

POST HATE CRIMES MODEL POLICY



COMMISSION ON PEACE OFFICER STANDARDS AND TRAINING

2024

© California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training

Published September 2008

Revised May 2019, October 2023, March 2024

All rights reserved. This publication may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form or by any means electronic or mechanical or by any information storage and retrieval system now known or hereafter invented, *without prior written permission of the California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST)*, with the following exception:

California law enforcement agencies in the POST peace officer program and POST-certified training presenters are hereby given permission by POST to reproduce any or all of the contents of this manual for internal use within their agency/school.

All other individuals, private businesses and corporations, public and private agencies and colleges, professional associations, and non-POST law enforcement agencies in-state or out-of-state, may print or download this publication for non-commercial use.

Infringement of the copyright protection law and the provisions expressed here and on the POST Website under Copyright/Trademark Protection will be pursued in a court of law. Questions about copyright protection of this publication and exceptions may be directed to Publications Manager.

POST Mission Statement

The mission of the California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training is to continually enhance the professionalism of California Law Enforcement in serving its communities



POST COMMISSIONERS

CHAIR

Geoff Long Public Member

VICE CHAIR

Rick Braziel Educator, Humboldt State University

Rob Bonta Attorney General, Department of Justice

Alan Barcelona Special Agent, Department of Justice

> **Ingrid Braun** Sheriff, Mono County

Jim Cooper Sheriff, Sacramento County

> **P. Lamont Ewell** Public Member

Kelly Gordon Chief, Santa Barbara Police Department

Shannan Moon Sheriff, Nevada County Sheriff's Office

> **Tina Nieto** Sheriff, Monterey County

Michelle Rodriguez Public Member

FOREWORD

Hate Crimes (i.e. crimes motivated by bias) convey a message of terror and exclusion, not just to the immediate victims but to entire communities. They often target victims who are least able to defend themselves. They cause trauma that is more extreme and longer lasting than similar crimes committed for other motivations. They can spark retaliatory crimes, escalating the cycle of crime and violence. If not addressed professionally and thoroughly they may undermine public confidence in law enforcement.

The 2018 California State Auditor's Report, titled "Hate Crimes in California," found that California law enforcement has not taken adequate action to identify, report, and respond to hate crimes. The report found that agencies did not properly identify some hate crimes, and underreported or misreported hate crimes as well. The report also noted that hate crimes are on the rise in California, increasing in both 2015 and 2016.

These guidelines are the primary elements that law enforcement executives are required to incorporate into their hate crimes policy by July 1, 2024. The guidelines are designed for department-wide application and are intended to reflect a values-driven "top-down" process. They are intended to assist with the development and delivery of training and ensure proper identification, investigation, and reporting of hate crimes within each agency's jurisdiction.

Law enforcement agencies are required to submit the hate crime documents required by the Attorney General as follows:

(A) On or before January 1, 2025, each law enforcement agency in the Counties of Los Angeles, Orange, San Luis Obispo, Santa Barbara, and Ventura shall produce their hate crime materials to the Department of Justice.

(B) On or before January 1, 2026, each law enforcement agency in the Counties of Alameda, Contra Costa, Del Norte, Humboldt, Lake, Marin, Mendocino, Monterey, Napa, San Benito, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Santa Cruz, Solano, and Sonoma shall produce their hate crime materials to the Department of Justice.

(C) On or before January 1, 2027, each law enforcement agency in the Counties of Colusa, Glenn, Lassen, Modoc, Nevada, Plumas, Shasta, Sierra, Siskiyou, Sutter, Tehama, Trinity, Yuba, Alpine, Amador, Calaveras, El Dorado, Placer, Sacramento, San Joaquin, Stanislaus, Tuolumne, and Yolo and the special districts of the San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District, the Department of the California Highway Patrol, the Department of State Hospitals, and the state park system shall produce their hate crime materials to the Department of Justice.

(D) On or before January 1, 2028, each law enforcement agency in the Counties of Fresno, Kern, Kings, Madera, Mariposa, Merced, Tulare, Imperial, Inyo, Mono, Riverside, San Bernardino, and San Diego shall produce their hate crime materials to the Department of Justice.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Minimum Legal Requirements for an Agency's Hate Crimes Policy	Policy Guidelines	1
Purpose	Minimum Legal Requirements for an Agency's Hate Crimes Policy	3
Policy	Model Policy Framework	6
Response, Victim Assistance and Follow-up	Purpose	6
Initial response	Policy	6
Investigation	Response, Victim Assistance and Follow-up	6
Supervision	Initial response	6
Training. 11 Planning and Prevention 11 Release of Information 12 Reporting 13 Checklist for the Agency's Policy Creation 14 Appendix 15 Definitions and Laws. 15 Statutes and Legal Requirements 18 Felonies 18 Misdemeanors 18 Enhancements 19 Reporting 19 Miscellaneous Provisions 19 Supplemental Hate Crime Report 20	Investigation	8
Planning and Prevention 11 Release of Information 12 Reporting 13 Checklist for the Agency's Policy Creation 14 Appendix 15 Definitions and Laws 15 Statutes and Legal Requirements 18 Felonies 18 Misdemeanors 19 Reporting 19 Training and Policy Requirements 19 Miscellaneous Provisions 19 Supplemental Hate Crime Report 20	Supervision	
Release of Information 12 Reporting 13 Checklist for the Agency's Policy Creation 14 Appendix 15 Definitions and Laws 15 Statutes and Legal Requirements 18 Felonies 18 Misdemeanors 18 Enhancements 19 Reporting 19 Miscellaneous Provisions 19 Supplemental Hate Crime Report 20	Training	
Reporting.13Checklist for the Agency's Policy Creation14Appendix15Definitions and Laws.15Statutes and Legal Requirements.18Felonies.18Misdemeanors18Enhancements19Reporting.19Training and Policy Requirements.19Miscellaneous Provisions19Supplemental Hate Crime Report20	Planning and Prevention	
Checklist for the Agency's Policy Creation 14 Appendix 15 Definitions and Laws 15 Statutes and Legal Requirements 18 Felonies 18 Misdemeanors 18 Enhancements 19 Reporting 19 Training and Policy Requirements 19 Miscellaneous Provisions 19 Supplemental Hate Crime Report 20	Release of Information	
Appendix 15 Definitions and Laws. 15 Statutes and Legal Requirements. 18 Felonies. 18 Misdemeanors 18 Enhancements 19 Reporting. 19 Training and Policy Requirements. 19 Miscellaneous Provisions 19 Supplemental Hate Crime Report 20	Reporting	
Definitions and Laws	Checklist for the Agency's Policy Creation	
Statutes and Legal Requirements18Felonies18Misdemeanors18Enhancements19Reporting19Training and Policy Requirements19Miscellaneous Provisions19Supplemental Hate Crime Report20	Appendix	
Felonies 18 Misdemeanors 18 Enhancements 19 Reporting 19 Training and Policy Requirements 19 Miscellaneous Provisions 19 Supplemental Hate Crime Report 20	Definitions and Laws	
Misdemeanors18Enhancements19Reporting19Training and Policy Requirements19Miscellaneous Provisions19Supplemental Hate Crime Report20	Statutes and Legal Requirements	
Enhancements19Reporting19Training and Policy Requirements19Miscellaneous Provisions19Supplemental Hate Crime Report20	Felonies	
Reporting	Misdemeanors	
Training and Policy Requirements	Enhancements	
Miscellaneous Provisions	Reporting	
Supplemental Hate Crime Report	Training and Policy Requirements	
	Miscellaneous Provisions	
Sample Memo for the Agency Chief Executive	Supplemental Hate Crime Report	
	Sample Memo for the Agency Chief Executive	

