The following rules apply to access to information:

- The SSAC may request information from ICANN, an ICANN SO or AC, an ICANN community member, or any party who may have information relevant to an SSAC work product; and
- If access to information is denied, a note that access was denied may be included in the applicable report or other work product.

For access to ICANN information and systems:¹⁰

- The SSAC will seek access to structural and operational plans, implementations, and operational experience as needed; and
- Requests will be forwarded to the ICANN CEO and may be referred to the ICANN Board of Directors for disposition.

For access to information and systems of entities outside of ICANN:

- The Work Party will make its request in the form of a letter to the SSAC Chair;
- The SSAC Chair will make a determination whether to make such formal requests when asked to do so by a Work Party leader;
- SSAC will seek access to structural and operational plans, implementations, and operational experience as needed;
- Requests will be forwarded to the appropriate point of contact;
- SSAC will not disclose its sources unless they give permission; and
- SSAC members are prepared to enter into NDAs as requested in order to access information.

It is important to note that if the Work Party determines that specific entities must be named in a work product in order to enhance the findings and recommendations, the work product will only include names where there are supporting facts. Moreover, for each naming instance the work product will include a persistent URL and a recognized source.

The Work Party will meet via teleconference or face-to-face, and/or conduct discussions on the list, until the framework for an initial draft work product is produced. At this point, the Work Party leader may decide to author the initial draft work product or may ask if another member of the Work Party wishes to assume the task. Once this role is defined, the work product author will produce an initial draft work product, with assistance from SSAC Staff Support as appropriate. The Work Party members will review the initial draft work product and suggest edits as necessary. When the Work Party agrees that the initial draft work product is complete, it will circulate it to the SSAC for consideration and comment. Once the SSAC has commented on the initial draft work product, the staff supporting the Work Party will incorporate the changes and

¹⁰ In accordance with ICANN's documentary information and disclosure policy. See <http://www.icann.org/en/transparency/didp-en.htm>.

send the revised initial draft work product to the SSAC for consideration and approval. Staff will ask for comments from SSAC members to be submitted within 1 week.

3.2.4 Preliminary Review

Once the SSAC has approved an initial draft work product, the next step is to engage affected parties in the ICANN community in a preliminary review if the Work Party deems it necessary to do so. For example, if the preliminary findings and recommendations in the initial draft work product could affect registrars, then the Work Party may engage the Registrar Stakeholder Group. Similarly, if the findings or recommendations in the initial draft work product could affect root server operators, the Work Party may engage the RSSAC. The following are guidelines for engaging the ICANN community in a preliminary review of the initial draft work product:

1. In consultation with the SSAC, the Work Party determines which parties in the ICANN community could be affected by the findings and recommendations in the initial draft work product;
2. The Work Party leader alerts the SSAC Chair concerning which parties could be affected;
3. The Work Party leader sends the initial draft work product to the chairs of the affected ICANN organizations (e.g., the Chair of the Registrar Stakeholder Group or the Chair of the RSSAC) to circulate to their members and asks for a response within four weeks;
4. During this period, the Work Party leader, in coordination with the SSAC Administrative Committee, may decide that it is beneficial to post the draft work product for a period of public comment to solicit input from the community;
5. After two weeks, the Work Party leader sends a reminder to the Chairs of the affected parties requesting their response within two weeks;
6. If no response is received after four weeks, the Director, SSAC Support sends a message asking whether a response is forthcoming and grants one additional week for a response, if needed;
7. The Work Party leader or the staff supporting the Work Party incorporates the responses into the initial draft work product and circulates the revised document to the Work Party for review; and
8. The Work Party discusses the revisions either on the list or in a meeting and suggests further revisions, if necessary, for the Work Party leader or staff support to incorporate into a revised draft work product.

3.3 Developing Final Drafts, and Previewing Recommendations

3.3.1 Developing Final Drafts

The next step is for the Work Party support staff to circulate the revised draft work product to the SSAC for review, discussion, and development of a final draft document. The following are

guidelines for developing a final draft work product:

1. The Work Party support staff circulates the revised draft work product to SSAC members via the SSAC list for a 48-hour review;
2. The support staff collects and reviews comments from SSAC members and either accommodates them directly or starts a discussion thread to resolve the comment;
3. When the Work Party has considered and accommodated all SSAC comments, the support staff re-circulates the final draft work product to the SSAC via the list;
4. If a final draft work product cannot be developed, work on the product is halted and the Director, SSAC Support, creates a note on the SSAC and SSAC Administrative Committee Wiki Workspace indicating that the document has been abandoned;
5. If a final draft work product is developed, the support staff incorporates the final comments and provides the final work product to the Director, SSAC Support, for formatting and numbering; and
6. If an SSAC member wishes to object to the work product or asks to withdraw from consideration of the work product for any reason, the Work Party leader or staff support will ask if the member wishes to provide a statement explaining their dissent or withdrawal (see Section 2.1.2 above), or to be listed in the final document under the section for dissents or withdrawals.

