LIBRARY OF CONGRESS

IN THE MATTER	OF:)
)
SECTION 1201)
RULEMAKING HE	ARING)

Pages: 730 through 850

Place: Washington, D.C.

Date: April 20, 2021

HERITAGE REPORTING CORPORATION

Official Reporters
1220 L Street, N.W., Suite 206
Washington, D.C. 20005-4018
(202) 628-4888
contracts@hrccourtreporters.com

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS

IN	THE	MATTER	OF:	1
)	
SEC	CTION	1 1201)	
RIII	FMA	CING HEA	ARTNG)	,

Remote Roundtable Suite 206 Heritage Reporting Corporation 1220 L Street, N.W. Washington, D.C.

Tuesday, April 20, 2021

The parties met remotely, pursuant to notice, at 10:35 a.m.

PARTICIPANTS:

Government Representatives:

REGAN SMITH, General Counsel of the U.S. Copyright Office
KEVIN AMER, U.S. Copyright Office
NICHOLAS BARTELT, U.S. Copyright Office
STACEY CHENEY, National Telecommunications and Information Administration
BRAD GREENBERG, U.S. Copyright Office

Panelists:

MICHAEL AYERS, DVD CCA and ACS LA
KATHLEEN BURKE, Public Knowledge
CARA GAGLIANO, Electronic Frontier Foundation
STEVE INACKER, Transtate Equipment Company and
Avante Health Solutions
ROBERT KERWIN, International Association of
Medical Equipment Remarketers and Servicers
MARK McHARGUE, Nebraska Farm Bureau
MORGAN REED, ACT | The App Association
KEVIN M. ROSENBAUM, Auto Innovators
KERRY MAEVE SHEEHAN, iFixit
KYLE WIENS, Repair Association
J. MATTHEW WILLIAMS, Joint Creators and Copyright
Owners

1	<u>PROCEEDINGS</u>
2	(10:35 a.m.)
3	MS. SMITH: I'm Reagan Smith, General
4	Counsel of the Copyright Office, and this is our sixth
5	day of hearings for our Section 1201 rulemaking.
6	Today we are focused on Class 12, which concerns
7	various adjustments or proposed expansions to
8	exemptions for purposes of repair.
9	We're really excited that we have a big
10	group today. Thank you for coming. We think we'll
11	have a productive discussion.
12	So to go through logistics for those who
13	might be new, my colleagues and I will moderate this
14	session by posing specific questions. If you wish to
15	respond, probably the easiest way is to use the Zoom
16	"raise hand" button, and we'll try to get through to
17	people in turn. If you're having issues some
18	people have been having issues you can literally
19	wave your hand or signal in the chat.
20	For anyone in the audience or a panelist who
21	has an issue communicating in the chat or the Q&A,
22	we'll alert someone at the Copyright Office to reach
23	out to you to provide technical assistance.
24	For those who are listening or watching as
25	an S-M-B I guess this is the only session for today

- 1 but there is also a link in the chat if you wish to
- 2 sign up for audience participation for tomorrow. That
- 3 is the time for those who maybe didn't sign up for a
- 4 specific panel but wish to provide perhaps up to three
- 5 minutes of their own views as to any of the proposed
- 6 exemptions, and that will be concluding our hearings
- 7 tomorrow.
- 8 And today's event is being recorded. The
- 9 video will be posted to the Copyright Office website.
- 10 I think it's also being livestreamed. We have a court
- 11 reporter transcribing the proceedings, so please try
- to speak slowly and clearly. I know we're all experts
- in virtual communication, so mute yourself if you're
- 14 not speaking.
- 15 And I think before we get started, I'd like
- 16 to ask those from the Government to introduce
- 17 themselves, so maybe Mr. Amer, Mr. Bartelt, and Mr.
- 18 Greenberg from the Copyright Office.
- 19 MR. AMER: Good morning. Kevin Amer, Deputy
- 20 General Counsel.
- 21 MR. BARTELT: Good morning. Nick Bartelt,
- 22 Attorney-Advisor.
- MR. GREENBERG: Good morning. Brad
- 24 Greenberg, Assistant General Counsel.
- MS. SMITH: And, Mr. Cheney, could you

- please introduce yourself?
- 2 MR. CHENEY: Sure. Thank you and good
- 3 morning. My name is Stacey Cheney. I'm a Senior
- 4 Attorney Advisor in the Office of Chief Counsel at
- 5 NTIA, Department of Commerce.
- 6 MS. SMITH: So next, we're just going to do
- 7 short introductions of where you are and what
- 8 organization you may be representing. So I'm going to
- 9 try to go alphabetically, starting with those who are
- 10 here in support of seeing expanded exemptions in some
- 11 form or the other.
- 12 So, Ms. Burke?
- 13 MS. BURKE: I'm Kathleen Burke, and I'm
- 14 representing Public Knowledge.
- MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- Ms. Gagliano?
- MS. GAGLIANO: Cara Gagliano, and I'm
- 18 representing the Electronic Frontier Foundation.
- 19 MS. SMITH: Mr. Inacker?
- MR. INACKER: Steve Inacker, and I'm
- 21 representing Transtate Equipment Company and Avante
- Health Solutions in the medical segment.
- MS. SMITH: Mr. Kerwin?
- 24 MR. KERWIN: Robert Kerwin, General Counsel
- 25 to IAMERS, the International Association of Medical

- 1 Equipment Remarketers and Servicers.
- MS. SMITH: Mr. McHargue?
- 3 MR. McHARGUE: Good morning. Mark McHargue.
- 4 I'm a farmer in Central City, Nebraska representing
- 5 American Farm Bureau.
- 6 MS. SMITH: Ms. Sheehan?
- 7 MS. SHEEHAN: Kerry Sheehan. I am the head
- 8 of U.S. policy at iFixit.
- 9 MS. SMITH: Mr. Wiens?
- 10 MR. WIENS: Kyle Wiens, and I am speaking on
- 11 behalf of The Repair Association.
- 12 MS. SMITH: And now we'll have those who
- have filed in opposition to some or all of the
- 14 proposed adjustments to the exemptions.
- So, Mr. Ayers?
- 16 MR. AYERS: Thank you. Good morning. My
- 17 name is Michael Ayers, and I'm representing the
- 18 Advanced Access Content System Licensing Administrator
- 19 LLC, usually referred to as AACS LA, and DVD CCA --
- 20 DVD Copy Control Association, usually referred to as
- 21 DVD CCA.
- MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- 23 Mr. Reed?
- MR. REED: Hi. My name is Morgan Reed. I'm
- 25 the President of The App Association, and the

- 1 Executive Director of The Connected Health Initiative.
- MS. SMITH: Mr. Rosenbaum?
- 3 MR. ROSENBAUM: Hi. I'm Kevin Rosenbaum,
- 4 and I'm here today representing The Alliance for
- 5 Automotive Innovation, Auto Innovators.
- 6 MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- 7 And, Mr. Williams?
- 8 MR. WILLIAMS: Good morning. Matthew
- 9 Williams, Mitchell, Silberberg & Knupp, representing
- 10 the Joint Creators and Copyright Owners.
- 11 MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- 12 So we have a lot of people here on kind of a
- bigger record for this proposed class, so I want to
- 14 give a short road map of some of the issues, the order
- in which we are hoping to get through some of the
- issues, to make sure we have time to get to it all.
- 17 So first, we are going to address questions
- 18 of the proposed scope of the class, whether it should
- 19 be one exemption or multiple exemptions, which it
- 20 currently is.
- 21 Secondly, some of the proposals to make it
- device-agnostic as well as permit modification of
- devices.
- 24 Next, issues specific to DVD or Blu-Ray
- 25 players, as well as video game consoles.

1	1	We hav	re a	coup	le	of quest	cions	spec	ific	to
2	causation;	then	turi	ning	to	medical	devi	ces;	and	then,

- 3 finally, issues related to vehicles.
- 4 So we'll try to get to everything, and
- 5 certainly some issues are going to be cross-cutting,
- 6 but I thought that might be helpful.
- 7 So I guess to begin, it would be helpful to
- 8 hear either from proponents or opponents with respect
- 9 to some of the proposals by EFF, or iFixit, or The
- 10 Repair Association to sort of broaden and condense the
- 11 two existing regulatory exemptions into a single one
- 12 that is agnostic as to device.
- So we have some precedent for this in an
- exemption for security research, where the Office
- 15 concluded that computer programs can constitute a
- proper class because the use was so tailored.
- 17 Is that helpful for us to look at that in
- 18 connection with repair, or are there different issues
- 19 going on that we should be cognizant of with respect
- 20 to the areas at issue in this exemption? So I saw Ms.
- 21 Sheehan first.
- Please go ahead.
- 23 MS. SHEEHAN: So I think that's a great
- analogy. I think similar to how we think about
- 25 security research, where we're talking about repair,

- 1 the purpose of the use is consistently non-infringing,
- and the use of the software is virtually identical.
- 3 If the purpose of repair is to restore the device to
- 4 functionality and all of that, that's a fair use, and
- 5 it's non-infringing also under 117.
- 6 Continuing with the Office's path of limited
- 7 exemption categories that are kind of device
- 8 restricted or limited to certain narrow categories of
- 9 devices really makes it difficult for these exemptions
- 10 to keep up with the increasing number of software-
- 11 enabled devices with technological protection
- measures.
- So from a purely practical level, if we
- continue on this route, we're going to be -- us,
- 15 iFixit, The Repair Association, EFF, and other
- 16 individual users and organizations and advocates are
- 17 going to be coming back every three years with a new
- 18 roster of devices as the world of software-enabled
- 19 devices continues to explode.
- 20 And part of the problem that we see with
- 21 some of these narrow categories is that sometimes it's
- 22 unclear whether a device sits in one category or
- another. Is a headphone a wearable? Is it something
- 24 else? What about a smart watch?
- 25 So the categories don't kind of keep up with

- 1 market realities, or how products are marketed, or how
- 2 many functions they have, and we just have a
- 3 proliferation of these devices. So three years ago,
- 4 we weren't really looking at a bunch of smart light
- 5 bulbs, but now we are, and that's just going to
- 6 increase going forward.
- 7 And I'll say that similarly to the exemption
- 8 for encryption research and security research, when
- 9 we're talking about looking at this broad category of
- 10 devices, for each of these devices, the purpose is
- 11 still non-infringing, and the copyright analysis is
- 12 the same. The purpose is repair. Repair is non-
- infringing. And that doesn't differ between whether
- it's a phone, or a tractor, or a light bulb, or a
- 15 smart litter box.
- MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- 17 So I'll call on you next, Ms. Gagliano, but
- 18 one thing to pick out -- I thought Ms. Sheehan is
- 19 stressing the purpose being shared, but I wonder if
- 20 you could also address whether there is a similar
- 21 causation effect. So do the TPMs work in the same
- 22 way?
- 23 And another element, of course, for
- considering is the effect on the market for
- copyrighted works and whether or not there's

- 1 sufficient commonalities to assume they're all going
- 2 to have a similar effect.
- 3 MS. GAGLIANO: Yeah. Thank you. So I agree
- 4 with everything that Ms. Sheehan just said, and to
- 5 some of your points would add that, yes, I think that
- 6 the causation issues are very much the same, and the
- 7 effect on the market, and part of that is because like
- 8 security research and that exemption, we're already
- 9 limited to a subcategory of literary works and have
- 10 this specific purpose.
- But not only that, we're limited further.
- 12 It's not all computer programs. It's just firmware,
- embedded software that's controlling the operation of
- 14 physical devices.
- 15 And that unifying feature is what really
- 16 unites the entire class in terms of common issues with
- 17 all of the statutory factors, including market
- 18 effects, because the thing about firmware that's
- 19 unique relative to a lot of other kinds of computer
- 20 programs is that there really isn't a separate market
- 21 for firmware outside of the physical devices it's
- 22 attached to. That is just inherent to the nature of
- firmware. It's what makes it firmware, it is attached
- 24 to, sold with, a specific device.
- 25 And any kind of modified firmware, repaired