POLICY GUIDELINES

GUIDELINE #1

Develop the foundation for the agency's hate crimes policy.

The law enforcement executive is responsible for providing leadership, communicating organizational values to the department and the community, paying attention to hate crime trends and current events that could trigger hate incidents and/or hate crimes in the community, and providing education and training to establish the foundation for the agency's hate crimes policy. Employees' ability to respond appropriately to hate crimes and hate incidents is maximized when the executive effectively establishes and communicates the foundational values of the organization.

GUIDELINE #2

Develop a hate crimes policy for the agency.

- I. An agency's hate crimes policy shall include the statutory definition of a hate crime, and its policy and programs should minimally include the following:
 - A. Response
 - B. Training
 - C. Planning and Prevention
 - D. Reporting

The law enforcement executive is responsible for the initial development of the policy and should be actively involved in its implementation. See the appendix for the exemplar "Message from the Agency Chief Executive."

GUIDELINE #3

Develop expertise to identify and investigate hate crimes.

The law enforcement executive is responsible for ensuring that the agency possesses expertise to identify and investigate hate crimes, as well as ensuring compliance with state and federal reporting and public information requirements. Agencies should assign identified personnel to appropriate training to develop expertise and knowledge to investigate hate crimes.

Hate crimes are low-frequency events with highrisk consequences for the agency and community. Agencies shall provide a "Supplemental Hate Crimes Report" to first responders to provide direction for the investigation of all suspected hate crimes as mandated by Penal Code (PC) § 422.87.

GUIDELINE#4

Develop and implement cooperative hate crimes plans with other law enforcement agencies.

- I. Coordinate cooperative efforts among regional, state, federal, and tribal law enforcement agencies to share information and training, and develop strategies to prevent hate crime activity.
- II. Develop and/or participate in law enforcement intelligence networks to enhance the agency's ability to anticipate potential hate crime targets. This interaction should include sharing intelligence information with other jurisdictions and cooperative investigations, arrests, and prosecutions if appropriate.

GUIDELINE #5

Develop and implement cooperative hate crime plans with the community and related governmental and non-governmental organizations, as appropriate.

- I. Collaborate with the community, including human relations/civil rights organizations, advocacy groups, service organizations, neighborhood associations, religious institutions, local schools and colleges, to do the following:
 - Develop a network to build rapport with community groups

- Develop a protocol for response to hate crimes
- Obtain witness and victim cooperation
- Provide support services to victims
- Collect demographic information about specific communities
- Identify hate crime trends based on current events and activity (hate crimes and/or hate incidents)
- Identify periods of increased vulnerability based on significant dates and events for affected communities
- II. Law enforcement should identify and seek out cultural diversity training and information from/about specific communities within its jurisdiction (immigrant, Muslim, Arab, LGBTQ+, Black or African American, Jewish, Sikh, disability, etc.) to strengthen agency awareness.

GUIDELINE #6

Conduct an annual assessment of the agency's hate crimes policy and its ongoing implementation.

The assessment should include:

- I. A review to ensure compliance with the POST Hate Crimes Model Policy and California law.
- II. A review and analysis of the agency's data collection, policy, and annual mandated reporting of hate crimes.
- III. A review and updating of the agency's hate crimes brochure to ensure compliance with PC § 422.92.
- IV. A review of any existing or available data or reports, including the annual California Attorney General's report on hate crimes, in preparation for, and response to, future hate crime trends.

V. Annual outreach to the community including human relations/civil rights organizations, advocacy groups, service organizations, neighborhood associations, religious institutions, local schools, and colleges assessing the agency's responsiveness to hate crimes.