3.3.2 Review by ICANN Legal Staff

Once SSAC consensus has been reached and a work product is finalized, the SSAC Chair may send the document to ICANN Legal Staff for review. The work product author reviews any suggested edits that may be received from ICANN Legal Staff and reviews them with the SSAC to determine the appropriate disposition.

3.3.3 Previewing Recommendations

The Work Party or other interested SSAC members may recommend previewing proposed recommendations to affected ICANN parties. The following are guidelines for sending the final work product to the affected ICANN parties:

1. The Work Party determines which parties in the ICANN community could be affected by the findings and recommendations in the final work product;
2. The Work Party leader alerts the SSAC Chair concerning which parties could be affected;
3. The SSAC Chair sends a message with the final work product to the chairs of the affected ICANN organizations to alert them to the fact that the SSAC will shortly publish the document and requests a response within two weeks;
4. The SSAC Chair also may decide that it is beneficial to post the draft work product for a period of public comment to solicit input from the community;

5. The Work Party leader addresses any questions or concerns, if any, from the affected parties and consults with them to determine whether these require changes to the final work product; and
6. If the SSAC determines that the questions or concerns of the affected parties may require changes to the final work product, the Work Party leader or staff support incorporates the changes, with assistance from SSAC Support Staff as appropriate.

3.4 Publication, Promulgation, and Publicizing

The Director, SSAC Support is responsible for the production of all SSAC publications. This is to ensure that the publication has followed the SSAC process (i.e., it has been reviewed by the SSAC and is appropriately archived) and is consistent with the quality of publications produced by the SSAC. The Director, SSAC Support manages the list of indices and document version numbers. A work product is assigned an index when SSAC consensus has been reached and the SSAC agrees to publish the work product.

Work product authors create and develop work products in a popular word processing program, selected by the author. An essential requirement of the program is the ability to create portable document format (PDF) documents to ensure that all SSAC members can access the document regardless of their computing platforms. The original word processing program format is often included because it facilitates recording comments that can be more easily returned to the author(s) or editor(s). When there are no further changes to a final work product and it is ready to be published, the Director, SSAC Support will convert the document to PDF.

The Director, SSAC Support may produce an executive summary, depending on the length of the work product, which is available separately from the published work product when posted on the SSAC web site. The executive summary should include an abstract of the work and in particular, should highlight major findings and recommendations. The Director, SSAC Support will ask the Senior Security Technologist to review the executive summary prior to publication and seek the concurrence of the work product author. The following is the procedure for submitting an SSAC work product for publication:

1. The Director, SSAC Support, produces a draft Submission Cover Letter and sends it to the SSAC Chair and SSAC Liaison for review; (See example in Appendix I.)
2. The SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors formally submits an SSAC publication via email along with the Submission Cover Letter to the ICANN Board of Directors 48 hours prior to publication;
3. After 48 hours, the Director, SSAC Support sends the document along with the executive summary (if there is one) in PDF to the ICANN Web Administrator with a request for posting to the SSAC web site and to the SSAC Discussion Space;
4. The SSAC Chair sends a letter along with the final work product to the affected ICANN parties notifying them that the work product has been published;
5. The Director, SSAC Support consults with the SSAC Administrative Committee to determine whether the document should be translated and into what languages;

6. The Director, SSAC Support sends the PDF to the Translation Department requesting translation according to ICANN internal policy and procedures;
7. The Director, SSAC Support sends the link to the published work product to the Director, Policy Communications/Information Services and asks him to initiate the communications plan; and
8. The Director, SSAC Support, works with the SSAC Administrative Committee to schedule subsequent presentations or directed distributions.

3.5 Tracking, Review, and Follow-Up

A goal of the SSAC is to ensure that its work products result in specific actions whenever possible. In order to measure progress towards this goal, the SSAC will track any effects of each recommendation. Tracking may include a determination of a metric or series of metrics and may include a survey at the end of each work product. The SSAC will report progress towards its goals in an annual report and the Director, SSAC Support shall track any specific outcomes that are identified in a chart on the SSAC web page. The SSAC also may organize public sessions to present and discuss the document. These may be coordinated with ICANN meetings or as teleconferences or webinars with the ICANN community.

3.5.1 Work Product Numbering

All public SSAC work products are assigned a unique number in a monotonically increasing sequence. This number always appears on the cover or title page of the published work product. All confidential SSAC publications are assigned a unique number in a monotonically increasing sequence that is distinct from the sequence used for public work products. This number is used for internal tracking and never appears on the publication itself. Once a work product has been published, either publicly or confidentially, it is referred to as a publication. A publication's number does not change during its lifetime.