- firmware, that's being produced through this exemption
- isn't something that is going to act as a market
- 3 substitute for firmware, because you would still have
- 4 to buy the physical device or otherwise acquire the
- 5 physical device in the first place with that original
- 6 firmware already on it.
- 7 So the copyright owner has already been
- 8 compensated. They aren't selling any fewer copies of
- 9 the firmware, because the number of firmware copies is
- inherently tied to the number of devices sold, and
- 11 modified firmware is useless without that.
- MS. SMITH: Let me ask you one question, and
- then I think I'll move on to make sure everyone has an
- 14 opportunity to wave in. You're using this word
- 15 "firmware," and the two exemptions now discuss
- 16 computer programs that are contained in and control
- 17 the functioning of a lawfully acquired "blah" -- with
- 18 "blah" being what's in dispute.
- Do you think that "contained in" and "control the
- 20 functioning" is synonymous with firmware? Or are you
- 21 sort of narrowing the description a bit more?
- 22 MS. GAGLIANO: I think it is essentially
- 23 synonymous. You know, to the extent that the
- definition you mentioned, "contained in" and
- 25 "controlling the operation of" could be understood to

- 1 be broader. You know, that's really not what we mean.
- We're not talking about like apps. Even if
- 3 you could think in some sense, "Well, an app in some
- 4 way controls the operation of the product," but that's
- 5 not what we're talking about. We're talking about
- 6 what is the industry term of firmware or embedded
- 7 software.
- 8 MS. SMITH: Okay. So it sounds like you
- 9 might not object to an effort to sort of clarify that
- 10 to the extent that might put Mr. Reed, for example, at
- 11 The App Association -- give him a little bit more
- 12 comfort. Is that right?
- MS. GAGLIANO: Sure.
- MS. SMITH: Okay.
- 15 So I think to keep going in order, we'll go
- 16 to Mr. Wiens and Mr. Williams.
- 17 But, Mr. Wiens, I want to press and give you
- 18 the same question I asked Ms. Gagliano, because I
- 19 still think one area -- to take the analogy to other
- 20 exemptions, is we similarly concluded in the unlocking
- 21 process there just weren't other examples of devices
- that needed to be unlocked. There were not TPMs
- 23 effectively controlling access.
- And so that is a question we have here,
- whether there is the same showing of causation or

1	adverge	effects	across	thege	categories,	hecause	if
T	auverse	errects	across	LITESE	categories,	Decause	TT

- there's not TPMs, it doesn't make sense to have a
- 3 regulatory proceeding and sort of make it seem like an
- 4 exemption is needed if one is not, for example.
- 5 And we also want to see whether there are
- other alternatives, even where there may be TPMs. So
- 7 can you provide a little bit more color about the
- 8 other types of devices you think are not being able to
- 9 be accessed, notwithstanding the current exemptions?
- 10 MR. WIENS: Absolutely. Great question.
- 11 What I think is interesting about this is we're
- 12 talking about all of these devices, all kinds of
- different devices. What's sort of amusing to me
- 14 technically about this is that the software, the work
- that we're talking about, is substantially precisely
- 16 the same in all of these cases, even though they're
- 17 different devices. It's Linux.
- 18 Linux is the work that is being protected in
- 19 almost all of these cases, whether it is a nanny cam,
- or a smart coaster, or a industrial SCADA system.
- 21 They are running on Linux. And I like to call the
- 22 internet of things "the internet of outdated Linux
- 23 distributions."
- 24 And what's happening is you hear about all
- of the kind of security problems that we have with the

- 1 internet of things. It's because these devices are
- 2 outdated and not patched. And in response to all of
- 3 the security vulnerabilities that have been found,
- 4 manufacturers are locking these devices down.
- 5 It's interesting that like traditionally,
- 6 the Copyright Office is focused on TPMs, where you
- 7 have a DVD. You have copy protection put on the DVD.
- 8 The copy protection is there to protect the work from
- 9 being copied. In this case, it's generally there to
- 10 prevent malware.
- 11 And so are there TPMs on all of these
- devices? There should be. If a manufacturer is doing
- their job, if it's a nanny cam, you don't want that
- 14 stream ending up on the public internet. You want it
- 15 locked down. If it's a building automation system,
- 16 you don't want anyone on the internet to be able to
- 17 log in and unlock the doors. You need to lock it.
- 18 So I would say the default case is, yeah,
- 19 there are locks. The locks are not intended to
- 20 prevent owners from accessing and modifying and
- 21 unlocking a door in a building automation system. The
- 22 locks are there to prevent unauthorized third parties.
- 23 So if you look at the world of internet-
- 24 connected devices going forward, if I was designing
- them all, if I had sort of my druthers, I would put

- locks on all of them. And I think that you will see,
- 2 sort of the security best practices, that there should
- and will continue to be locks on these devices.
- 4 MS. SMITH: Is there an issue, for example,
- 5 with the SCADA systems of not being able to repair
- 6 them or even lawfully modify them because there's an
- 7 inability to get permission?
- I mean, we had a specific record on that,
- 9 for example, with the security research classes, that
- 10 there was a need to have good-faith security
- 11 researchers on those types of systems, and I don't
- 12 know if we have a similar record in this class of the
- 13 effect of 1201 on non-infringing uses for some of
- these types of devices.
- 15 MR. WIENS: Yeah, we -- so one story that we
- 16 mentioned on the record was a school. This was, I
- 17 think, an elementary school. And the facility's
- 18 maintenance person passed away, and he had the
- 19 password to the whole system. And it turned out that
- 20 this particular system, there was no way to reset that
- 21 password.
- 22 What you had to do was wipe out the
- 23 programming for the entire system and reprogram it,
- 24 which if -- so I've configured some of these building
- 25 systems, and like for our office, it took like a month

- of programming to set it up. It controls the lawn
- 2 sprinklers. It controls timing on the doors, who can
- 3 go in and out. There's different timing settings. If
- 4 someone unlocks the door at 3:00 a.m., different
- 5 security settings go off, and otherwise. It controls
- 6 the air conditioning. In a larger -- like in a
- 7 school, it might control a water treatment system.
- 8 So it is a huge amount of work, so in that
- 9 case, where you need to be able to basically break
- into your own system to change the password, if they
- 11 couldn't do that, you're talking about like probably
- 12 not the kind of repair that could happen in a weekend.
- 13 It might take a professional or someone really good at
- this a week to go in and reprogram everything. So the
- 15 ability to circumvent that would be very important.
- 16 Another example that's personal to me, we
- 17 have a building automation system that only supports
- 18 99 key cards, and we have more than 99 people. We
- 19 need to change it.
- 20 MS. SMITH: Do you know why it only supports
- 21 99 key cards? Is that part of a license?
- MR. WIENS: No, there's no way to pay more.
- 23 The company just doesn't support it. I think it was
- an artificial limit put in by some software engineer.
- I want to find that person and smack them upside the

- 1 head, because it's very frustrating. But it's a
- limit, and I've asked. There's no amount of money
- 3 that we can pay to change it.
- 4 And another thing that I would mention,
- 5 because we're talking about sort of third parties you
- 6 sort of have the branded folks, the folks who maybe
- 7 have been trained by manufacturers to come in and do
- 8 some of this work. We've had extensive experience
- 9 with a lot of these folks and have had repair problems
- 10 with our building automation system that the trained
- 11 service technician from the factory can't figure out.
- 12 They've been out a dozen times and can't figure out
- 13 problems.
- 14 MS. SMITH: And just to make sure I run down
- 15 your example that you provided of the school, you
- 16 can't call someone and say, "You know, the guy who had
- 17 the password has left, can you reset it?" Because I
- 18 think that's something we find ourselves having to do
- 19 with a variety of technology now.
- 20 MR. WIENS: Right. In this case, the system
- just wasn't designed that way. And I think that you
- 22 will find that is fairly common. A lot of these -- I
- 23 mean, particularly -- we're kind of in the early days
- of all of these technologies. A lot of them are
- 25 relatively primitive. And so in this case, the

- 1 software just didn't have that feature. And so the
- 2 factory technician is going to come out and say, "Your
- 3 option is to wipe all the settings or cough up the
- 4 password."
- 5 MS. SMITH: Okay, thank you. So I know you
- 6 talked for a little bit.
- 7 Mr. Williams, you've had your hand up for a
- 8 while. So please feel free to comment on the past
- 9 speakers or any of the issues I've posed.
- 10 MR. WILLIAMS: Yeah, thank you. I mean, I'm
- 11 glad to hear Mr. Wiens acknowledge that the use of
- locks is a best practice, really, with devices across
- industries and is not something to be critical of in
- 14 the abstract.
- 15 And I think your question goes to whether
- 16 all devices are the same or there are distinctions,
- 17 and I think the records over the past few cycles have
- 18 demonstrated that there are distinctions, and you put
- 19 your finger on a few of them with your questioning.
- For video game consoles, for example,
- 21 there's an established consistent record that those
- 22 TPMs are in place to protect security of the devices,
- 23 privacy of users, prevent cheating, but also
- 24 primarily, and importantly, to prevent infringement,
- and that the value of the device firmware is decreased

- 1 by circumvention of these access controls, which
- 2 impacts the fair use analysis and also the 1201
- 3 factors analysis.
- 4 In addition, you've determined there are
- 5 alternatives to circumvention in certain respects with
- 6 respect to repairing video game consoles, and that's
- 7 not consistent across all of the devices that you've
- 8 looked at here. And I think Mr. Wiens's examples just
- 9 show you the wide variety of questions that can come
- 10 up when you go from one device to the other device, or
- 11 to a system.
- 12 Your question was quite good about, "Is that
- a license? Could you pay more for 200 users instead
- of 99 users?" The answer may be very different for
- 15 different situations. And so just focusing on the
- 16 video game console space, I don't think there's
- 17 anything in the record to deviate from prior
- 18 decisions, and I think you've been wise to go at least
- 19 device by device in terms of categories.
- I mean, you haven't been myopically focused
- on individual devices. You have acknowledged that
- there are distinctions between categories of devices,
- and those distinctions can have a lot of import,
- 24 whether it's under 117, or 107, or alternatives to
- 25 circumvention, and so I think that's been the right

- 1 approach.
- 2 And I don't see it as analogous to security
- 3 research. In part, I feel the security research
- 4 exemption has been granted because there's a statutory
- 5 provision that you were building off of, and you felt
- 6 that over time that provision was no longer doing its
- 7 job. You know, whether I agree with that or not, I
- 8 think that's how that progressed in the way it did.
- 9 And I think this is a distinct situation.
- 10 MS. SMITH: Okay. Can I stand you with two
- 11 follow-up questions that are rather pointed and then
- 12 get to everyone?
- So why or why not was it helpful to hear
- 14 suggestions that the proposed exemption is limited to
- 15 so-called firmware or something, Linux specifically?
- 16 Does that help address your concerns at all, or not?
- 17 And if not, why?
- MR. WILLIAMS: No, I don't think limiting it
- 19 to circumventing access controls on firmware would fix
- our concerns, especially in the video game console
- 21 space. When you circumvent those access controls, you
- 22 undermine the security scheme that's in place to do a
- 23 lot of different jobs but, importantly, protect the
- 24 copyright integrity of the system, and so that would
- 25 not fix our concern there.

1	Perhaps if you're in another space
2	printers or litter boxes maybe the firmware doesn't
3	have any other copyright purpose, but I think you've
4	been right to acknowledge in the past that in the
5	video game consoles it does.
6	MS. SMITH: Okay, thank you.
7	Mr. Rosenbaum?
8	MR. ROSENBAUM: Thank you very much. I know
9	we're going to get to vehicles in a different segment,
10	but I just wanted to make the point, sort of following
11	on Matt's point, that there are distinctions,
12	particularly with the automobile industry. My
13	comments address only that industry. We don't have
14	any position on any other devices here.
15	But just, for example, there's no evidence
16	that users of automobiles are having any difficulty
17	getting their automobiles repaired. There's a
18	thriving aftermarket going on. Seventy percent of
19	post-warranty repair work is done by independent
20	repair shops.
21	There's, of course, the MOU under which auto
22	manufacturers are required to provide automobile
23	owners and independent repair shops with the same
24	repair and diagnostic information and tools that are

provided to franchise dealers.