MINIMUM LEGAL REQUIREMENTS FOR AN AGENCY'S HATE CRIMES POLICY

Penal Code section 13519.6, effective January 1, 2005, minimally requires:

- 1. A message from the law enforcement agency's chief executive officer to the agency's officers and staff concerning the importance of hate crime laws and the agency's commitment to enforcement.
- 2. The definition of "hate crime" in PC § 422.55.
- 3. References to hate crime statutes including PC § 422.6.
- 4. A title-by-title specific protocol that agency personnel are required to follow, including, but not limited to, the following:
 - a. Preventing and preparing for likely hate crimes by, among other things, establishing contact with persons and communities who are likely targets, and forming and cooperating with community hate crime prevention and response networks.
 - b. Responding to reports of hate crimes, including reports of hate crimes committed under the color of authority.
 - c. Accessing assistance, by, among other things, activating the Department of Justice hate crimes rapid response protocol when necessary.
 - d. Providing victim assistance and follow-up, including community follow-up.
 - e. Reporting
- 5. A list of all requirements that PC § 422.87 or any other law mandates a law enforcement agency to include in its hate crime policy.

Penal Code section 422.87, effective January 1, 2024, states and minimally requires:

- (a) Each local law enforcement agency shall adopt a hate crimes policy by July 1, 2024, that shall include, but not limited to, the following:
 - 1. The definitions in PC §§ 422.55 and 422.56.
 - 2. The content of the model policy framework that the Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training developed pursuant to PC § 13519.6 (above) and any content that the commission may revise or add in the future, including any policy, definitions, response and reporting responsibilities, training resources, and planning and prevention methods.
 - 3. (A) Information regarding bias motivation

(B) For the purposes of this paragraph, "bias motivation" is a preexisting negative attitude toward actual or perceived characteristics referenced in PC § 422.55. Depending on the circumstances of each case, bias motivation may include, but is not limited to, hatred, animosity, discriminatory selection of victims, resentment, revulsion, contempt, unreasonable fear, paranoia, callousness, thrill-seeking, desire for social dominance, desire for social bonding with those of one's "own kind," or a perception of the vulnerability of the victim due to the victim being perceived as being

weak, worthless, or fair game because of a protected characteristic, including, but not limited to, disability or gender.

(C) In recognizing suspected disability-bias hate crimes, the policy shall instruct officers to consider whether there is any indication that the perpetrator was motivated by hostility or other bias, occasioned by factors such as, but not limited to, dislike of persons who arouse fear or guilt, a perception that persons with disabilities are inferior and therefore "deserving victims," a fear of persons whose visible traits are perceived as being disturbing to others, or resentment of those who need, demand, or receive alternative educational, physical, or social accommodations.

(ii) In recognizing suspected disability-bias hate crimes, the policy also shall instruct officers to consider whether there is any indication that the perpetrator perceived the victim to be vulnerable and, if so, if this perception is grounded, in whole or in part, in anti-disability bias. This includes, but is not limited to, if a perpetrator targets a person with a particular perceived disability while avoiding other vulnerable-appearing persons such as inebriated persons or persons with perceived disabilities different than those of the victim, those circumstances could be evidence that the perpetrator's motivations included bias against persons with the perceived disability of the victim and that the crime must be reported as a suspected hate crime and not a mere crime of opportunity.

(D) In recognizing suspected religion-bias hate crimes, the policy shall instruct officers to consider whether there were targeted attacks on, or biased references to, symbols of importance to a particular religion or articles considered of spiritual significance in the particular religion. Examples of religions and such symbols and articles include, but are not limited to:

- (i) In Buddhism, statues of the Buddha.
- (ii) In Christianity, crosses.
- (iii) In Hinduism, forehead markings, known as bindis and tilaks, Aum/Om symbols, and images of deities known as murtis.
- (iv) In Islam, hijabs.
- (v) In Judaism, Stars of David, menorahs, and yarmulke.
- (vi) In Sikhism, turbans, head coverings, and unshorn hair (including beards).
- 4. Information regarding the general underreporting of hate crimes and the more extreme underreporting of anti-disability and anti-gender hate crimes *and a plan for the agency to remedy this underreporting* (emphasis added).
- 5. A protocol for reporting suspected hate crimes to the DOJ pursuant to PC § 13023.
- 6. A Supplemental Hate Crime Report of first responder responsibilities, including, but not limited to, being sensitive to effects of the crime on the victim, determining whether any additional resources are needed on the scene to assist the victim or whether to refer the victim to appropriate community and legal services, and giving the victims and any interested persons the agency's hate crimes brochure, as required by PC § 422.92.
- 7. A specific procedure for transmitting and periodically retransmitting the policy and any related orders to all officers, including a simple and immediate way for officers to access the policy in the field when needed.

- 8. The title or titles of the officer or officers responsible for assuring that the department has a hate crime brochure as required by PC § 422.92 and ensuring that all officers are trained to distribute the brochure to all suspected hate crime victims and all other interested persons.
- 9. A requirement that all officers be familiar with the policy and carry out the policy at all times unless directed by the chief, sheriff, director, or other chief executive of the law enforcement agency or other command-level officer to whom the chief executive officer formally delegates this responsibility.
- 10. A schedule of the hate crime training required by PC § 13519.6 and any other hate crime or related training the agency may conduct.
- (b) A law enforcement agency that updates an existing hate crimes policy or adopts a new hate crimes policy may include any of the provisions of a model hate crime policy and other relevant documents developed by the International Association of Chiefs of Police that are relevant to California and consistent with the law.

MODEL POLICY FRAMEWORK

Purpose

This model policy framework is designed to assist in identifying and handling crimes motivated by hate or other bias toward individuals and groups with legally defined protected characteristics, to define appropriate steps for assisting victims, and to provide a guide to conducting related investigations. It outlines the general policy framework for prevention, response, accessing assistance, victim assistance and follow-up, and reporting as related to law enforcement's role in handling hate crimes. It also serves as a declaration that hate crimes are taken seriously and demonstrates how law enforcement agencies may best use their resources to investigate and solve an offense, in addition to building community trust and increasing police legitimacy.

Policy

It is the policy of this agency to safeguard the rights of all individuals irrespective of their disability, gender, nationality, race or ethnicity, religion, sexual orientation, and/or association with a person or group with one or more of these actual or perceived characteristics. Any acts or threats of violence, property damage, harassment, intimidation, or other crimes motivated by hate or bias should be viewed very seriously and given high priority.