A version number is also specified for each publication and it always appears on the cover or title page of a publication. This number starts at "1" the first time a publication is released to the public, in the case of a public publication, or to the requester, in the case of a private publication. It is incremented by 1 each time the document is revised and released.¹¹

¹¹The publication of certain SSAC documents antedates the version number requirement. SSAC documents that do not have a version number should be assumed to be version 1.0.

3.6 Types of Publications

3.6.1 Reports

Reports analyze and provide detailed reviews of an issue. The issue is thoroughly researched and described with relevant references available for further study. When a report is published depending on its length and complexity it may include an executive summary that is suitable for broad community understanding. The main body of the document includes detail suitable for someone who works regularly within the context of the issue. In certain circumstances, background material, case studies, and the results of data analysis are included in the body of the work. Findings and recommendations are organized according to the communities to which they are most applicable. Additional data and complementary informational material may be appended to the document.

3.6.2 Comments

Comments are prepared in response to explicit questions posed to or requests made to the SSAC, e.g. when the ICANN Board of Directors asks the SSAC for an opinion. Comments may be brief or long, depending on the issue and the extent to which the SSAC studies it. In some cases, a comment may take the form of a cover letter and an accompanying “marked up” document, which may be delivered via email or using any other means acceptable to both the requester and the SSAC.

3.6.3 Advisories

Advisories are often published in response to a security event or incident, where timely notification to the community is a priority concern. Advisories typically range in length from relatively short (two pages) to medium (six to eight pages), although there is no limit. They are focused, narrowly scoped, and serve to present an issue and describe conclusions or findings based on the facts, and may present recommendations regarding the issue. The recommendations may be topics for future study or work, requests to parties of an issue to change their behavior, or advice to parties of an issue on how to avoid its negative consequences. The SSAC may also use an advisory to alert the community to an issue in a timely fashion and to announce that a more detailed and thorough review of the issue will be forthcoming.

3.6.4 Comments to the ICANN Public Forum

The SSAC may decide to post a brief comment in response to a notice posted in ICANN’s Public Comment forum. The following procedure will apply for consideration and production of an SSAC posting to the ICANN Public Comment forum:

1. The Director, SSAC Support and the Senior Security Technologist review upcoming items to be posted on ICANN Public Comment forum to determine whether they relate to the SSAC’s current or previous activities;
2. For those items that relate to the SSAC’s activities, the Senior Security Technologist and/or

Senior Technology Analyst produce a recommendation concerning a possible draft comment for the SSAC to consider;

3. The SSAC considers the draft comment, determines whether or not it is relevant for consideration by the SSAC, and if it proposes revisions to the recommendation (if necessary);
4. The Director, SSAC Support sends the final draft comment to the SSAC for consideration, requesting response within one week, and incorporates changes as necessary; and
5. If the SSAC agrees to post the comment, the Director, SSAC Support, posts the response to the ICANN Public Comment forum; if not, the action is terminated and the Director, SSAC Support, indicates the status in the tracking spreadsheet and in the notes of the SSAC Administrative Committee Wiki Workspaces. In addition, the comment is given a publication number and published on the SSAC web site with other publications.

4. SSAC Work Plan and Activity Reporting

The SSAC produces public reports detailing its planned and completed activities that it presents at ICANN meetings. The Director, SSAC Support, drafts the reports, usually in the form of a slide presentation, for review by the SSAC Administrative Committee and the SSAC.

The SSAC also produces private internal SSAC reports describing the main points of discussion and outcomes from the SSAC public and private meetings held at ICANN meetings. These include a summary of the main points and outcomes from each meeting.

5. SSAC Meetings

The SSAC hosts both private and public meetings. Private meetings are used to conduct the work of the SSAC while public meetings are used both to present the work of the SSAC and to engage the community.

There are three types of private meetings: Administrative Committee meetings, SSAC closed meetings (both at ICANN meetings, at other venues, and via teleconference), and Work Party meetings. The Administrative Committee meets several times per month to manage the work of the SSAC. Work Parties. The SSAC meets to review work products and discuss its proposed, planned, and in-progress activities. Unless a meeting is held at an ICANN meeting or at an SSAC Workshop, except in the case of the Administrative Committee, all meetings are held via teleconference. In-person meetings also generally have teleconference access.

The SSAC hosts both regular public meetings and special public meetings on an as needed basis. Its regular public meeting is held during the week of each ICANN meeting and serves both to present the work of SSAC to the community and to provide a means for the community to interact with SSAC. Special public meetings are topic based and are conducted on an as needed basis. SSAC may elect to hold multiple public meetings when the SSAC is studying a topic of particular interest over a long period of time.