25

1	And then, of course, the other distinction
2	is the auto industry is very highly regulated, and the
3	access controls also protect software that relates to
4	safety and environmental regulations, and those are
5	critical, which the Office recognized in its
6	promulgation of the existing exemption.
7	And so what's at issue here is relaxing some
8	of these important restrictions on the existing
9	exemptions, so I just wanted to point out that there
10	are some real distinctions here with the auto
11	industry.
12	MS. SMITH: Thank you.
13	And I see we have a lot of hands raised.
14	I'm going to keep moving on.
15	So I think, Mr. Ayers, I will go to you
16	next. The one question I'm wondering, and it's maybe
17	part of what you're already prepared to comment upon,
18	is piggybacking off Mr. Rosenbaum bringing vehicles
19	into this, the current exemption for vehicle repair,
20	accepts TPMs protecting works that are accessed on a

expressible content, and that's an approach the Office

has taken to some exemptions, including also saying

that circumvention -- for example, in the jail-

breaking context of audio speakers -- cannot be

subscription service such as radio, sort of

21

22

23

24

25

- 1 accomplished for the purpose of gaining access to
- 2 other copyrighted works.
- 3 And so I think sort of anticipating what you
- 4 might be saying, and also listening to what Mr.
- 5 Williams said, is that an approach that is useful for
- 6 the Office to consider, to sort of carve out the video
- 7 game consoles or DVD or Blu-Ray players, or things
- 8 where the TPM circumvention -- if the record shows it
- 9 will be more likely to have an adverse effect on the
- 10 unlawful distribution of copyrighted works and,
- 11 perhaps the nanny cam?
- 12 MR. AYERS: Thank you. Well, certainly, to
- 13 the extent there's an inclination to grant the
- 14 requested expansions to the exception or to the
- 15 exemption, it's better to have limits than no limits,
- 16 and the concern of my clients is geared towards those
- devices with optical disk drives that play back
- 18 expressive content like DVDs and Blu-Rays, so
- 19 including game consoles.
- 20 So certainly, we still continue to maintain
- 21 our position, but to the extent that there's an
- 22 inclination to go that way, carving out those devices
- 23 certainly relieves the pressure, to a certain extent,
- 24 on my clients.
- 25 And I would just note that a couple of other

- issues that have come up in the comments we've talked
- about that we've had today -- one is what we keep
- 3 calling as a repair exemption. A number of the
- 4 examples in the conversation today and in the comments
- 5 received so far have actually gone well beyond repair
- 6 and have included modification of devices beyond their
- 7 original functionality.
- 8 And one of the concerns that we would have
- 9 would be the extent to which a repair is then geared
- 10 towards changing the functionality of a device, which
- 11 uses AACS or CSS to circumvent those technologies and
- 12 present pirated content in a manner in which it's not
- 13 authorized.
- 14 I would also note that there was also the
- 15 comment that I thought was a very salient one, that
- 16 locks are not always bad, as has already been said,
- and that, certainly, to a large extent, the
- 18 protections on firmware and devices are often to
- 19 protect the users of those devices against intrusions
- 20 by malicious third parties, and that's certainly a
- 21 good thing.
- 22 But also, to piggyback a little bit on other
- 23 comments that have been made, there are other purposes
- for the firmware, and so for instance, in the context
- of DVD and Blu-Ray, the firmware is used to protect

- 1 the decryption -- cryptographic values, and device
- 2 keys, and certificates that are used to render the
- device a good citizen in the entertainment content
- 4 world, making sure that it's a secure platform that's
- 5 available for a content owner to release high-value
- 6 content in that format.
- 7 And to the extent that the ability of the
- 8 device to protect those cryptographic values is
- 9 rendered less, is rendered less effective, it reduces
- 10 the attractiveness of the formats to content owners.
- 11 MS. SMITH: Okay, thank you, Mr. Ayers.
- So I'm going to try to get to everyone who
- hasn't spoken yet, but then go back to you Ms.
- 14 Sheehan, Ms. Gagliano, I understand this is something
- 15 that you wish to respond to.
- 16 So, Ms. Burke, can we piggyback on what Mr.
- 17 Ayers brought up, which is modification? And what are
- 18 your thoughts? You can comment on what some of the
- 19 prior commenters have said, but with respect to video
- 20 game consoles in particular, do you see a need for
- 21 modifications? I'm not sure that's part of what
- 22 Public Knowledge is supporting with respect to video
- 23 game consoles for this exemption.
- MS. BURKE: Yeah. So with respect to
- 25 modification, to the extent that you might need to

- 1 modify the software in order to like repair or relock
- 2 the optical drive once you change it out, I think that
- 3 modification would be potentially necessary, depending
- 4 on what the anti-circumvention technology ends up
- 5 doing.
- 6 I know as an analogy, there are some times
- 7 when you might need to reprogram like in the software,
- 8 like how -- what the function of a button is, and so
- 9 that might require modification. But in terms of
- 10 modification for a functional purpose, not
- 11 modification to allow you to play pirated DVDs.
- 12 And I just want to address that concern
- 13 there, that somehow allowing these -- changing out the
- 14 optical drive and being able to repair that optical
- drive is going to jeopardize the security of the whole
- 16 system: the lock that pairs an optical drive to the
- 17 motherboard exists on the daughterboard connection
- 18 between the two devices. And it's my understanding
- 19 that unlocking that so that you can pair a new optical
- 20 drive is not going to then jeopardize the whole
- 21 ecosystem of a video game console and its security
- 22 protocols.
- 23 So I think that that's something that's
- 24 particularly relevant here, since this idea that all
- of a sudden changing out an optical drive is going to

- 1 make it easier to pirate content. It just doesn't
- 2 seem like that works within the realities of how these
- 3 systems are constructed.
- 4 MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- 5 Mr. Reed?
- 6 MR. REED: Hi, hopefully your cat is getting
- 7 out of the way.
- I think there are a couple things. I want
- 9 to actually note, I agree with Kyle Wiens. I thought
- 10 his use of the concept of unpatched Linux is great,
- and I just think about the GRUB bootloader and the
- 12 problems we've had there.
- But it actually points to the problem,
- Regan, that you hit on exactly, which is any tools
- that you build to go against the TPMs open up a case
- 16 for infringement that's pretty significant.
- 17 You asked a great question, which is if that
- 18 house software or that building software uses as part
- of its marketing "pay this much for 99 users, pay this
- 20 much for 200," in Mr. Wiens's example, there wasn't
- 21 that option. But the tools have to be created in a
- 22 way that would make access to it.
- 23 All of the software that my members are
- 24 making now, we're doing a lot of products that are
- 25 essentially by the sip, right? You right-size your

- 1 product. You right-size the price of your product.
- 2 If the TPMs can be violated, and tools are
- widely available that allow that to be broken through,
- 4 then of course the other modifications that can be
- 5 made are, "Well, I don't want to pay for 200 licenses.
- 6 I'll buy one for one license and I'll use TPM-breaking
- 7 tools to increase that number to 99."
- 8 Our entire app ecosystem business model
- 9 essentially exists on these concepts of right-sizing
- 10 an in-app purchase, a purchase that you make to get
- 11 exactly what you want and not pay more for it. The
- 12 TPMs that are in place, as he noted, for safety and
- 13 security also secure the framework that allow for the
- 14 appropriate licensing and right-sizing of the
- 15 products.
- 16 I think the one other comment that goes
- 17 along with it, though, on the comment we just heard
- 18 about the daughterboard and where the technology
- 19 exists, is valid, but at its core, she's essentially
- 20 saying, "Hey, guys, you need to rewrite your software.
- 21 If you're not doing it this way, then you as an
- industry need to change the way you behave."
- 23 And I don't think that meets the test that
- the Copyright Office is setting. Those of us who are
- writing the products should not be forced to modify

- our software to meet this change that they want. So
- 2 the fact that in some cases the connection is on the
- 3 daughterboard or on the physical device may be
- 4 something that software refers to when checking other
- 5 things.
- 6 So the request here is not just, "We'd like
- 7 to hack it ourselves." Her point was, "Well, you can
- 8 make this real easy change to your software, and if
- 9 you do that, then there won't be a problem." That's a
- 10 bar that the Copyright Office shouldn't be making,
- shouldn't be telling us to change our software in
- order to accommodate someone else's ability to break
- 13 into it.
- MS. SMITH: Can I ask you, while I have you,
- so the way we've structured the current vehicle
- 16 exemption does not extend to TPMs protecting
- 17 subscription services, and you could see sort of a
- 18 similar description of --
- MR. REED: Yep.
- 20 MS. SMITH: -- you know, exceeding terms of
- 21 use, and some of the issues you're talking to. Is
- that a helpful way we can think about these internet
- 23 of things software-embedded devices? Or is there a
- 24 technological reason to suspect that enabling repair
- 25 to the --

759

Т	MR. REED: Right.
2	MS. SMITH: original state is
3	MR. REED: It's a great question.
4	MS. SMITH: going to somehow yeah, go
5	ahead.
6	MR. REED: Yeah, so I'll give an example.
7	One of the problems that we're running into right now
8	is and this gets into TPMs is we can't actually
9	avoid piracy by giving our products away for free.
10	So to your question about can you isolate it
11	into these camps because, well, a TPM that's strictly
12	for this use is bad, we're actually seeing a situation
13	right now where software is developed and distributed
14	for free, ad-supported, where the TPMs are being

So literally, I give my software away for free, and it is being pirated and an additional ad network is being installed underneath it. So your point about well, can we isolate it into a copyright infringing use, that's an example that violates my copyright, but it's not one that has to do with how much I'm charging or where I'm doing it.

broken, and then that software is being hijacked and

an additional ad network is placed underneath it.

15

16

24

25

I'm literally giving my software away for free, and people are still going to break it and use

- 1 it in a way that disadvantages me. So I think to your
- 2 point, I think that obviously what you've done so far
- 3 has worked, but I would be very concerned about any
- 4 expansion of that across multiple sectors, because I
- 5 think it's hard to keep that from breaking into
- 6 harmful uses.
- 7 MS. SMITH: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Reed.
- 8 So, Ms. Gagliano, I think you've had your
- 9 hand up for a while, so whatever -- okay, thank you.
- 10 If you would like to comment on what you had your hand
- 11 raised for as well as particular -- how the Office can
- 12 think about modification as a lawful use across these
- devices, and maybe address some of the comments raised
- 14 about distinguishing between lawful modification on
- 15 the one hand, and the derivative right on the other.
- 16 MS. GAGLIANO: Yeah. So I think in
- 17 particular, responding to what we've been hearing a
- 18 lot of from opponents about how "look, if you let
- 19 people get past these TPMs, they're going to
- infringe, "infringement is going to happen, even if
- 21 that means having to bypass another TPM, which the
- 22 exemption would not permit, even if that means having
- 23 to go another step and do the exemption for purposes
- that the TPM does not permit. I don't think it is
- 25 appropriate for the Office to consider in deciding is

- this an appropriate exemption to consider whether
- 2 people will then break the law and actually go beyond
- 3 the scope of that exemption.
- I mean, you could have said the exact same
- 5 thing about the security research exemption, and I
- 6 think many opponents did. The security research
- 7 exemption applies even to video game consoles, to DVD
- 8 and Blu-Ray players. We haven't heard anything from
- 9 opponents about increased infringement since 2018
- 10 attributable to granting that exemption.
- 11 So when people are using these exemptions,
- 12 it is to do the -- make the non-infringing uses that
- were being adversely affected. And the fact that
- someone might go further and try to say, "Well, this
- exemption protected part of what I did" isn't really
- 16 relevant. It's still assuming that someone is going
- 17 to violate 1201 either way.
- 18 And in terms of the concern that someone
- 19 would -- that a possible modification of the firmware
- 20 would be to make the device changed in a way that
- 21 would enable piracy, one simple tweak to our language
- 22 that would get maybe more at what we actually had in
- 23 mind is saying, for -- it would be circumvention not
- 24 only for purpose of non-infringing modification, in
- 25 which case we mean the actual creation of the

- 1 modification would be non-infringing, but it could
- 2 also be for a non-infringing purpose.
- 3 So the exemption doesn't have to cover
- 4 modifications that would be for the purpose of
- 5 enabling piracy, getting access to other copyrighted
- 6 works. But either way, the exemption is not giving
- 7 anyone permission to circumvent TPMs on any work other
- 8 than software. It's not giving permission to
- 9 circumvent TPMs for the purpose of infringement.
- 10 And we have heard the same argument in every
- 11 rulemaking cycle against many of the exemptions that
- 12 have already been granted, like all the jail-breaking
- 13 exemptions, the past exemptions for vehicles. Last
- 14 year, it was the exemption for repair of certain
- 15 consumer devices and home appliances. Every time,
- opponents say, "This is going to make everyone
- 17 infringe." There's still absolutely no evidence of
- 18 that, and I think the absence of that evidence --
- MS. SMITH: Okay.
- 20 MS. GAGLIANO: -- is a form of evidence
- 21 itself.
- MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- 23 I'm going to try to just keep our comments a
- 24 little bit shorter if we can going forward, to make
- 25 sure we have time to get through everything.