This agency will employ necessary resources and vigorous law enforcement action to identify and arrest hate crime perpetrators. Also, recognizing particular fears and distress typically suffered by victims, the potential for reprisal and escalation of violence, and the far-reaching negative consequences of these crimes on the community, this agency should attend to the security and related concerns of the immediate victims and their families as feasible.

The agency policy shall include a requirement that all officers be familiar with the policy and carry out the policy at all times unless directed by the chief, sheriff, director, or other chief executive(s) of the law enforcement agency or another command-level officer to whom the chief executive officer formally delegates this responsibility.

The agency policy shall provide a specific procedure for transmitting and periodically retransmitting the policy and any related orders to all officers, including a simple and immediate way for officers to access the policy in the field when needed.

Response, Victim Assistance and Follow-up

Initial response

First responding officers should know the role of all department personnel as they relate to the agency's investigation of hate crimes and/or incidents. Responding officers should evaluate the need for additional assistance, and working with supervision and/or investigations, access needed assistance if applicable. Responding officers should ensure the crime scene is properly protected, preserved and processed.

At the scene of a suspected hate or bias crimes, officers should take preliminary actions deemed necessary, to include, but not limited to, the following:

1. Use agency Supplemental Hate Crimes Report (per PC § 422.87) to assist in the investigation of any suspected hate crime (see appendix, page 20).

- 2. Stabilize the victim(s) and request medical attention when necessary.
- 3. Ensure the safety of victims, witnesses, and perpetrators.
 - a. Issue a Temporary Restraining Order (if applicable).
- 4. Notify other appropriate personnel in the chain of command, depending on the nature and seriousness of the offense and its potential inflammatory and related impact on the community.
- 5. Ensure that the crime scene is properly protected, preserved, and processed and that all physical evidence of the incident is removed as soon as possible after the offense is documented. If evidence of an inflammatory nature cannot be physically removed, the property owner should be contacted to ensure that it is removed or covered up as soon as possible. Agency personnel should follow-up to ensure that this is accomplished in a timely manner.
- 6. Collect and photograph physical evidence or indicators of hate crimes such as:
 - a. Hate literature.
 - b. Spray paint cans.
 - c. Threatening letters.
 - d. Symbols used by hate groups.
- 7. Identify criminal evidence on the victim.
- 8. Request the assistance of translators or interpreters when needed to establish effective communication with witnesses, victims, or others as appropriate.
- 9. Conduct a preliminary investigation and record pertinent information including, but not limited to:
 - a. Identity of suspected perpetrator(s).
 - b. Identity of witnesses, including those no longer at the scene.
 - c. The offer of victim confidentiality per Government Code (GC) section 5264.
 - d. Prior occurrences, in this area or with this victim.
 - e. Statements made by suspects; exact wording is critical.
 - f. The victim's protected characteristics and determine if bias was a motivation "in whole or in part"¹ in the commission of the crime.
 - (i) "Bias motivation" is a preexisting negative attitude toward actual or perceived characteristics referenced in PC § 422.55. Depending on the circumstances of each case, bias motivation may include, but is not limited to, hatred, animosity, discriminatory selection of victims, resentment, revulsion, contempt, unreasonable fear, paranoia, callousness, thrill-seeking, desire for social dominance, desire for social bonding with those of one's "own kind," or a perception of the vulnerability of the victim due to the victim being perceived as being weak, worthless, or fair game because of a protected characteristic, including, but not limited to, disability or gender.
 - (a) In recognizing suspected disability-bias hate crimes, the policy shall advise officers to consider whether there is any indication that the perpetrator was motivated by

¹ See Appendix, page 15, for definition

hostility or other bias, occasioned by factors such as, but not limited to, dislike of persons who arouse fear or guilt, a perception that persons with disabilities are inferior and therefore "deserving victims," a fear of persons whose visible traits are perceived as being disturbing to others, or resentment of those who need, demand, or receive alternative educational, physical, or social accommodations.

- (b) In recognizing suspected disability-bias hate crimes, the policy also shall advise officers to consider whether there is any indication that the perpetrator perceived the victim to be vulnerable and, if so, if this perception is grounded, in whole or in part, in anti-disability bias. This includes, but is not limited to, if a perpetrator targets a person with a particular perceived disability while avoiding other vulnerable-appearing persons such as inebriated persons or persons with perceived disabilities different than those of the victim, those circumstances could be evidence that the perpetrator's motivations included bias against persons with the perceived disability of the victim and that the crime must be reported as a suspected hate crime and not a mere crime of opportunity.
- 10. Adhere to PC § 422.93, which protects hate crime victims and witnesses from being reported to federal immigration authorities if they have not committed any crime under state law.
- 11. Provide information regarding immigration remedies available to victims of crime. (U-Visa, T-Visa, S-Visa, etc.).
- 12. Provide the agency's Hate Crimes Brochure (per PC § 422.92).
- 13. Utilize proper techniques for interviewing people with disabilities and being aware of and providing appropriate accommodations (such as Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) standards, Braille, visuals, translators for the deaf or hard of hearing, etc.).
- 14. Report any suspected multi-mission extremist crimes to the agency Terrorism Liaison Officer (TLO), or assigned designee, and direct the TLO/ designee to send the data to the Joint Regional Information Exchange System.

Investigation

Investigators at the scene of or while performing follow-up investigation on a suspected hate or bias crime (or hate incident if agency policy requires it) should take all actions deemed necessary, including, but not limited to, the following:

- 1. Consider typologies of perpetrators of hate crimes and incidents, including but not limited to thrill, reactive/defensive, and mission (hardcore).
- 2. Utilize investigative techniques and methods to handle hate crimes or hate incidents in a professional manner.
- 3. Utilize proper techniques for interviewing people with disabilities and being aware of and providing appropriate accommodations (such as ADA standards, Braille, visuals, translators for the deaf or hard of hearing, etc.).
- 4. Fully investigate any report of hate crime committed under the color of authority per PC §§ 422.6 and 13519.6.