5.1 Administrative Committee Meetings

The members of the Administrative Committee meet several times per month via teleconference or in person. Work Party leaders and SSAC members may be invited to attend the Administrative Committee meetings to assist the Administrative Committee as needed. Any SSAC member may attend any Administrative Committee meeting except when circumstances may require the Administrative Committee to restrict attendance, at its sole discretion. The purpose of the Administrative Committee meetings is to:

- Review the status of all SSAC works-in-progress;
- Suggest topics for SSAC consideration for SSAC meetings;
- Plan for SSAC open and closed meetings at ICANN meetings; and
- Consider other business as may come before the SSAC.

The Director, SSAC Support manages these meetings as follows:

1. At least 48 hours prior to each meeting sends an email to the Administrative Committee with a draft agenda and the teleconference information;
2. Takes notes during the meeting and posts them to the Administrative Committee's Wiki Workspace;
3. After each meeting sends an email to the Administrative Committee listing the action items from the meeting and updates the chart of open activities;
4. Maintains the calendar of SSAC and Administrative Committee meetings.

5.2 SSAC Internal Meetings

SSAC meetings are closed to the public (except for public meetings held at ICANN meetings) but open to all SSAC members. The SSAC meets periodically via teleconference with a supporting remote access tool when an issue or issues are identified for discussion. In-person meetings are scheduled when a reasonable number of SSAC members are present at other meeting venues. The purpose of these meetings is to discuss in detail issues before the SSAC and through consensus determine an appropriate action and publication of that action. SSAC teleconference information is confidential and is maintained and distributed by the Director, SSAC Support. To help develop the program for internal meetings at ICANN meetings the Director, SSAC Support, will call for volunteers to form an SSAC Meeting Planning Work Party.

The Director, SSAC Support manages these meetings as follows:

1. At least one week prior to each meeting sends an email to the SSAC with a draft agenda and the teleconference information;
2. Takes notes during the meeting in the Adobe Connect chat room and posts them to the SSAC's Wiki Workspaces;

3. Produces a formal private SSAC document detailing the meeting attendees, action items, and notes;
4. After each meeting sends an email to the SSAC including the meeting notes as described in (3); and
5. Maintains the calendar of SSAC and Administrative Committee meetings.

5.3 SSAC Public Meetings at ICANN Meetings

The SSAC produces publications in part for the broad Internet community. In support of this community the SSAC holds public meetings for two principal purposes:

- To report to the community on its activities and other significant issues; and
- To receive from the community questions, comments, and suggestions.

These meetings are held as an integral part of the regular ICANN meetings and supported by real-time transcription (when resources allow) and streaming of the audio. The following is the procedure for planning SSAC Open meetings:

1. At least three weeks before the next ICANN meeting the Administrative Committee will plan the agenda. The agenda may consist of reports on ongoing SSAC activities, including presentations from SSAC members and others from the ICANN community;
2. Two weeks before the next ICANN meeting the Administrative Committee will circulate the draft agenda to the SSAC and request comments;
3. One week before the next ICANN meeting the Director, SSAC Support will:
 - a. Begin to gather any presentations;
 - b. Post the agenda of the SSAC public meeting; and
 - c. Circulate the agenda, presentations, and logistical information to SSAC members, and will submit the presentations to the ICANN Web Administration staff for posting on the ICANN meeting web site;
4. During the SSAC Open Meeting the Director, SSAC Support will run the meeting, including running through the slides, managing the teleconference, and generally ensuring that all runs smoothly; and
5. At the end of the ICANN meeting the Director, SSAC Support sends a draft report of all SSAC meetings and activities taking place during the ICANN meeting to the Administrative Committee to review and after incorporating changes sends the report to the SSAC.

5.4 SSAC Workshop

The SSAC held its first in-person Workshop outside of an ICANN or IETF meeting in October 2009. The event was scheduled over one and a half days (beginning with a dinner the evening before the first meeting day). During the meeting there was consensus that such workshops are essential to planning the production of SSAC's work products. The workshops have been scheduled annually since the first meeting.

To schedule the workshop, in January of each year the Director, SSAC Support will send a doodle poll to SSAC members with a range of possible dates asking for each member's availability.

After receiving the response from the SSAC members and setting the date for the workshop, the SSAC Administrative Committee will invite SSAC members to form an SSAC Workshop Planning Work Party, which will:

1. Develop a draft program;
2. Present the draft program to the SSAC members for consideration, requesting a response within two weeks;
3. Incorporate SSAC comments into the program;
4. Finalize the program; and
5. Invite speakers to provide presentations.