1	Ms. Sheehan, did you want to speak to the
2	question of lawful modification? I know the Office
3	has had some hesitancy in the past to conclude that
4	that's the right defining phrase for that, with level
5	of specificity. We would welcome your thoughts.
6	MS. SHEEHAN: Absolutely. Do you mind if I
7	also address a couple of your earlier questions? So
8	I'll start with your first question about the
9	causation issue, your question about whether there are
10	TPMs in every software-enabled device, and to the
11	extent that those obstruct repair.
12	And I would say that if there's not a TPM in
13	a device, it's not part of this conversation about the
14	exemption. So the scope of the exemption is only for
15	circumvention of TPMs that exist in a software-enabled
16	device and that obstruct repair. Right? So the fact
17	that some devices might not have TPMs, the fact that
18	those devices exist, doesn't obviate the need for
19	circumvention where TPMs do obstruct repair. So,
20	first question.
21	Second, I'd like to address what some of the
22	other panelists have talked about in terms of devices
23	that play back A/V or expressive content, and I'll say
24	that as Ms. Gagliano very correctly identified, that
25	the subject of this exemption is the software. It's

- 1 the embedded software in the device. It is the
- 2 firmware. It is not the copy controls on the content,
- 3 and it is not the TPMs that protect that content from
- 4 infringement.
- 5 Furthermore, repair of devices that play
- 6 lawfully acquired copies of expressive content
- 7 increases the accessibility to both the functionality
- 8 of the software and the lawful performance of those
- 9 lawfully acquired works. And the only purpose for the
- 10 circumvention that is acknowledged and permitted
- 11 within the exemption is for repair.
- So an exemption like this, as Ms. Burke, as
- 13 Ms. Gagliano said, would not authorize circumvention
- 14 for the purposes of piracy, so on and so forth. And I
- 15 think the Office itself has acknowledged that in the
- 16 2018 Recommendation when it addressed expressive
- 17 content on vehicle infotainment and telematics
- 18 systems.
- 19 And so the concerns about piracy in those
- 20 contexts related primarily to abuses of circumvention
- 21 that are outside the scope of the proposed exemption,
- and I'd say that's true here as well.
- In terms of alternatives, Mr. Williams
- 24 raised the specter of alternatives to circumvention,
- and I'll say that the existence of alternatives to

- 1 circumvention is not fatal to prior exemptions and
- 2 shouldn't be fatal here. The Office granted the
- 3 motorized land vehicle exemption despite the existence
- 4 of other alternatives, and we know that those
- 5 alternatives often prove inadequate. That's fully
- 6 documented in our record.
- 7 But I'll also state that in Chamberlain, the
- 8 Federal Circuit decided that section 1201 did not
- 9 grant copyright holders another exclusive right. It
- only protected the exclusive rights that they already
- 11 had under 106. And so section 1201 does not give
- 12 copyright holders the right to control the market for
- 13 repair services, and the right to require that you use
- 14 their own branded repair services.
- To deny an exemption on the basis of the
- 16 existence of those manufacturer-branded alternatives
- 17 would be to grant a new right, would be a grant of new
- 18 right to exercise anti-competitive practices and
- 19 control an entire market.
- 20 Moving on to the question of --
- 21 MS. SMITH: Can I ask you, just on that one
- 22 --
- MS. SHEEHAN: Yeah.
- 24 MS. SMITH: Just on that one point before we
- get to modification, do you think it's relevant

- 1 whether there's an additional charge or terms or
- 2 something connected to repair, or whether it's sort of
- 3 open in terms of the purchase for the initial license?
- 4 MS. SHEEHAN: I don't understand your
- 5 question. Do you mind rephrasing?
- 6 MS. SMITH: Well, I guess you've expressed
- 7 concern about a branded repair market, and I guess
- 8 we're looking at this through the 1201 lens and
- 9 whether there's an adverse effect created by TPMs. Did
- 10 you think it's relevant whether there's conditions
- 11 imposed upon the manufacturer-provided repair, or --
- MS. SHEEHAN: Absolutely.
- 13 MS. SMITH: -- or it doesn't matter?
- 14 MS. SHEEHAN: No, absolutely. And I think
- that goes to the kind of tangible, practical adverse
- 16 impact on users of software-enabled devices. You
- 17 know, in our experience, we talk to repair shops,
- 18 we're kind of deep into the repair industry over at
- 19 iFixit and the Repair Association.
- 20 And our experience with manufacturer-branded
- 21 repair is that the types of repairs that they can
- 22 carry out are limited, meaning if I take a tractor to
- the John Deere dealership, they can only do certain
- 24 repairs. If I take my iPhone to an Apple-authorized
- 25 repair provider or an Apple IRP provider, they can

- only do simple, basic repairs before they either
- 2 encourage me to buy a new device or have to send it
- 3 back to Apple.
- 4 Some manufacturer-branded services may be
- 5 extremely costly, more expensive than an independent,
- 6 and in the medical device sector, it was found that
- 7 manufacturer-branded medical device repair could cost
- 8 30 to 50 percent more than an independent service
- 9 organization's repair. It can also involve long
- 10 delays if you have to schedule or ship a product back
- to a manufacturer, and in some circumstances, you
- might not be able to get a repair at all.
- 13 So Kyle mentioned earlier our kind of
- industrial premises control systems. We are
- 15 completely outside of a service network for our
- 16 manufacturer on some of those systems, and so if we
- 17 were to depend on manufacturer-branded repair
- 18 services, we would be completely out of luck.
- MS. SMITH: Okay, thank you.
- MS. SHEEHAN: Is it okay if I address
- 21 modification?
- 22 MS. SMITH: And modification.
- 23 MS. SHEEHAN: Ok yeah. So I just wanted to
- 24 say briefly, I think Ms. Gagliano addressed that
- 25 pretty well, extremely well, and I would just say that

- in Sega v. Accolade, the Court found that modification
- of a software-enabled device is not infringing,
- 3 especially when it is a reasonable step to a
- 4 transformative use such as repair.
- 5 So when a modification is carried out for
- 6 the purposes of repair or for other non-infringing
- 7 uses, then it should also be understood as non-
- 8 infringing.
- 9 Can I say one --
- 10 MS. SMITH: Okay.
- MS. SHEEHAN: -- more thing? Just one more
- 12 quick -- I'll be quick, I promise.
- MS. SMITH: Extremely limited, because I do
- 14 see a lot of hands raised and we've got to move on.
- MS. SHEEHAN: Okay.
- MS. SMITH: Extremely quickly.
- 17 MS. SHEEHAN: I just wanted to respond
- 18 really briefly to both Mr. Williams's and Mr. Reed's
- 19 comments about the necessity of TPMs to prevent
- 20 cheating, to protect privacy, or to protect safety and
- 21 emissions, and I would say that absolutely none of
- those things are part of the Copyright Office's very
- 23 copyright-based inquiry on whether a 1201 exemption
- should be granted.
- 25 And I'd actually be interested to know

- whether the clients that Mr. Williams and Mr. Reed
- 2 represent are actually using 1201 to go after people
- 3 for cheating, or violating emissions controls, or
- 4 violating a user's privacy, because I'm unaware of any
- 5 cases like that.
- 6 MS. SMITH: Okay, thank you.
- 7 Mr. McHargue?
- 8 MR. McHARGUE: Well, thank you. I just want
- 9 to remind people that I am a farmer. I'm not an
- 10 attorney. So this is a very interesting conversation
- 11 to me. You know, on our farm, one of the things that
- we're really concerned about -- someone mentioned the
- use of tools.
- 14 And as our ag equipment gets more
- 15 complicated -- every day, it seems like -- there's an
- 16 increasing need to have users, or I'd say third-party
- 17 experts, develop a tool that can work on my tractor.
- 18 I know there's difficulties, in our area anyway, that
- 19 the dealerships or the authorized dealerships say they
- 20 will provide tools, but they're really not the tools
- 21 to the extent that we can come in and actually fix our
- 22 equipment back to actually operating state. And so I
- 23 just wanted to say that that was one of the things
- that we're concerned about in the ag sector.
- 25 The other thing is there was a conversation

- 1 about modification that may not quite fit into this
- 2 category, but we're clear at American Farm Bureau that
- 3 if there's modification that involves environmental or
- 4 safety issues, I think we have to be very careful when
- 5 we start going down that route. If we're talking
- 6 about things that we can improve potentially -- but we
- 7 have to be very careful when it gets into
- 8 environmental and safety issues.
- 9 MS. SMITH: Thank you. I appreciate your
- 10 thoughts.
- 11 So I think the next person who had their
- hand raised is Mr. Ayers, but given our time, I'm also
- going to shift some of the questioning to my
- 14 colleague, Mr. Amer, so that we can wrap up
- 15 modification discussion but seque into some of the
- 16 device-specific categories of the media players or the
- 17 video game consoles.
- 18 So, I don't know, Mr. Amer, if you wanted to
- 19 pose any additional questions, but I do think it is
- 20 Mr. Ayers's turn to respond.
- 21 MR. AMER: Yes. Well, actually, my first
- 22 question was going to be about DVD players anyway.
- 23 So maybe, Mr. Ayers, you could speak to
- this. So I wanted to sort of make sure I understand
- what seems to be kind of a factual dispute,