- 5. Collect and photograph physical evidence or indicators of hate crimes such as:
 - a. Hate literature.
 - b. Spray paint cans.
 - c. Threatening letters.
 - d. Symbols used by hate groups.
 - e. Desecration of religious symbols, objects, or buildings.
- 6. Request the assistance of translators or interpreters when needed to establish effective communication.
- 7. Conduct a preliminary investigation and record information regarding:
 - a. Identity of suspected perpetrator(s).
 - b. Identity of witnesses, including those no longer at the scene.
 - c. Offer of victim confidentiality per GC § 5264.
 - d. Prior occurrences, in this area or with this victim.
 - e. Statements made by suspects; exact wording is critical.
 - f. Document the victim's protected characteristics.
- 8. Provide victim assistance and follow-up.
- 9. Canvas the area for additional witnesses.
- 10. Examine suspect's social media activity for potential evidence of bias motivation.
- 11. Coordinate the investigation with agency, state, and regional intelligence operations. These sources can provide the investigating officer with an analysis of any patterns, organized hate groups, and suspects potentially involved in the offense.
- 12. Coordinate the investigation with the crime scene investigation unit (if applicable) or other units of the agency.
- 13. Determine if the incident should be classified as a hate crime.
- 14. Take steps to ensure appropriate assistance is provided to hate crime victim(s), including the following measures:
 - a. Contact the victim periodically to determine whether they are receiving adequate and appropriate assistance.
 - b. Provide ongoing information to the victim about the status of the criminal investigation.
 - c. Provide the victim and any other interested person the brochure on hate crimes per PC § 422.92 and information on any local advocacy groups.
- 15. Report any suspected multi-mission extremist crimes to the agency TLO, or assigned designee, and direct the TLO or designee to send the data to the Joint Regional Information Exchange System.
- 16. Coordinate with other law enforcement agencies in the area to assess patterns of hate crimes and/ or hate incidents (if directed by policy), and determine if organized hate groups are involved.

Supervision

The supervisor shall confer with the initial responding officer(s) and ensure that necessary preliminary actions have been taken. The supervisor shall request any appropriate personnel necessary to accomplish the following:

- 1. Provide immediate assistance to the crime victim by:
 - a. Expressing the law enforcement agency's official position on the importance of these cases and the measures that will be taken to apprehend the perpetrators.
 - b. Expressing the department's interest in protecting victims' anonymity (confidentiality forms GC § 6254) to the extent possible. Allow the victim to convey their immediate concerns and feelings.
 - c. Identifying individuals or agencies that may provide victim assistance and support. Local victim assistance resources may include family members or close acquaintances, clergy, or departmental chaplain, as well as community service agencies that provide shelter, food, clothing, childcare, or other related services (per PC § 422.92).
- 2. Ensure that all relevant facts are documented on an incident and/ or arrest report and make an initial determination as to whether the incident should be classified as a hate crime for federal and state bias-crimes reporting purposes.
- 3. Notify other appropriate personnel in the chain of command, depending on the nature and seriousness of the offense and its potential inflammatory and related impact on the community.
- 4. In cases of large-scale hate crime waves, or in circumstances where the potential exists for subsequent hate crimes or incidents, consider directing resources to protect vulnerable sites (such as assigning an officer at specific locations that could become targets).
- 5. Ensure hate crimes are properly reported, including reporting to the DOJ, pursuant to PC § 13023.
- 6. Ensure the monthly posting of Hate Crime Statistics to the reporting agency's website pursuant to PC § 13023 (c).
- 7. Respond to and investigate any reports of hate crimes committed under the color of authority.
- 8. Provide appropriate assistance, including activating the DOJ hate crime rapid response protocol if necessary. For information see the DOJ Website or use the following link: *Protocol for Deployment of Department of Justice Resources*
- 9. Report or ensure any suspected multi-mission extremist's crimes are reported to the agency TLO, or assigned designee, and direct the TLO/designee to send the data to the Joint Regional Information Exchange System.
- 10. Make a final determination as to whether the incident should be classified as a hate crime.

Training

All staff, including dispatch, desk personnel, volunteers, records, support staff, officers, supervisors, and managers shall be properly trained in the department's hate crimes policy. The agency will follow all legislatively mandated training requirements.

POST offers training and video courses to assist law enforcement in the identification, investigation, documentation, and reporting of hate crimes. These courses provide officers with information and skills necessary to effectively identify, investigate, document and report hate crimes. Various training programs include the history and definitions of hate crimes, recognition of hate groups, international terrorism, legal considerations, victims' considerations, initial response duties, victim interviewing and care, suspect identification and interrogation, evidence identification, report writing, the role of law enforcement, investigative strategies, intelligence collection, supervisory roles, community relations, media relations and local program training development, and other topics such as proper use of computer systems and methods for reporting. POST also maintains an extensive array of training videos on applicable topics such as working with those with mental illness and intellectual disabilities, hate crimes, and working with minority communities.

For more information on POST training opportunities and available videos, visit the *POST Website*. In conjunction with POST training opportunities, trainers may utilize other state and federal agencies that offer training courses, such as the U.S. Department of Justice.

Planning and Prevention

The general underreporting of hate crimes is an identified issue in California. Underreporting is caused by victims not reporting hate crimes or hate incidents due to a number of factors, including fear of reprisal and the belief that law enforcement will not properly investigate them. A report by the State Auditor in 2018 determined that California law enforcement has not taken adequate action to identify, report and respond to hate crimes. There is also an extreme underreporting of anti-disability and anti-gender hate crimes. The agency's plan to remedy this underreporting *shall be inserted into the policy* (emphasis added).