The following is the procedure for the Director, SSAC Support, to plan the workshop:

1. Consult with ICANN Meetings Department staff on venue and off-site dinner locations;
2. Inspect venues (if local);
3. Negotiate contracts with assistance from ICANN Meetings Department staff and ensure that pricing is within the SSAC budget;
4. Obtain contract approval from ICANN Legal staff and Finance officers;
5. Work with venue personnel to determine menus, accommodations, room reservations, and audio visual equipment;
6. Obtain presentations;
7. Provide SSAC members with the necessary forms for collecting receipts and filing expense reports;
8. Compile a list of attendees and ensure that all SSAC members have indicated whether or not they can attend;
9. Run the meeting, including managing all logistics, presentations, and related activities;
10. Request expense reimbursement forms from the SSAC members in attendance with receipts after the meeting;
11. Post transcripts and presentations on the SSAC wiki within one week of the meeting;

12. Submit reimbursement forms and receipts to ICANN Accounting and ensure payments are received;
13. Summarize the main points of the discussions within one month of the meeting for review and approval of the Administrative Committee;
14. Send to the SSAC the main points of the discussion and a request for feedback on areas for improvement; and
15. Provide a compilation of expenses to ICANN Finance.

5.6 Special Meetings

From time-to-time the SSAC may choose to sponsor a special meeting to serve a specific purpose or to support the discussion of a particular issue. These meetings are held as needed, may be face-to-face or by teleconference or webinar, and are announced and reported accordingly.

For example, prior to the publication of SAC006, *Redirection in the COM and NET Domains*, the SSAC sponsored two public meetings. The issue on the table was getting a great deal of public attention and it was necessary to create a forum in which the various opinions and relevant circumstances could be heard and discussed.

As a further example, after release of SAC054, *Domain Name Registration Data Model*, a webinar was scheduled at the request of the ALAC and the SSAC Vice Chair to provide an information briefing to and accept feedback from the At-Large Community.

APPENDIX A: SSAC HISTORY

[This is excerpted from SAC039 SSAC Review of SSAC and reprinted here in the voice of Steve Crocker, who was selected as the first chair of SSAC.]

SSAC was activated in early 2002. It was formed in the aftermath of 9/11, a period when every organization asked itself what it should be doing about security. ICANN held a symposium on security in Marina del Rey in November 2001. The report from that symposium is reprinted as SAC 002.¹² The decision to form SSAC apparently followed that meeting. In short order, members were recruited, a charter drafted and the Committee was started. I was recruited to chair the Committee after its members had been recruited, and we began organized discussions in early 2002.

Our first discussions centered on DNS configuration issues, e.g. how many DNS operations were broken and to what degree? We also began discussion of DNSSEC.

Our early discussions were ad hoc, and we lacked any formal support. After a while, I asked ICANN to support an executive director and I recruited Jim Galvin. By mid 2003 we were holding regular calls and eking out reports. In September 2003, VeriSign released its SiteFinder service. SSAC quickly was actively involved in discussions and meetings, with two public meetings in October 2003 that included multiple presentations and full transcripts. However, preparation of a formal report exceeded our capacity for several months. We eventually got support to hire a writer, Amy Friedlander, and produced SAC 006,¹³ “Redirection in the COM and NET Domains,” 9 July 2004.

Taking a lesson from that experience, we created the position of “SSAC Fellow” and recruited Dave Piscitello to be a paid staff person to write technical reports on behalf of the Committee. The original plan was to bring in a senior person for a year or so, more or less along the lines of the fellowships sponsored by the IEEE¹⁴ and other organizations to bring technically qualified people to work in various parts of the U.S. government for a year or so. Dave worked out spectacularly well, and we dispensed with the idea of forcing a rotation every year. (Indeed, the term “Fellow” turns out to be ambiguous, as it is also used in a much different senses, including ICANN Fellows who are provided travel support for participation in ICANN meetings.¹⁵)

Since then, our production of documents has increased measurably. From our inception through 2005 we had produced seven reports. In 2006, we produced eight reports, more than doubling our lifetime total. We produced another eight in 2007 and a full dozen in 2008.

¹²See <https://www.icann.org/en/groups/ssac/documents/sac-002-en.htm>.

¹³See <http://www.icann.org/committees/security/ssac-report-09jul04.pdf>.

¹⁴See <http://www.ieeeusa.org/policy/GOVFEL/state.asp>.

¹⁵See <http://www.icann.org/en/fellowships/>.

When SSAC was first in operation, we had conference calls once a week. Participation was variable. Some members participated regularly; others only rarely. After a while, I started to have weekly calls with Jim, Dave and Ray Plzak who had volunteered to become vice chair, and we used these calls to organize and pursue the agenda for the Committee. Our weekly calls with the whole Committee became a bit intermittent, and we revised our schedule to have monthly calls as needed, with each call focused on a specific topic and planned in advance.

The level of participation has continued to be a concern. Dave's yeoman efforts preparing reports has perhaps engendered a relaxed posture from much of the rest of the Committee. In principle, our Reports, Comments and Advisories reflect the consensus of the Committee. In practice, only a small fraction of the Committee is actively involved in each effort. One of the questions for us to consider is whether this is a problem, a positive feature, or just an incidental fact. From my point of view, it's necessary to get others to take leadership roles in our projects and we started forming small working teams, each with a designated leader and named participants. As I write this, I have to say we don't have enough data know whether this will work. More on this below.