- 1 potentially, about what the TPMs protecting firmware
- 2 in DVD players controls access to.
- 3 So I know that the proponents have said that
- 4 their proposed exemption would apply only to software
- 5 that controls the operation of the device and would
- 6 not permit circumvention of separate TPMs that protect
- 7 access to the DRM-protected media.
- Now, today, earlier on, you talked about, I
- 9 think, the cryptographic values that exist in DVD
- 10 players, and I think you said something about if those
- 11 are altered, that makes the device sort of a less
- 12 attractive platform for manufacturers. Could you sort
- 13 of elaborate and explain a little more, explain sort
- of what these cryptographic values protect and what
- 15 they don't protect?
- 16 MR. AYERS: Sure. Thank you. So the
- 17 concept with content protection technology in consumer
- 18 electronics devices in the entertainment content space
- is that the content owner and the device manufacturer
- are both engaged in an ecosystem where the content
- owner is sufficiently trustful, finds the target
- device sufficiently trustworthy, that the content
- owner will release its high-value content in the
- 24 format played by that device.
- In the context of movies on optical disk,

that includes authoring and manufacturing the movie

- 2 and the disk with certain cryptographic values that
- 3 are used to encrypt the movie. Corresponding
- 4 cryptographic values such as device keys are embedded
- 5 in the device by the manufacturer during the
- 6 manufacturing process that are then used to decrypt
- 7 the content on those disks.
- 8 So you put the disk in the machine. The
- 9 machine has decryption keys that allow it to decrypt
- 10 the content on the disk that has been encrypted with
- 11 the encryption keys. So this provides a benefit for
- 12 consumers, as has been mentioned in other hearings.
- 13 DVD was one of the most successful consumer
- 14 electronics products in history, in the history of
- 15 consumer products, and it certainly laid the
- 16 groundwork for commercial success for multiple
- industries since then.
- 18 But to the extent that those devices become
- 19 compromised and are no longer able to be trusted, it
- 20 presents a problem for the content owners in investing
- 21 a ton of money in very high-value content such that
- 22 it's no longer as good an investment, because the
- 23 content is less secure.
- 24 And certainly folks might look at, "Well,
- 25 they're movie studios. They have a lot of money

- 1 anyway." And I think the idea here is look, these are
- 2 investments of significant resources both on the
- 3 device side and on the content side to make sure that
- 4 this all works together, so that the end result is an
- 5 extremely attractive proposition for the consumer.
- 6 And so to the extent that this compromises it, we have
- 7 less of an attractive setting.
- 8 And just a quick follow up on an earlier
- 9 comment.
- 10 MR. AMER: Well could I just follow up on
- 11 that --
- MR. AYERS: Sure.
- 13 MR. AMER: -- first, though? So are you
- saying that if someone were to circumvent TPMs
- 15 protecting the firmware on a DVD player, that would
- 16 necessarily expose these cryptographic keys you're
- 17 talking about, and it would therefore allow people to
- 18 play unauthorized DVDs?
- 19 MR. AYERS: That's essentially the concern.
- 20 I mean, the exact way that each device manufacturer
- 21 implements the storage of the applicable cryptographic
- 22 values is somewhat flexible to allow for the realities
- of device manufacturing in different contexts, but
- that's the essential concern.
- 25 And in that case, what you've done is when

- 1 the key is exposed, you're no longer looking at
- 2 onesie-twosie situation where you may be compromising
- 3 a movie at a time, which is itself not desirable at
- 4 all, but because it's a decryption key that could
- 5 decrypt any DVD or any Blu-Ray disk, it potentially
- 6 endangers the entire ecosystem, because now you've
- 7 enabled a circumvention tool for the high-value
- 8 entertainment content.
- 9 MR. AMER: Okay.
- 10 Ms. Burke, could you respond to that?
- 11 MS. BURKE: Yes. It's our understanding
- that the limited request that we've asked for, which
- is the exemption to unlock an optical drive, replace
- it, and then relock that pairing, would not cause that
- 15 kind of decryption of what protects the Blu-rays and
- 16 the DVDs at question here.
- 17 Rather, I think it's important to note that
- 18 this TPM that locks and pairs an optical drive to the
- 19 rest of the video game console is unique to these
- 20 optical-drive-driven video game consoles. Other
- 21 devices that have optical drives don't necessarily
- 22 have these same locks. So if you wanted to replace
- 23 your optical drive in your computer, you could go get
- 24 a new optical drive, put it in your computer, and plug
- it in, and change it out pretty simply, without having

1 to circumvent this kind of TPM.

So these optical drives, being able to change them out doesn't really implicate the same concerns when it comes to that type of a situation, with being able to change out your optical drive. So what makes a video game console so unique? It's our understanding that these TPMs that are protecting the optical drive don't actually protect the content that could be played on an optical drive. Rather, it just protects this particular pairing.

And so the TPMs that need to be circumvented here they're really just protecting or preventing people from being able to repair an optical drive, which is a harm to consumers, because optical drives are the most frequent thing to fail in a video game console. Replacing one is fairly cheap, as opposed to having to purchase a whole new device.

And so it's our understanding that these

TPMs really aren't protecting content so much as they

are preventing these types of repairs which consumers

have a right to do. When you own a device, you should

be able to repair it, and copyright should not be a

tool that prevents you from being able to do that.

It's not intuitive, and it doesn't make sense with

regard to what copyright is intended to protect.

1	MR. AMER: Okay, thank you.
2	I think, Mr. Cheney, do you have a question?
3	MR. CHENEY: Thank you. I think this has
4	been a helpful discussion, and I think it's been
5	helpful for me to hear this a little bit on these game
6	systems and DVD players.
7	For example, one of the questions I had with
8	these cryptographic values that potentially are
9	exposed or may be misused, can you describe what that
10	might be like in the sort of repair that has just been
11	described?
12	I think, Mr. Ayers, you may have the best
13	answer here. Are they allowed to be copied and
14	reproduced? I mean, what is the possible path to
15	piracy here if they are, indeed, exposed in this
16	repair? Is it on the device itself, or is it
17	something that would be a broader piracy possibility?
18	Can you describe that a little bit more?
19	Because I'm not sure I'm getting where that value gets
20	exposed here. Can you help me out here? Thanks.
21	MR. AYERS: Yes, thank you. So it is in the
22	broader context that we're most concerned about this.
23	So when the device key, we'll call it, is extracted,
24	is exposed and extracted from a particular device,
25	that key can then be incorporated into for instance

- 1 a software circumvention tool, and that is essentially
- 2 how various of the current unauthorized circumvention
- 3 tools operate today.
- 4 They use stolen keys that have been taken
- 5 out of otherwise legitimate products, and then those
- 6 device keys are incorporated into a circumvention
- 7 tool, usually a software product. That then we're now
- 8 not talking about one device being able to play back
- 9 any movie that it wants to, which it was already able
- 10 to do because it had a device key in it in the first
- 11 place, but it's now enabling a whole market full of
- 12 circumvention tools in the form of software that
- provides a much bigger avenue for piracy than might
- 14 have been possible with that single device.
- MR. CHENEY: Thank you, Mr. Ayers.
- 16 Does anyone else have some input on that
- 17 particular question? And particularly, does this
- 18 repair on those players expose those cryptographic
- 19 keys? And I understand potentially how it might get
- out there, but if that can help direct the question.
- 21 Thanks.
- 22 Mr. Reed, I think I see your hand, if that's
- okay.
- MR. REED: Yeah. I'll just add this. So
- while everyone was talking, I just put into my Google

- 1 search engine "hack my Xbox drive." Here's the one
- 2 that comes up first: "Flash the light on disk drive
- 3 used by some Xbox consoles for hacking. If you're
- 4 tired of paying \$60 for a new Xbox game or waiting
- 5 years for them to get cheaper, you should probably mod
- 6 your system."
- 7 That's literally the first thing that comes
- 8 up, and it goes through and has a video of how you
- 9 actually flash the drive by installing a different DVD
- 10 player into your box, and flash the drive to allow you
- 11 to play disks that violate the copyright.
- 12 So at the core of your question, "Is this a
- vector by which people can use it, "well, literally
- that's the first thing that comes up on your Google
- 15 search when you put in "hack your Xbox drive." So
- 16 whether or not we can talk about which case law
- 17 applies, the search engine bar will tell you how
- 18 quickly and easily it's there and why that is a
- 19 primary vector.
- 20 So you know, in this case, Google is your
- 21 friend. Find the answer, hack your drive, flash it,
- and run disks that you want to play for less than 60
- 23 bucks. It's right there. First output.
- MR. AMER: Okay.
- So we have lots of hands up. So I'm going

- 1 to try to get to everybody, and I would ask everybody
- 2 to just be relatively brief.
- 3 Mr. Wiens, maybe you could go next.
- 4 MR. WIENS: Sure. I would encourage Mr.
- 5 Reed to go ahead and give that site \$60, and then
- 6 they're going to sell your credit card number on the
- 7 black net. It's a scam. There isn't such a hack.
- 8 There are a lot of wonderful sites that will
- 9 like trick you and make you think that they will help
- 10 you hack your Xbox. They will happily take your
- 11 credit card number and then not help you hack your
- 12 Xbox. The Xbox One, the PlayStation 4, PlayStation 5
- haven't been cracked, so that's a non-issue.
- 14 I think that if you think about this in the
- 15 context of what you can do with a P.C., a Blu-ray
- 16 drive on a P.C., we have the ability to do the work on
- 17 those. It's not implicating or creating any
- 18 challenges.
- 19 You know, those encryption keys are on the
- 20 drive. They're fine. That's not what we want to
- 21 access. All we want to be able to do is restore the
- 22 device back to functionality. And I would note that
- 23 functionality -- from my perspective, the device isn't
- 24 repaired unless the copy protection is restored. Like
- 25 we don't want to remove the copy protection. We want

- 1 to get the device working exactly as it did from the
- 2 factory.
- 3 So when these devices are provisioned in the
- 4 factory, in the Xbox or the PlayStation factory, they
- 5 take an off-the-shelf drive, install it in the
- 6 machine. They run a software tool that pairs that
- 7 optical drive to the machine. That's all that we want
- 8 to do, is just do that pairing. You know, I think
- 9 that this has gotten more complicated than it really
- 10 is. We just want to fix the thing.
- MR. AMER: Okay.
- 12 Mr. Inacker, I think you've been waiting.
- 13 MR. INACKER: Thank you. Similar to Mr.
- McHargue, I am not a lawyer, and I have found this
- 15 conversation very, very interesting. But talk about
- 16 Xboxes and DVDs and everything else is very
- interesting, but we are all consumers of health care.
- Our businesses that we have within Avante
- 19 Health Solutions -- we repair vital medical equipment,
- 20 and we do it as independent service organizations.
- 21 And as all of us as consumers of health care, it
- 22 should be of great value for you to understand that we
- do it much more responsibly, much more safely, and, in
- 24 many cases, much, much more cost effectively than the
- original equipment manufacturers do.

- 1 Yet they have put restrictions in place
- 2 through these TPMs to prevent us from being able to
- 3 service it. No different than your automobile, no
- 4 different than your agriculture equipment. We need to
- 5 have the right to repair the equipment for our
- 6 customers and have access to do so on a readily
- 7 available basis.
- 8 This is a patient safety issue. When we
- 9 can't get access to the equipment that we need to
- 10 service, patients wait. When an MRI is down, or a
- 11 C.T. is down, or a cath lab is down, or a piece of
- diagnostic equipment is not working, patients have to
- 13 wait, and that harms their care.
- MR. AMER: I just want to --
- 15 MR. INACKER: Vital issue for our industry.
- 16 MR. AMER: I appreciate it. I want to stop
- 17 you there because I wanted to ask about DVDs and video
- 18 game consoles. We're going to get to medical devices
- in just a little bit. So hold that thought, if you
- 20 would.
- Let's go to Mr. Williams.
- 22 MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you very much. A lot's
- 23 been said, but I'll try to stay brief. So the video
- 24 game consoles, as Mr. Ayers mentioned, have some of
- 25 the same concerns with respect to keys, because they

- 1 play disks with motion pictures on them. But they
- also have the concerns that you've identified in
- 3 previous proceedings related to either installing and
- 4 playing illegal copies of games or using illegal
- 5 disks, and I appreciate Mr. Reed's comments on that.
- 6 You know, one difficulty from the comments
- 7 that we have is that there's no real specifics about
- 8 the procedures that they say they can implement to
- 9 repair or replace the optical drives. They seem to
- 10 lay out two scenarios. One is using an application of
- 11 some sort to flash the device, and one is a more
- 12 manual procedure.
- Going back to, I believe, all the way to
- 14 2012, the Office has concluded that there has not been
- 15 evidence that you cannot replace or repair an optical
- 16 drive without circumvention, and so depending on the
- 17 different approaches that they take, there may be
- 18 alternatives to circumvention here.
- 19 The other issue is they say that they will
- 20 restore all of the functionality of the TPMs, but
- there's no explanation of exactly how that's going to
- 22 happen either, and my understanding is that this is of
- 23 concern to the console manufacturers, not only whether
- 24 they can actually restore the functionality to its
- original state, but also that the use of an