In order to facilitate the recommendations contained within this policy, it is strongly recommended that agencies build and strengthen relationships with the community, engage in dialogue, and provide education to the community about this policy. Agency personnel are also encouraged to learn about the inherent issues concerning their communities in relation to hate crimes. Assigned personnel should perform the following:

- 1. Meet with residents in target communities to allay fears; emphasize the agency's concern over this and related incidents; reduce the potential for counter-violence; and provide safety, security, and crime prevention information. Cultural diversity education and immersion programs (if available) could facilitate this process.
- 2. Provide direct and referral assistance to the victim and their family.
- 3. Conduct public meetings on hate crime threats and violence in general.
- 4. Establish relationships with formal community-based organizations and leaders.
- 5. Expand, where appropriate, preventive programs such as hate, bias, and crime reduction seminars for school children.

- 6. Review the bulletins Attorney General's latest opinion on hate crime statistics and targets in order to prepare and plan for future crimes, specifically for Arab/Middle Eastern and Islamic communities.²
- 7. Provide orientation of and with communities of specific targeted victims such as immigrants, Muslims, Arabs, LGBTQ+, Black or African American, Jewish, Sikh, disabled persons, etc.

Hate crimes are not only a crime against the targeted victim(s) but also have impacts on the victim's family and community. Working constructively with segments of this larger community after such crimes is essential to help reduce fears, stem possible retaliation, prevent additional hate crimes, and encourage any other previously victimized individuals to step forward and report such crimes. This is particularly important if an upward trend has been identified in these crimes.

Although hate incidents are not criminal events, they can be indicators of, or precursors to, hate crimes. Most California law enforcement agencies do not track hate incidents. It is recommended that hate incidents be investigated and documented, if directed by policy, as part of the overall planning to prevent hate crime.

Tracking social media is also another identified area to find indicators of, or precursors to, hate crimes. It is recommended that agencies assign personnel to find, evaluate and monitor public social media sources to identify possible suspects in reported hate crimes, or to determine suspects or suspect groups in future hate crimes or hate incidents affecting the identified individuals, groups or communities that may be victimized, and planned hate-based events.

Release of Information

Agencies should have a procedure and/or policy on public disclosure of hate crimes. Establishing a relationship with stakeholders, before any incident occurs, to develop a network and protocol for disclosure would assist greatly in any disclosure.

The benefit of public disclosure of hate crime incidents includes:

- 1. Dissemination of correct information.
- 2. Assurance to affected communities or groups that the matter is being properly and promptly investigated.
- 3. The ability to request information regarding the commission of the crime(s) from the victimized community.

Agencies should provide the supervisor, public information officer, or designee with information that can be responsibly reported to the media. When appropriate, the law enforcement media spokesperson should reiterate that the hate crimes will not be tolerated, will be taken seriously, and will be prosecuted to the full extent of the law.

Agencies are encouraged to consider the following when releasing information to the public regarding hate crimes and hate incidents that have been reported within the jurisdiction:

1. Informing community organizations in a timely manner when a community group has been the target of a hate crime.

² As described in PC § 13519.6(b)(8)

- 2. Informing the community of the impact of these crimes on the victim, the victim's family, and the community, and the assistance and compensation available to victims.
- 3. Informing the community regarding hate crime law and the legal rights of, and the remedies available to, victims of hate crimes.
- 4. Providing the community with on-going information regarding hate crime and/or hate incidents (if policy requires it).

Reporting

The agency policy shall require the development of a procedure for data collection, documentation, and mandated reporting requirements. The agency shall:

- 1. Ensure that hate crimes are properly investigated, documented and reported.
- 2. During documentation, ensure hate crimes are flagged properly to allow for required reporting to the DOJ. This is typically indicated by the title/penal code section identifying the report as a hate crime. Some agencies have added a check box specifically indicating a hate crime that could, if required by the agency policy, require a secondary review by an investigator/detective, supervisor, or other identified party. It is the agency executive's responsibility to determine the form of documentation and type of indicators on crime reports.
- 3. The agency head or their designee (identified in the agency policy) should make a final determination as to whether the incident should be classified as a hate crime by the agency.
- 4. Agencies shall develop procedures to comply with legally mandated reporting, including the DOJ, pursuant to PC § 13023.

Agency Policy Creation Checklist

1) 🗆	Message from the law enforcement agency's chief executive is included.
2) 🗆	The updated existing policy or newly adopted policy includes the content of the model policy framework from POST.
3) 🗆	Definition of "hate crime" included from:
	 □ Penal Code (PC) section 422.55 □ PC § 422.56 □ PC § 422.6
4) 🗆	Title by title specific protocol regarding:
	 Prevention Is contact established with identified persons and/or communities who are likely targets? Have we formed and/or are we cooperating with hate crime prevention and response networks? Has a plan for the agency to remedy underreporting of hate crimes and the more extreme underreporting of anti-disability and anti-gender hate crimes been created?
	 <i>Response:</i> Requirement that all hate crimes be properly investigated and supervised. Requirement that any hate crimes committed under the color of authority are investigated.
	 Accessing Assistance: Information provided for activating the Department of Justice (DOJ) hate crime rapid response protocol when necessary.
	□ Victim assistance and follow-up
	 <i>Reporting:</i> Protocol for reporting suspected hate crimes to the DOJ per PC § 13023.
	 Training: Has a checklist for first responders been provided to personnel (see supplemental hate crime report) A schedule of the hate crimes training required by PC § 13519.6 and any other hate crime or related training the agency may conduct.
5) 🗆	Definitions of terms used in the policy are listed.
6) 🗆	Specific procedures for transmitting and periodically retransmitting the policy and any related orders to officers is included.
	Procedure shall include a simple and immediate way for officers to access the policy in the field when needed.
7) 🗆	Title or titles of the officer or officers responsible for assuring the department has a hate crime brochure (per PC § 422.92) and ensuring that all officers are trained to distribute the brochure to all suspected hate crime victims and all other interested persons.
8) 🗆	A requirement that all officers be familiar with the policy and always carry out the policy unless directed by the law enforcement chief executive or the chief executive's designee.