Another piece of our history relates to DNSSEC. In our early days, we spent much of time discussing and promoting DNSSEC. Bruce Tonkin took me aside during the Tunis meeting in October 2003 and pointed out that our DNSSEC efforts were underpowered. He suggested there needed to be separate funding and put on its own track. I began exploring that possibility, and, rather fortuitously, the newly formed cyber security program within the recently formed U.S. Department of Homeland Security included DNSSEC as part of its initial portfolio. At the same time, the Swedish registry, .SE, pushed forward with its very substantial effort to support DNSSEC, and multiple other implementation efforts took place, particularly at NLnet Labs and Internet Systems Consortium. Within the ICANN arena, we initiated a separate track of DNSSEC "workshops" – these were really "sessions" or "symposia" – at each ICANN meeting which provided a forum for publicizing progress, bringing people together who were working on DNSSEC, and raising awareness across the ICANN community. The DNSSEC effort involves too many people and too many organizations for SSAC to take sole credit for the progress to date, but I think our efforts have helped the cause.

Looking at our history from a different dimension, it's useful to see what topics we have dealt with and where they fit into the larger picture. We have designated our documents as Reports, Advisories and Comments. Reports are our primary output, usually representing a few to several months of effort. Advisories are much shorter term efforts intended to give advice quickly. We're not organized to do this very well, so we don't have very many. Comments are responses to other documents, often but not exclusively ICANN planning documents. I went through our 38 documents to date, including three for 2009, one of which is not yet published but which is far enough along to include,¹⁶ and I assigned each to a "Topic." These assignments are my own and not necessarily the same as anyone else's, and they're definitely not official. Nonetheless, they give a useful picture of where we've spent our time and attention. Of our 38 documents, eight

¹⁶SAC 037 will be a report on IDN and Whois. For categorization purposes, I put it under the IDN topic, though it also applies to Whois.

address various issues of registration abuse and five more are focused on whois issues. The next highest topics are Redirection and DNSSEC, with four and three documents respectively. We also have three documents focused on IPv6 and root, and another two focused on just IPv6. The rest are spread thinly across other topics.

When we started, I had guessed we would be focused primarily on core DNS operational issues, e.g. configurations, lame delegations, deployment of DNSSEC. Instead, registration issues, e.g. hijacking, unintended consequences of released registration, whois listings, etc., have been our most common focus. Even though we gave extraordinary attention to the redirection issue (SiteFinder) in 2003, only occasionally did it reappear, and we have issued only four documents in total on this topic.

APPENDIX B: SSAC MEMBER DISCLOSURE OF INTERESTS

Definitions

Disclosure of Interests: A written statement made by an SSAC member that provides a declaration of personal, financial, business, or other relationships that might affect or reasonably be perceived to affect the SSAC member's judgment on any matters within the scope of SSAC.

Material Interest: A material interest is a substantial or potentially consequential interest that is generally, but not always, financial in nature.

Timeliness

Every SSAC member is required to provide a new or updated Declaration of Interests to the Director, SSAC Support, not less frequently than once a year, or whenever there is a material change, declaring and describing any specific interests, relationships, arrangements, or affiliations that might affect or reasonably be perceived to affect his or her judgment in the context of participation in SSAC. A completed Declaration of Interests, updated at least annually, is a requirement of membership in the SSAC.

At the beginning of each year the Director, SSAC Support, will send a notice to the SSAC list asking members to ensure that their Disclosures of Interests are up-to-date at the same time as members are asked to ensure that their bios are up-to-date. Members are expected to provide an updated Disclosure of Interests each calendar year, to be provided no later than 6 weeks from the member's annual review by the Membership Committee.

Disclosures of Interests will be posted along with SSAC member bios on the SSAC web page, and will therefore be public documents.

Content

SSAC members shall complete all sections of the Disclosure of Interests form as specified below:

1. Please identify your current employer(s) and position(s).
2. Please identify the type(s) of work performed at #1 above.
3. Please list any financial or other material relationship beyond de minimus stock ownership that you, your employer, or an immediate family member/significant other has with ICANN or with any individual, company, or other entity that to your knowledge has a current or planned financial or other material relationship with ICANN.
4. Is your participation as an SSAC member the subject of any arrangements or agreements between you and any other group, constituency, or person(s)? Please answer "yes" or "no." If the answer is "yes," please describe the arrangements or agreements and the name of the group, constituency, or person(s).

Failure to Comply

The Chair may suspend the participation of an SSAC member who fails to provide a Disclosure of Interests as required by this policy until the Disclosure of Interests is provided. If the failure to comply pertains to the Chair, the Vice-Chair shall execute this process.

APPENDIX C: SSAC NEW MEMBER BOARD SUBMISSION COVER LETTER



[insert date]

To: ICANN Board

From: The SSAC Chair

Via: The SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board

The purpose of this letter is to bring you up-to-date on proposed changes to the membership of the Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC) and to provide an explanation for the attached requests for Board actions. These changes are the result of the annual membership evaluation process instituted by the SSAC and completed by the SSAC Membership Committee in [insert date].