- 1 application to open up the system for the purpose of
- 2 replacing or repairing the optical disk drive could
- 3 lead to the use of unauthorized applications or disks.
- 4 Just very quickly, Ms. Sheehan asked about
- 5 cases where the industries have pursued issues under
- 6 1201. I think you know there are quite a number, but
- 7 in the video game space two of the biggest names are
- 8 the MDY case and Davidson v. Jung. They go all the
- 9 way to the appellate level. And so 1201 has been
- 10 enforced, including by the Department of Justice, and
- there's a case in our comments on that.
- 12 MR. AMER: Let me just jump in.
- 13 MR. WILLIAMS: The harm to consumers here is
- 14 not from the manufacturers.
- MR. AMER: Mr. Williams, could I just jump
- 16 in? Could I just jump in? Because I wanted to ask
- 17 about something you said earlier. Because there does
- 18 seem to be, again, this factual question about
- 19 restoring the TPMs.
- 20 So I believe it was Public Knowledge's reply
- 21 comments that said a video game console will only
- 22 function if the two portions of the console unlocked
- 23 by repair, the motherboard and the optical drive, are
- 24 relocked. Is there any dispute about that? They seem
- 25 to be saying that in order for a repaired video game

- 1 console, at least with respect to the optical drive,
- 2 to work at all going forward, you have to restore the
- 3 TPMs. Do you have any information on that?
- 4 MR. WILLIAMS: So to my understanding, it
- 5 may depend on what your definition of "function" is.
- 6 If you want to restore it to full functionality, to
- 7 where it is capable of interacting with authentication
- 8 servers, et cetera, that may be true.
- 9 Without repairing those TPMs, whether you
- 10 could still play offline infringing games, I think's a
- 11 different question. If you gave me a post-hearing
- 12 letter on that, I could probably give you more
- 13 specifics, and it may be different from console to
- 14 console, the exact answer. But that's my
- 15 understanding.
- MR. AMER: Okay.
- 17 Ms. Gagliano, I think you've been waiting.
- MS. GAGLIANO: Yeah. I just wanted to
- 19 respond to a point Mr. Ayers was making about the DVD
- 20 and Blu-ray context, saying that even if the exemption
- itself doesn't permit piracy within its scope, that
- the movie studies, the content providers just knowing
- that people are allowed to circumvent the TPM, and
- 24 that that would make the system less secure, would be
- less willing to license their content for release on

- 1 DVD and Blu-ray, which is a little confusing to me,
- 2 because I think we all know DVD CCA and AACS LA even
- 3 brought up in their opposition comments DeCSS, the
- 4 still widely available program for decrypting DVDs.
- 5 And since at least 2007, the decryption keys
- 6 for Blu-Ray encryption have also been out there widely
- 7 publicly available, you know. It may be not be legal
- 8 to distribute and use these, but it also would not be
- 9 legal to be bypassing the content protection TPMs
- 10 under the proposed exemption.
- 11 And I have not seen or heard any evidence
- that since those keys have become publicly available
- through various means that there actually has been any
- decrease in content providers' willingness to license
- their works for release on DVD and Blu-ray. So I just
- 16 don't think that point really seems to hold up based
- on what we know from the real world.
- MR. AMER: Mr. Ayers, do you have a
- 19 response?
- 20 MR. AYERS: Thank you very much. And
- 21 actually, part of why I had my hand up was to address
- the earlier comment that was made, that there's no
- 23 evidence of increased piracy. Just I would note that
- 24 specifically in the game console space, one of the
- 25 most popular platforms for the playback of

- 1 unauthorized content is an application that's a direct
- descendant of early efforts to hack and modify the
- 3 Xbox console.
- 4 And similar to the Google search we were
- 5 introduced to a little earlier in the conversation, a
- 6 similar search regarding this product will yield the
- 7 result that yes, the distribution of the playback
- 8 platform itself is -- we'll make comments about not
- 9 pirating content. However, every single reference you
- 10 find in association with that platform in a Google
- 11 search talks about getting free movies and T.V. And
- so we see the technical compliance effort versus the
- 13 real world in that case.
- 14 And to address the more recent comment about
- 15 what action has been taken, actually, action has been
- 16 taken. And while certainly my clients are not ones to
- 17 seek the limelight and do perp walks, for instance, in
- 18 cases like this, there are certainly efforts that are
- 19 taken. A successful content protection effort
- 20 involves technical elements as well as legal elements,
- 21 and my clients have pursued both in a number of cases.
- 22 And then to look at the content industry as
- 23 "because it still continues to release Blu-rays as
- therefore it must not be a problem, " I think is a
- 25 gross oversimplification of how the market works in

- 1 this case, and the realities of content distribution.
- 2 MR. AMER: Mr. Wiens?
- 3 MR. WIENS: I just wanted to make myself
- 4 available if you have additional technical questions
- on like where the encryption keys are stored and how
- 6 that works.
- 7 MR. AMER: Well, do you have any information
- 8 that you could offer on this question of the need to
- 9 relock video game consoles if you're repairing the
- 10 optical drive?
- 11 MR. WIENS: Yeah, the game console would not
- work to play off-the-shelf games unless you restore
- 13 the TPM, unless you restore its ability to have those
- 14 keys and to have that communication, right? Because
- if I buy Call of Duty, it's encrypted. So that's all
- 16 we want to do, is keep it in place.
- 17 And I think that the point that the Blu-ray
- 18 keys have already been leaked is poignant, because
- 19 we're talking about not allowing people to get in and
- 20 access something. Well, that secret is already out
- 21 there. The criminals are doing the criminal activity.
- 22 What we're saying is we just want to be able to do the
- 23 legal activity.
- 24 And I would say like the market harm here is
- 25 real. I have an entire shelf full of about a hundred

- 1 PS4 optical drives and main boards, and we have to
- 2 sell those together. So I have to take main board and
- 3 an optical drive, sell it as an expensive part. We
- 4 are completely supply constrained. The number of
- 5 people out there that can fix their game consoles is
- 6 completely limited to the number of game consoles that
- 7 end up at recyclers.
- Then those two pieces together both work,
- 9 and we can get out there. So it's like there are
- 10 maybe hundreds of people a quarter that can fix their
- own game consoles when, in the market, there are
- millions of people that potentially have these
- problems. So this is a very real and kind of dire
- 14 problem. Every time I talk with a repair
- 15 professional, I mention the game console thing. They
- 16 just get sad.
- 17 MR. AMER: Okay. Thank you.
- 18 Let's go to Ms. Sheehan and Ms. Burke
- 19 quickly, and then I think we'll move to another
- 20 question.
- 21 MS. SHEEHAN: I just wanted to endorse what
- 22 Ms. Gagliano and Mr. Wiens had said. On one side of
- 23 the scale, it's a little bit late for hand-wringing
- over access to decryption keys, as Ms. Gagliano and
- 25 Mr. Wiens said. The horse is kind of out the barn

- door with that. They're widely available. And
- 2 restricting people from being able to repair their
- 3 consoles isn't going to protect them any more.
- I think one thing to note, to recognize
- 5 there, is that people who are going to infringe
- 6 copyright deliberately or who are going to hack their
- 7 consoles in order to infringe copyright are already
- 8 doing that. They're not waiting for a 1201 repair
- 9 exemption to be able to do that.
- 10 The lack of a repair exemption to 1201 only
- 11 really impacts people who are interested in doing the
- lawful activity of repair. And in this case, we're
- talking about really just replacing an optical drive
- on a machine where the optical drive is broken, and
- then reenabling the TPM protection there. So we just
- 16 want to fix our consoles.
- 17 And as I mentioned before, we talk to repair
- 18 shops all around the country and all around the world,
- 19 and we talk to folks who specialize in video game
- 20 repair, and they tell us that they have storage rooms
- 21 full of hundreds of consoles that they've been unable
- 22 to fix for their customers, because without the
- ability to replace a broken optical drive on its own,
- the repairs are too costly, too risky, and the parts
- 25 are too hard to find.

1	MR. AMER: Thank you.
2	Ms. Burke?
3	MS. BURKE: Yeah. I just wanted to echo
4	what Ms. Sheehan and Mr. Wiens and Ms. Gagliano have
5	said here today. What's interesting here is that the
6	conversation that Mr. Reed had earlier about people
7	pirating games even that they had given away for free,
8	and the wide availability of these decryption keys,
9	kind of demonstrates that these locks aren't
10	preventing pirates from pirating. They're not
11	preserving the copyright of these creative works.
12	What they are actually doing is they are
13	preventing law-abiding citizens who want to do law-
14	abiding things such as repair their devices. And so I
15	think like that's particularly relevant when looking
16	at this exemption request, that what we're asking for
17	is an exemption for a limited purpose, to perform a
18	repair. We are not asking for an exemption to pirate
19	content.
20	And the underlying work that is being
21	protected by this TPM, it isn't the movies on the Blu-
22	rays or the DVDs, or even on the video game disks.
23	It's the software, the firmware that is controlling
24	this lock itself. So I think that's also particularly
25	relevant here when we're talking about like what

1	copyright work is actually being protected here with
2	this lock on the optical drive to the motherboard.
3	So there's just this over the concerns
4	about piracy here feel more like fearmongering as
5	opposed to actual realities of what is at stake.
6	MR. AMER: Okay. So thank you.
7	That raises an issue that I wanted to follow
8	up on quickly, and then I think we'll move to the next
9	topic, and it's this idea of sort of the relevance of
LO	what the purpose of the circumvention is, and I'm
L1	interested in particularly the opponents' response to
L2	this.
L3	So I mean one argument that I think we've
L4	heard today from the proponents is that the existing
L5	temporary exemptions, for example, for security
L6	research and jail-breaking, and also the permanent
L7	exemptions for things like security testing and
L8	encryption research, all refer to the purpose of the
L9	circumvention, right?
20	They turn on whether the circumvention is
21	undertaken for an accepted purpose. So you know,
22	certainly with the vehicle repair portion of this
23	exemption, we've included language that tries to state
24	clearly that the circumvention may not be undertaken

for the purpose of gaining access to other types of

25

- 1 works.
- I wonder if that approach -- the opponents
- 3 seem to be saying that approach is not sufficient here
- 4 and that DVD players and video game consoles are sort
- of an entirely separate category.
- 6 But I wonder if you could speak to this
- 7 question of well they certainly aren't immune from the
- 8 statutory exemptions that already exist, which are
- 9 based on the purpose of the activity. So I wonder if
- 10 you could speak to that apparent discrepancy, Mr.
- 11 Williams?
- MR. WILLIAMS: Yeah, thank you. And I'll
- just say quickly, some of the comments made it sound
- 14 like video game consoles can't be repaired at all,
- 15 ever, and that's just not true. If you take a look at
- 16 our comments, you'll see that there is still warranty
- 17 repair and post-warranty repair available for
- 18 consoles.
- 19 On this question of the limiting language
- that you mentioned, I mean, of course, that language
- is helpful to an extent, and we prefer exemptions that
- 22 have it, but it doesn't really solve the problem. And
- 23 I think if you look back at the records on video game
- consoles specifically, there's been a lot of evidence
- 25 that jail-breaking a console almost inevitably leads

- 1 to piracy, that infringement is the number-one reason
- 2 to open up a console.
- 3 And so just saying in an exemption that it
- 4 doesn't apply unless -- as long as they -- no one
- 5 intends at the time to access content illegally,
- 6 that's very difficult to police, number one. And
- 7 number two, there's all kinds of questions about
- 8 timing. So when you put that language in there if
- 9 someone makes a repair, say, and then a year later
- 10 they start using it for infringement, how does that
- 11 work?
- 12 So the language, while helpful, while I
- appreciate your efforts to try to rein in some of
- these exemptions, it really doesn't address our
- overall big picture concerns that the 1201 statute
- 16 really sets a marketplace expectation for typical
- 17 consumers. And when you alter that underlying
- 18 marketplace expectation, bad things tend to happen,
- 19 even if you've got language of that sort in the
- 20 exemption itself.
- MR. AMER: Okay, thank you.
- I want to, Mr. Ayers, give you a chance to
- respond, too, and then I do, just in the interest of
- time, want to move to the next topic.
- I think we've had some comments on this