APPENDIX

DEFINITIONS AND LAWS

In accordance with Penal Code (PC) sections 422.55, 422.56, 422.6, and 422.87, for purposes of all other state law unless an explicit provision of law or the context clearly requires a different meaning, the following shall apply:

Hate Crime

"Hate crime" means a criminal act committed, in whole or in part, because of one or more of the following actual or perceived characteristics of the victim:

- (1) Disability.
- (2) Gender.
- (3) Nationality.
- (4) Race or ethnicity.
- (5) Religion.
- (6) Sexual orientation.
- (7) Association with a person or group with one or more of these actual or perceived characteristics.
 - (a) "Hate crime" includes, but is not limited to, a violation of PC § 422.6.
 - (b) "Association with a person or group with these actual or perceived characteristics" includes advocacy for, identification with, or being on the ground owned or rented by, or adjacent to, any of the following: a community center, educational facility, family, individual, office, meeting hall, place of worship, private institution, public agency, library, or other entity, group, or person that has, or is identified with people who have, one or more of those characteristics listed in the definition of "hate crime" under paragraphs 1 to 6, inclusive, of PC § 422.55 subdivision (a).

Note: A "hate crime" need not be motivated by hate but may be motivated by any bias against a protected characteristic.

Hate Speech

The First Amendment to the U.S. Constitution protects most speech, even when it is disagreeable, offensive, or hurtful. The following types of speech are generally not protected: fighting words, true threats, perjury, blackmail, incitement to lawless action, conspiracy and solicitation to commit any crime.

Hate Incident

A "hate incident" is an action or behavior motivated by hate or bias that could be legally protected by the First Amendment right to freedom of expression. Examples of hate incidents include:

- Name-calling
- Insults and epithets
- Distributing hate material in public places
- Displaying hate material on your own property

Bias Motivation

Bias motivation is a preexisting negative attitude toward actual or perceived characteristics referenced in PC § 422.55. Depending on the circumstances of each case, bias motivation may include, but is not limited to, hatred, animosity, discriminatory selection of victims, resentment, revulsion, contempt, unreasonable fear, paranoia, callousness, thrill-seeking, desire for social dominance, desire for social bonding with those of one's "own kind," or a perception of the vulnerability of the victim due to the victim being perceived as being weak, worthless, or fair game because of a protected characteristic, including, but not limited to, disability or gender.

Disability Bias

In recognizing suspected disability-bias hate crimes, officers shall consider whether there is any indication that the perpetrator was motivated by hostility or other bias, occasioned by factors such as, but not limited to, dislike of persons who arouse fear or guilt, a perception that persons with disabilities are inferior and therefore "deserving victims," a fear of persons whose visible traits are perceived as being disturbing to others, or resentment of those who need, demand, or receive alternative educational, physical, or social accommodations.

In recognizing suspected disability-bias hate crimes, officers shall consider whether there is any indication that the perpetrator perceived the victim to be vulnerable and, if so, if this perception is grounded, in whole or in part, in anti-disability bias. This includes, but is not limited to, if a perpetrator targets a person with a particular perceived disability while avoiding other vulnerable-appearing persons such as inebriated persons or persons with perceived disabilities different than those of the victim, those circumstances could be evidence that the perpetrator's motivations included bias against persons with the perceived disability of the victim and that the crime must be reported as a suspected hate crime and not a mere crime of opportunity.

Disability

Disability includes mental disability and physical disability as defined in GC § 12926, regardless of whether those disabilities are temporary, permanent, congenital or acquired by heredity, accident, injury, advanced age, or illness.

Gender

Gender means the socially constructed characteristics of sex and includes a person's gender identity and gender expression. Gender expression means a person's gender-related appearance and behavior, whether or not stereotypically associated with the persons assigned sex at birth. A person's gender identity and gender related appearance and behavior, whether or not stereotypically associated with the person's assigned sex at birth.

In Whole or In Part

"In whole or in part because of" means that the bias motivation must be a cause in fact of the offense whether or not other causes also exist. When multiple concurrent motives exist, the prohibited bias must be a substantial factor in bringing about the particular result. There is no requirement that the bias be a main factor, or that crime would not have been committed but for the actual or perceived characteristic.

Nationality

Nationality means country of origin, immigration status, including citizenship, and national origin.

Race or Ethnicity

Race or ethnicity includes ancestry, color, and ethnic background.

Religion

Religion includes all aspects of religious belief, observance, and practice and includes agnosticism and atheism.

Sexual Orientation

"Sexual orientation" means heterosexuality, homosexuality, bisexuality, asexual, polysexual, or pansexual.

Victim

Victim includes, but is not limited to, a community center, educational facility, entity, family, group, individual, office, meeting hall, person, place of worship, private institution and public.

STATUTES AND LEGAL REQUIREMENTS

Items listed in this section include sections from the Penal Code (PC), Welfare and Institutions Code (WI), and Government Code (GC).

Definitions

PC § 422.55 - Provides general definition of hate crimes in California.

PC § 422.56- Provides definitions of terms included in hate crimes statutes.

GC § 12926- Disability-related definitions applicable to some hate crime statutes.

Felonies

Hate Crimes

PC § 422.7 - Commission of a crime for the purpose of interfering with another's exercise of civil rights.

Related Crimes

PC § 190.2(a)(16) - Homicide penalties related to certain hate crime-related acts.

PC § 190.03(a) - Homicide penalties related to certain hate crime-related acts.

PC § 288(b)(2) - Sexual assault of dependent person by caretaker.

PC § 368(b) - Dependent adult abuse generally - may apply as disability-related hate crime.

PC § 594.3 - Vandalism of places of worship.

PC § 11412 - Causing or attempting to cause others to refrain from exercising religion by threat.

PC § 11413 - Arson or destructive device at place of worship.

Misdemeanors

Hate Crimes

PC § 422.6 - Use of force, threats, or destruction of property to interfere with another's exercise of civil rights.

PC § 422.77 - Violation of civil order (Bane Act) protecting the exercise of civil rights.