The SSAC Membership Committee considers new member candidates and makes its recommendations to the SSAC. It also evaluates SSAC members whose terms are ending with the calendar year. The Membership Committee is comprised of the SSAC Chair, the SSAC Vice Chair, the SSAC Board Liaison, and other SSAC member volunteers. This year the Membership Committee evaluated the following members whose terms are ending 31 December 20XX: [insert names]. The SSAC agreed to the Membership Committee's recommendation to reappoint all of the members listed above. Thus, the SSAC respectfully requests that the ICANN Board should reappoint the above-mentioned members to three-year terms

Also, on [insert date] [insert name] resigned from the SSAC. [insert name] was appointed to the SSAC on [insert date]. The SSAC requests that the Board joins the Committee in extending its thanks to [insert name] for [insert his or her] service to the SSAC and the Community.

In addition, the SSAC has agreed with the Membership Committee's recommendation to appoint two new members: [insert names]. The SSAC notes that [insert text about specific expertise of each new member]. Thus, the SSAC Membership Committee respectfully requests that the Board appoint [insert names] to the SSAC. Attached are their bios and statements of interest for your reference.

SSAC Operational Procedures Version 5.0

The SSAC welcomes comments from the Board concerning these requests.

[insert name], SSAC Chair

[insert attachment: biographical information]

APPENDIX D: ICANN BOARD SUBMISSION FORM FOR SSAC APPOINTMENT/REAPPOINTMENTS

ICANN BOARD SUBMISSION NO. [To be assigned by Secretary]

TITLE: SSAC Member Appointments

PROPOSED ACTION: For Board Consent Agenda

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

One of the recommendations arising out of the organizational review of the Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC) is for SSAC membership appointments to be for a term of three years renewable by the Board at the recommendation of the SSAC Chair indefinitely, and that the terms be staggered to allow for the terms of one-third of the SSAC members to expire at the end of every year. On [insert date] the ICANN Board approved Bylaws revisions that create three-year terms for SSAC members and assigned initial one-, two-, and three-year terms to all SSAC members. Each year the SSAC Membership Committee evaluates those members whose terms are ending in the calendar year, in this case 31 December 20XX. The Membership Committee submitted its recommendations for member reappointments to the SSAC, which approved the reappointments of the following SSAC members: [insert names].

SSAC RECOMMENDATION:

The Committee recommends the Board reappoint the SSAC members as identified in the proposed resolution.

PROPOSED RESOLUTIONS:

Whereas, Article XI, Section 2, Subsection 2 of the Bylaws governs the Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC).

Whereas, the Board, at Resolution 2010.08.05.07 approved Bylaws revisions that create three-year terms for SSAC members, require staggering of terms, and obligate the SSAC chair to recommend the reappointment of all current SSAC members to full or partial terms to implement the Bylaws revisions.

Whereas, the Board, at Resolution 2010.08.05.08 appointed SSAC members to terms of one, two, and three years beginning on 01 January 2011 and ending on 31 December 2011, 31 December 2012, and 31 December 2013.

Whereas, in July 2011 the SSAC Membership Committee initiated an annual review of SSAC members whose terms are ending 31 December 2011 and submitted to the SSAC its recommendations for reappointments.

Whereas, on 07 September 2011, the SSAC members voted to approve the reappointments.

Whereas, the SSAC recommends that the Board reappoint the following SSAC members to three-year terms: [insert names].

Resolved (2010.XX.XX.XX) the Board accepts the recommendation of the SSAC and reappoints the following SSAC members to three-year terms beginning 01 January 20XX and ending 31 December 20XX: [insert names].

PROPOSED RATIONALE:

The SSAC is a diverse group of individuals whose expertise in specific subject matters enables the SSAC to fulfill its charter and execute its mission. Since its inception, the SSAC has invited individuals with deep knowledge and experience in technical and security areas that are critical to the security and stability of the Internet's domain name system. The above-mentioned individuals provide the SSAC with the expertise and experience required for the Committee to fulfill its charter and executive its mission.

Submitted by: [insert name of Board Liaison]

Position: Liaison to the ICANN Board from the Security and

SSAC Operational Procedures Version 5.0

Stability Advisory Committee

Date Noted: [insert date]

Email: [insert email address of Board Liaison]

APPENDIX E: ICANN BOARD SUBMISSION FORM TO THANK DEPARTING SSAC MEMBER

TITLE: Thank You from Security and Stability Advisory Committee to [insert name]

PROPOSED ACTION: For Consent Agenda

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

On [insert date] the ICANN Board approved the appointment of [insert name] to the Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC). On [insert date] [insert name] resigned from the SSAC.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:

The Committee wishes to formally thank [insert name] for his work while a member of the SSAC.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

Whereas, [insert name] was appointed to the ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee on [insert date].