- 1 point before, so I think we'd like to wrap it up after
- 2 -- oh, Mr. Ayers, did you no longer --
- 3 MR. AYERS: No, I'm sorry. I was just
- 4 removing my hand just in -- it's still up.
- 5 MR. AMER: Okay.
- 6 MR. AYERS: It's still up. Sorry.
- 7 MR. AMER: So let's go to you, and then
- 8 we'll go to the next topic.
- 9 MR. AYERS: Thank you, and I'll be very
- 10 brief. Just to note that, again, limitations are
- 11 better than no limitations in this context, and
- 12 certainly, if there's an inclination to grant the
- request, properly bounding them is important.
- But I would note that, again, we've got
- multiple situations where the word "repair" has been
- 16 used in relation to activities which are arguably
- 17 modifications or expanding the functionality of
- 18 devices.
- 19 Also a little bit concerned about restoring
- 20 a device to its original condition. Does that include
- 21 if the device had a revoked device key because it's
- 22 been inappropriately used? Does that mean restoring
- 23 that device with an unauthorized device key that's
- 24 been retrieved from another source?
- 25 And again, to note that the difference

- 1 between other contexts and the optical disk drive
- 2 context here is that we've already seen, for years
- 3 now, the proliferation of piracy that occurs. And
- 4 again, noting specifically in the game console space
- 5 that the most used and popular platform today for
- 6 playing unauthorized content is a direct result of
- 7 original efforts to hack and modify the Xbox.
- 8 MR. AMER: Thank you.
- 9 And I see that we do have a couple of other
- 10 hands up, and so you can potentially incorporate your
- answers here into the next questions, but I'd like to
- 12 turn it over to my colleague Mr. Bartelt to ask about
- 13 some other types of devices.
- MR. BARTELT: Thanks.
- 15 Hi, everyone. Following up on some of what
- 16 Ms. Smith alluded earlier about questions concerning
- 17 causation, in the 2018 rulemaking there were some
- 18 device types that, in the recommendation that the
- 19 Office issued or the acting register issued, we had
- found out there was an insufficient causal link.
- 21 So I wanted to probe a little bit about
- 22 maybe what's changed since the 2018 rulemaking and see
- 23 if there's an additional record supporting the
- 24 causation that relates to these devices.
- The first one I'd mention is a category that

- 1 we refer to as consumables. There, we found that the
- 2 prohibition against circumvention -- it was not clear
- 3 from the record whether the prohibition against TPMs
- 4 was causing adverse effects on non-infringing
- 5 activities relating to replacement cartridges for ink,
- 6 coffee, litter boxes. I think we had a few other
- 7 examples. I believe this came up primarily in the EFF
- 8 submission.
- 9 So I'd like to first, I guess, direct my
- 10 question to Ms. Gagliano, whether there's the
- 11 additional record in this rulemaking that you can
- point to that shows a causal link between the TPMs
- inhibiting repair activities as it relates to these
- 14 devices that use consumables.
- 15 And then maybe after that, I can turn to
- 16 you, Ms. Burke, to see if you have additional
- 17 comments.
- 18 Ms. Gagliano?
- 19 MS. GAGLIANO: Sure. Yeah. If you look at
- our initial longform comment, I'd say that both the
- 21 CatGenie cat litter box example that you mentioned and
- the printer example both go to consumables.
- 23 And you know, as opposed to last time my
- 24 understanding then was that the Office was not saying
- so much, "Well, that's not enough examples," as it

- was, "You didn't give us enough detail about what the
- 2 TPMs are, whether they actually are access controls,"
- 3 you know, "how the circumventions would work and," you
- 4 know, "what's the full fair use analysis, statutory
- 5 analysis?"
- 6 So this time we have given you all of that
- 7 in perhaps excruciating detail, so I think if you look
- 8 there, you'll see for both of those examples and for
- 9 printers it's not just one printer, but we discuss
- 10 multiple kinds, including H.P., I believe, also
- 11 Lexmark, and a couple others that are using TPMs.
- 12 And we discuss in more detail what those
- 13 TPMs are, how they are actually access controls, and
- 14 how 1201 adversely affects modifications that people
- 15 want to be able to make.
- MR. BARTELT: Thank you.
- 17 Ms. Burke? I'm not sure if your comments
- 18 are specific to these causation issues, but --
- 19 MS. BURKE: As far as to the changed
- 20 circumstances question, with -- well, first, as a
- 21 matter of just -- I know opposition replies to our
- 22 comments with regard to the video game console had
- 23 suggested that we should be barred from bringing such
- a petition because it had been denied in the past.
- 25 And as a matter of course, I want to point

- out that there are no pseudo-standing kind of
- 2 threshold issues at play with regard to this 1201
- 3 hearing. It's not in the statute. It's not in the
- 4 legislative intent. And so I just think, as a matter
- of course that that's -- it just not in keeping with
- 6 what this hearing is about.
- 7 Congress intended for these reviews to
- 8 happen every three years because it understood that
- 9 technology changes quickly, and the context and
- 10 circumstances of our understanding of when an
- 11 exemption might be necessary could change with those
- 12 times.
- Now, to the extent that it's something that
- 14 the Librarian would want to consider under the fifth
- 15 factor of the 1201 statutory analysis with regard to
- 16 video game consoles, there have been significant
- 17 changes since the 2018 review. Most notably, one of
- 18 the reasons that the video game console exemption was
- 19 denied in 2018 was because of the availability of
- 20 official repair channels.
- 21 And I know that Mr. Williams had kind of
- 22 gotten into this a little bit, but the facts there
- 23 simply aren't true. In 2019, Microsoft announced that
- 24 it was no longer going to repair devices that didn't
- 25 have in active production, and the Xbox 360, the Xbox

- One, the Xbox One X can no longer be repaired through
- 2 Microsoft. So there are no official warranty repair
- 3 options or even outside of warranty repair options
- 4 with regard to many of these consoles, so consumers
- 5 have no choice but to either buy a completely new
- 6 console or to just throw it out, basically.
- 7 Then as far as like other things that have
- 8 changed, I think with regard to not just to video game
- 9 consoles, but with regard to all devices, when it
- 10 comes to the necessity of repair, over the last 13
- 11 months our understanding of global supply chains and
- the availability of devices has definitely shown that
- it's much more vulnerable than we could have possibly
- 14 believed before, not just from COVID but our
- 15 relationships with China when it comes to trade and
- 16 the recent incident in the Suez Canal demonstrates
- 17 that our ability to get devices, new devices, when we
- 18 need them and to get even official repair parts, et
- 19 cetera, can be significantly challenging.
- 20 And when there's a crisis at hand, it's
- 21 really important to be able to repair what we have,
- 22 given some of --
- MR. BARTELT: Okay.
- 24 MS. BURKE: -- the increased concerns.
- MR. BARTELT: Sure. Thank you, Ms. Burke.

1	I do have a question for Mr. Wiens that also
2	sort of relates to this question of changed
3	circumstances and from 2018 where the in the
4	recommendation, the Office had found that for
5	computing peripherals, I think the instance that was
6	before us then was related to a hard drive that people
7	were trying to access, that it wasn't actually
8	inhibiting the ability to circumvent.
9	And I just was curious if there were any
10	examples that you could provide relating to computing
11	peripherals that would show that TPMs are, in fact,
12	inhibiting access or are effectively controlling
13	access to these types of devices. The hard drive
14	would be, of course, one example. But if you have
15	others, please provide those.
16	MR. WIENS: Absolutely. You know, you think
17	back over the last three years, it's hard to think
18	about what the world was like almost before 2020.
19	Like so much has changed, and so much has changed in
20	this sphere. I like to say if something can't have
21	software added to it, it will. And the kind of new
22	adage is if something can have a lithium battery in
23	it, then they're going to add a battery.
24	And so the whole world of gizmos have
25	consumables, have batteries. I'll get to the

- 1 peripheral question in a second, but an example of a
- 2 consumable that we haven't discussed before is robot
- 3 vacuums. So the iRobot vacuums have batteries in
- 4 them. The batteries have a TPM that ties the
- 5 manufacturer sort of branded batteries, and if you
- 6 install an after-market battery, the vacuum won't
- 7 recognize it.
- 8 And that's not just the case there. I mean,
- 9 we see that -- Apple does this with the batteries in
- 10 the iPhone. Increasingly, these battery consumables
- are being tied to the device purely to monopolize
- sales of after-market parts, just like we see in
- inkjets.
- 14 You know, it's also interesting to think
- 15 about, like we all -- we do this every three years.
- 16 Man, it would sure be nice if this was more often than
- 17 every three years, because the technology world
- 18 changes so quickly. I think we realized about a month
- 19 after the last kind of hearing that as we were talking
- about all the things that we could repair, nobody
- asked for an exemption for computers, for laptops.
- 22 And like all the computers and everything
- that we're talking to now, we don't have a repair
- 24 exemption for them. And we were all kind of shaking
- our heads, like how did we not think about that? And

- 1 the answer is that historically, computers haven't had
- 2 TPMs. You know, your bog-standard P.C. you can get
- in. You can access. You can replace anything.
- 4 But what we're starting to see now is Apple
- 5 has taken the T2 security chip from iOS devices --
- 6 this is maybe the thing we have to jailbreak in iOS
- 7 devices -- and they've put it on their computers. And
- 8 we're seeing more secure boot techniques across the
- 9 board in all kind of general purpose computers.
- 10 So where historically there wasn't a
- 11 circumvention needed to do service, now overwhelmingly
- it is, and that's been a huge sea change in the last
- three years. There have been lots of other changes to
- 14 areas where -- go ahead.
- MR. BARTELT: Okay. No, I was just going to
- 16 say, I was going to give Mr. Williams an opportunity
- 17 to respond, and then what we'll do after that is where
- 18 we're going to change -- as Ms. Smith mentioned
- 19 earlier, we're going to discuss medical devices. I
- 20 believe we have some comments on that. But we'll
- 21 focus a little bit more on that and then conclude with
- 22 discussing vehicles.
- So, Mr. Williams?
- 24 MR. WILLIAMS: Yes, thank you. I wanted to
- 25 respond quickly to what Ms. Burke was saying. If you

- go to support.xbox.com, you'll see that the Xbox One
- 2 S, the Xbox One X, they're still being repaired by
- 3 Microsoft. And we said in our comments their policy
- 4 is to continue repairing consoles up to four years
- 5 after they are no longer selling those consoles. So
- 6 some of what was said is inaccurate with respect to
- 7 what Microsoft is currently offering with respect to
- 8 console repair.
- 9 All of the console manufacturers also have
- 10 pretty robust e-recycling efforts where people can,
- 11 for free, get their consoles recycled to avoid e-waste
- and some of the other issues that were implicated
- there.
- On peripherals, I don't recall in the record
- 15 seeing anyone targeting video game consoles
- 16 peripherals, but you can see in some of the websites
- 17 that we provided that those peripherals are also
- 18 repaired by console manufacturers in warranty and out
- 19 of warranty. And so I'd need more specifics, I guess,
- to know the answer on any given device.
- 21 But my understanding is those can be
- 22 repaired by the manufacturers, and I don't know that
- 23 circumvention is always required with respect to
- 24 peripherals. I do know some peripherals can inter-
- operate with other devices, as we discussed in the

- disability-related exemption classes, without any need
- 2 to circumvent. So I would need more specifics to
- 3 answer that question.
- 4 MR. BARTELT: Thank you, Mr. Williams.
- 5 As I said, I'm going to turn now to some
- 6 questions focused on medical device repair, so I know
- 7 you've spoken a little bit to this earlier, but maybe
- 8 I could get a little bit more insight about how TPMs
- 9 are actually inhibiting access to repair devices.
- 10 I think what we saw in the written comments
- 11 was that the opponents were saying that the original
- 12 equipment manufacturers in this instance were
- providing access and servicing information as required
- 14 by the FDA regulations, and that that was sufficient
- 15 to perform basic maintenance and repair services.
- 16 So I quess to both Mr. McHarque and Mr.
- 17 Kerwin, maybe you could both elaborate a little bit
- 18 for us about what FDA-mandated access and servicing
- 19 materials that OEMs are failing to provide and why
- what you're receiving is maybe inadequate or TPMs are
- 21 preventing access to basic maintenance and repair
- 22 activities.
- I quess, Mr. Kerwin, I see your mike's off,
- so please go ahead, and then we'll turn to Mr.
- McHargue.