Related Crimes

PC § 302 - Disorderly conduct during an assemblage of people gathered for religious worship at a taxexempt place of worship.

PC § 423.2(b), (d), (f) – Crimes against places of religious worship.

PC § 538(c) - Unauthorized insertion of advertisements in newspapers and redistribution to the public.

PC § 640.2 - Placing handbill, notice of advertisement on a consumer product or product packaged without authorization.

PC § 11411 - Terrorism of owner or occupant of real property. Placement or display of sign, symbol, or other physical impression without authorization, engagement in pattern of conduct, or burning or desecration of religious symbols.

Enhancements

PC § 190.2(a)(16) - Special circumstances imposing the Death Penalty or Life Without Possibility of Parole, if the victim was intentionally killed because of sexual orientation, gender, or disability.

PC § 190.3 - Special circumstances imposing life without the possibility of parole if the victim was intentionally killed because of sexual orientation, gender, or disability.

PC § 422.75 - Penalty for felony committed because of victim's race, color, religion, nationality, country or origin, ancestry, disability, or sexual orientation shall be enhanced one, two, or three years in prison, if the person acts alone; and two, three, or four years if the person commits the act with another.

PC § 1170.8 - Enhancement for robbery or assault at a place of worship.

PC § 1170.85(b) - Felony assault or battery enhancement due to age or disability.

Reporting

PC § 13023- Requirement for law enforcement agencies to report hate crime data to Department of Justice.

WI 15630- Elder and Dependent Adult Abuse Mandated Reporting (may apply in disability-related hate crimes).

Training and Policy Requirements

PC § 422.87 - Hate crimes policy adoption and update requirements (Assembly Bill (AB) 1985, Effective January 1, 2019).

PC § 13519.6 - Defines hate crime training requirements for peace officers.

PC § 13519.41 - Training requirements on sexual orientation and gender identity-related hate crimes for peace officers and dispatchers (AB 2504, Effective January 1, 2019).

Miscellaneous Provisions

PC § 422.78 - Responsibility for prosecution of stay away order violations.

PC § 422.86 - Public policy regarding hate crimes.

- PC § 422.89 Legislative intent regarding violations of civil rights and hate crimes.
- PC § 422.92 Hate crimes victims brochure requirement for law enforcement agencies.
- PC § 422.93 Protection of victims and witnesses from being reported to immigration authorities.

GC § 6254 - Victim confidentiality.

POST 2-365 (01/2023) Page 1 of 2

☐ Hate incident (No Crime Committed)			ne Committed)	□ Hate Crime (422.6 PC, 51.7 CC, 52.1 CC)
			VIC	тім
VICTIM TYPE			PE	Date and time of incident: Location of incident:
Date of Birth	Age	Sex	Race	Date and time of report:
☐ School, business or organization			Location of report:	
Name: Type: <i>(e.g., non-profit, private, public school)</i>				Agency Case #:
🗆 Faith-base	ed orga	nization		NATURE OF CALL FOR SERVICE (check all that apply)
Name:			□ Crime against persons	
Faith:				
Other Name:				 Crime against property Gang activity
Туре:				□ Other
Address:				
BIAS				
		OF BIAS	_	L OR PERCEIVED BIAS – VICTIM'S STATEMENT
			Actual bi	as [Victim has the indicated characteristic(s)].
			d bias [Suspect believed victim had the indicated	
Gender				
Gender identity/expression				REASON FOR BIAS:

\Box	Gender	characteristic(s)].				
	Gender identity/expression	REASON FOR BIAS:				
	Sexual orientation	Do you feel you were targeted based on one of these characteristics?				
	Race	□ Yes □ No				
	Ethnicity	Do you know what motivated the suspect to commit this crime?				
	Nationality	□ Yes □ No				
	Religion	Do you feel you were targeted because you associated yourself with an				
	Significant day of offense	individual or a group?				
	(e.g., 9/11, holy days)	Are there indicators the suspect is affiliated with a Hate Group				
	Association with a person or group with	(i.e., literature/tattoos)?				
	one or more of these characteristics	🗌 Yes 🔲 No				
_	(actual or perceived)	Are there Indicators the suspect is affiliated with a criminal street gang?				
	Other:	Yes No				
_		CATORS (CHECK ALL THAT APPLY):				
	Hate speech Acts/gestures	Property damage Symbol used				
	Written/electronic communication	□ Graffiti/spray paint □ Other:				

State of California – Department of Justice **SUPPLEMENTAL HATE CRIME REPORT**

POST 2-365 (01/2023) Page 2 of 2

-

HIS	STORY		
SUSPECT INFORMATION	RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SUSPECT & VICTIM		
Legal name (Last, First):	Suspect known to victim: \Box Yes \Box No		
	Nature of relationship:		
Other Names used (AKA):			
	Length of relationship:		
Date of Birth Age Sex Race			
	Prior reported incidents with suspect: <i>Total</i> #		
Relationship to Victim:	Prior unreported incidents with suspect:		
	Yes No Unknown		
WEADO	NS/FORCE		
Weapon(s) used during incident? Yes No	Type:		
Force used during incident? Yes No	Туре:		
EVI	DENCE		
Witnesses present during incident? Yes No	Statements taken? Yes No		
Evidence collected? Yes No Recordings:			
Photos taken?	ntified: Field ID By photo/video Known Known		
RESOURCES			
Resources offered at scene: Yes No			
□ Marsy's Law Handout □ Hate Crimes Brochure □ Other:			
ME	DICAL		
Victim Suspect			
Declined medical treatment			
□ □ Will seek own medical treatment			
Received medical treatment			
□ □ Injuries observed			
Completed by Date			
Nome/Title/ID number			
Name/Title/ID number			

Sample Memo for the Agency Chief Executive

This sample memo may be used by the Agency Chief Executive to agency personnel. It stresses the importance of hate crime prevention, investigation, documentation, and the rapid apprehension of perpetrators. You may use this sample memo as a guide to create internal communication appropriate for your agency.