Whereas, ICANN wishes to acknowledge and thank [insert name] for his service to the community by his membership on the Security and Stability Advisory Committee.

Resolved (2011.xx.xx.xx), that [insert name] has earned the deep appreciation of the Board for his service to ICANN by his membership on the Security and Stability Advisory Committee, and that the Board wishes [insert name] well in all future endeavours.

PROPOSED RATIONALE:

It is the practice of the SSAC to seek Board recognition of the service of Committee members upon their departure.

SSAC Operational Procedures Version 5.0

Submitted by: [insert name of Board Liaison]
Position: Liaison to the ICANN Board from the Security and
Stability Advisory Committee
Date Noted: [insert date]
Email: [insert email address of Board Liaison]

APPENDIX F: AFFIRMATION OF CONFIDENTIALITY AND NON-DISCLOSURE

ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC) Affirmation of Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure

I, _____, a member of the ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee (SSAC), affirm my intention to conform to the following:

2. As a member of the SSAC, I may be provided certain technical data or information that is commercially valuable and not generally known in its industry of principal use (collectively referred to as “Proprietary Information”) pursuant to the SSAC’s performance of its tasks. I will use reasonable care to hold in confidence and not disclose any Proprietary Information disclosed to me. Written information provided to me as a member of the SSAC shall be considered Proprietary Information only if such information is clearly marked with an appropriate stamp or legend as Proprietary Information. Non-written information shall be considered Proprietary Information only if the discloser of such information informs the SSAC at the time of disclosure that the information being disclosed is of a proprietary nature.
3. I shall have no obligation of confidentiality with respect to information disclosed to me if:
 - a. such information is, at the time of disclosure, in the public domain or such information thereafter becomes a part of the public domain without a breach of this Affirmation; or
 - b. such information is known to the SSAC at the time it is disclosed to me; or
 - c. such information has independently developed by the SSAC; or
 - d. such information is received by the SSAC from a third party who had a lawful right to disclose such information to it; or
 - e. such information is allowed to be disclosed with the written approval of the disclosing party.
4. I understand that I may be requested to sign a non-disclosure agreement in order to access information to perform a study, research, or other SSAC tasks. I understand that if I decline to sign any such agreement, I will also be declining participation in the task requiring the execution of the non-disclosure agreement.” My obligations under this Affirmation shall expire one (1) year after I am no longer a member of SSAC.

Signature of SSAC member: _____

Name of SSAC member: _____

Date: _____ Place: _____

APPENDIX G: SSAC NOTIFICATION OF SSAC LIAISON TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS



DATE

To: Secretary at ICANN

From: SSAC Chair

ICANN Bylaws Article XI, Section 2 provides for the Security and Stability Advisory Committee to appoint a non-voting liaison to the ICANN Board of Directors. The ICANN Bylaws Article VI, Section 9, Paragraph 2 also provides that the body entitled to appoint a non-voting liaison shall give the Secretary of ICANN written notice of its appointment at least one month before the commencement of the annual meeting.

Notice is hereby given to the Secretary that the Security and Stability Advisory Committee appointed INSERT NAME as its non-voting liaison to ICANN Board to a term that begins at the conclusion of the annual meeting.

[insert name]

Chair, ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee

APPENDIX H: SSAC PUBLICATION SUBMISSION COVER LETTER



[insert date]

To: ICANN Board

From: SSAC Chair

Via: SSAC Liaison to the ICANN Board

We hereby forward to you an [insert name of publication]

[insert brief description of document]

[insert summary of document]

In accordance with our usual practice, 48 hours after this document is sent to the Board, ICANN Staff will post the report to the SSAC web site and to the SSAC Discussion Space.

SSAC welcomes comments from the Board concerning this [insert form of document, i.e. Report, Advisory, Comment, etc.] and thanks the Board for its consideration of this important document.

[insert name]

Chair, ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee

APPENDIX I: SSAC WEB SITE, WIKI PAGE, AND CALENDAR

All SSAC work products are posted on the SSAC website. The official web site for the SSAC is public, hosted by ICANN, and found at the following URL:

<http://www.icann.org/committees/security/>. The web site is the SSAC's public face to the community it serves. The web site provides a description of the SSAC, the list of members, and links to the SSAC Charter, its publications and presentations, a discussion space, and a reading list. The Director, SSAC Support, maintains the SSAC web site.

In addition, SSAC members have access to a private wiki collaboration tool to which meeting notes and presentations are posted. A calendar tool also is provided to track meetings.

APPENDIX J: SSAC LOGO

The SSAC logo was developed in coordination with ICANN and has been reviewed by the ICANN Legal Department. It should not be redesigned without first consulting with the ICANN Legal Department and the ICANN Marketing and Communications Department.