MR. KERWIN: Well, thank you for the
opportunity to speak. We appreciate that. It would
not simply be FDA that we would be speaking to. There
are applicable regulations from the Center for
Medicare and Medicaid Devices, particularly 42 C.F.R.
482, which requires that hospitals maintain adequate
information on equipment to have an acceptable level
of safety and quality.
But to speak to your point on AIAT FDA,
first, that only pertains to radiation-emitting
devices such as x-ray, and that has to do with
information pertaining to assembly installation. And
what we're seeing and let me just back up and say
that at IAMERS what we're seeing is that independent
servicers in the secondary market may well become like
the watch repair people to the extent that they're
adversely impacted by this exemption.
We treat rural and regional hospitals
located everywhere from Eastern Appalachia in West
Virginia to Kansas, and we are conducting a survey of
some of these hospitals and, unfortunately, were not
able to complete it, but what we do know is that all
of them are having zero capital budgets and are unable
to undertake only the basic work.

And in this connection, the independent

25

- 1 servicer, whose rates are substantially lower than the
- original equipment manufacturer, is a preferred model.
- 3 In addition, the turn time when equipment breaks down
- 4 is easier. So the AIAT is providing assembly
- 5 information -- is also something, sadly, with a right
- 6 but no remedy.
- 7 That is to say that the FDA has widely
- 8 acknowledged that if there's non-compliance, there is
- 9 no remedy for that. And we now see the DMCA and other
- 10 federal and state causes of action being used to
- 11 thwart the ability of independent and in-house
- diagnostic imaging services by claiming that the use
- of these manuals is a violation of the law, and I know
- there are several cases coming to trial this year.
- And if there's an issue, retaliation is
- 16 alive and well. That is to say, many of the members
- 17 are fearful that if they speak as to these issues,
- 18 they'll see a slowdown of parts. They potentially
- 19 will have a refusal to deal, notwithstanding that some
- of these same manufacturers no longer own the
- 21 machines, the equipment, that they are selling to
- 22 hospitals, group medical practices, and to some
- 23 independent servicers.
- We have witnessed since the last hearing a
- 25 massive consolidation in diagnostic imaging, with

	1	three	manufacturers	occupying	70	percent	of	the
--	---	-------	---------------	-----------	----	---------	----	-----

- 2 diagnostic imaging market, with manufacturers
- 3 controlling all but nine percent of the servicing of
- 4 equipment.
- 5 Few hospitals, group purchasing
- 6 arrangements, and rural hospitals possess the market
- 7 power to insist upon providing information to fix
- 8 their own equipment. Without this information, it is
- 9 difficult to conduct a root cause analysis of a
- 10 problem with equipment.
- 11 And as you may know, many of our members are
- 12 ISO 13485 qualified, and in the ecosystem of medical
- device care you have many HDOs, health delivery
- organizations, and they're well-established clinical
- 15 engineers in an oversight capacity. This is not an
- 16 area where fearmongering really should have a place.
- 17 And one can only look to the FDA MAUDE
- 18 reports, which are the manufacturer and user facility
- 19 reports which must be filed by the manufacturer or the
- 20 hospital where an adverse event to look at is found,
- 21 and you would see that under one percent adverse
- 22 events have been occurring with respect to this.
- 23 So the conduct that we're speaking of is
- 24 causing a problem for those who have lawful possession
- of the equipment and those who would service it,

- 1 because the price differential can be \$150 to \$250 an
- 2 hour for an independent servicer versus six to \$800 an
- 3 hour for a manufacturer with a minimum four-hour time
- 4 cap.
- 5 So this exemption is causing adverse events,
- 6 and we do feel that a new exemption needs to be
- 7 undertaken. I should say this TPM. And we are asking
- 8 to take this into account. I wish I could bring many
- 9 members with me, but a number of them are just
- 10 painfully worried that if they contribute to this
- 11 conversation that they could potentially suffer a loss
- in delayed equipment or refusal to deal and other
- 13 activities.
- MR. BARTELT: Thanks, Mr. Kerwin.
- MR. KERWIN: Let's make sure --
- 16 MR. BARTELT: Oh, and I'm sorry, I do want
- to give others enough opportunity. I know we don't
- 18 have a tremendous amount of time today. I do
- 19 appreciate your remarks here. And we may be able to
- 20 circle back again yet.
- 21 But I just wanted to give Mr. McHarque, as I
- 22 said, a chance, and then I believe Mr. Cheney has a
- 23 question, and we can get to some of the other people
- 24 with their hands raised. Thank you.
- Mr. McHargue?

1	MR. McHARGUE: Thank you, Nicholas.
2	So relative to our ability to seek service
3	and manuals, there has been, I would say, improvement
4	
5	MR. BARTELT: Oh, and I'm sorry, Mr.
6	McHargue, could I jump in one I'm not sure if this
7	is best directed to you, too, but maybe as part of
8	your response, could you clarify you had just
9	mentioned manuals, and I think are you seeking
10	access not just to the computer programs but I
11	wasn't sure if there were if the original equipment
12	manufacturers were claiming copyright in works besides
13	the programs themselves, but also in like the manuals
14	or other literary works or ancillary materials?
15	If you have any insight there, we'd
16	appreciate it, and then whatever else you want to
17	comment on concerning the TPMs that are preventing
18	access.
19	MR. McHARGUE: Yeah, I'd say in general, we
20	have access to manuals for the most part, but now the
21	manuals are digital. We're told that we can access
22	all of them for a particular fee. What we're really
23	bumping into is the fact that we are told by the
24	original manufacturers that we can buy a service
25	advisor or something that can help us get in,

- 1 potentially read the codes, read the errors.
- 2 We can go and buy the parts to actually
- install, but the issue is once we install, we cannot
- 4 get the last bit of software to have that vehicle,
- 5 whether it be a tractor or a combine, recognize that
- 6 new piece of equipment and actually make it
- 7 functional.
- 8 So in the details of how this all works,
- 9 again, I'm not a software engineer, but what I know
- 10 for sure is that we can get all the way to the end,
- 11 and if I have a combine sitting out to field, and the
- rain is coming, and my independent repair tech comes
- out, installs the part, gets it up, and says, "Well,
- that's as far as I can go. You're going to have to
- 15 have a tech from the equipment manufacturer come out,
- 16 finish that repair." And so from that aspect, that's
- 17 not working for us.
- 18 And to be clear, agriculture is not seeking
- 19 an additional exemption from the Copyright Office. We
- 20 appreciate what was done in 2018. But those are some
- of the issues we're still dealing with, though,
- 22 relative to -- since 2018.
- MR. BARTELT: Okay. Thank you.
- 24 Mr. Cheney, you had a question? And then
- we'll move on.

1	MR.	CHENEY:	Yeah,	thank	you.
---	-----	---------	-------	-------	------

- MR. BARTELT: Yeah.
- 3 MR. CHENEY: Oh, I appreciate it. Thank you
- 4 for giving me a moment here. I just want to clarify
- one thing. I don't think it was very clear from part
- of your question. And then I want to ask an
- 7 additional question.
- The manuals that you're talking about, in
- 9 order to access those, do you have to break a TPM to
- 10 get access to those manuals? And how is that done?
- 11 Can you describe that a little bit?
- 12 The other thing that I want folks to get
- into a little bit here and talk about is this system
- of what the opponents are calling unauthorized
- independent providers, and what that system looks
- 16 like, and why would hospitals and clinics and others
- 17 that have these devices be having those folks on
- 18 staff? And what are the qualifications in order to do
- 19 that?
- Just a little bit more detail there, I
- 21 think, and some of that may have come up in these Cal
- 22 State Senate hearings, and some of that -- so
- 23 whatever's relevant from those hearings that were
- happening last week that maybe, brought in, might be
- 25 helpful, so including like ISOs qualified and some of

- 1 that kind of stuff I think I heard you mention. So I
- 2 hope that's helpful for this conversation. Thank you
- MR. BARTELT: Okay. Thanks, Mr. Cheney.
- I realize I should have called on Mr.
- 5 Inacker earlier, and then maybe we'll go to Mr.
- 6 Inacker, Mr. Reed, Mr. Wiens, and Ms. Sheehan.
- 7 Go ahead, Mr. Inacker. Oh, I believe you're
- 8 still on mute. Very good.
- 9 MR. INACKER: Thank you for that. Just a
- 10 couple of quick points of clarification. So the TPMs
- 11 would not be removed by the exemption that we are
- 12 requesting. We just don't want to have the penalties
- associated or the consequences associated with
- 14 circumventing. "Basic service" is defined by the OEM.
- 15 It's not defined by an independent service
- 16 organization. They define what you're allowed to have
- 17 access to.
- 18 "Basic service" is insufficient to do what
- 19 we need to do to get our customers -- hospitals, care
- 20 givers, imaging centers -- the type of service that
- 21 they need to have their equipment be fully functional.
- 22 "Basic service" is insufficient in order to do that.
- 23 That's why we have to be able to go around
- the TPMs in order to make the equipment as functional
- as possible, especially when it comes to removing and

- 1 replacing high-end pieces of equipment like glassware
- 2 in imaging devices. It is essential for what we do as
- 3 an organization.
- 4 And it's unconscionable to me as a consumer
- of health care, where we can provide a service that
- offers a 30 to 50 percent reduction in cost to what an
- 7 OEM is capable of doing, that we're not all standing
- 8 up and saying we need to have access in order to be
- 9 able to do this.
- 10 MR. BARTELT: Thank you, Mr. Inacker.
- 11 Mr. Reed, I'm not sure if you want to
- 12 continue in --
- MR. REED: Yeah.
- MR. BARTELT: -- speaking to this, go for
- 15 it.
- 16 MR. REED: Yeah. So I think we heard a
- 17 little bit of that old line, "lies, damn lies, and
- 18 statistics." It was interesting to say that when Mr.
- 19 Kerwin said, "Oh, well, it's only one percent." Well,
- that one percent, according to the FDA's MDR review
- 21 from 2017, was 40 deaths, 294 serious injury, 38,500
- 22 patients and/or operators exposed to potential harm.
- 23 So when one says, "One percent, oh, gee, it's not that
- 24 many," it's actually a lot.
- The second part of that's important. Again,

- 1 within the scope of what you're looking at, the FDA
- 2 already has requirements called the Quality System
- Regulation, or QSR, that governs OEMs. So if you look
- 4 at the section 710 of FDA's Reauthorization Act, we
- 5 already have all of those things in effect.
- The specific language is, "Quality systems
- 7 help ensure that products consistently meet applicable
- 8 requirements and specifications." So when Mr. Inacker
- 9 says, "Well, we should be able to reduce cost," part
- of what he's trying to overcome is he doesn't want to
- 11 pay for or do the necessary things to meet the FDA's
- 12 requirements as a QSR.
- So right now, we fully support and think
- it's a great idea if OEMs or others can provide
- 15 service and support and meet the FDA's requirements
- 16 for OSR. Then that's probably a way to go for it.
- 17 Right now, the third-party servicers kind of don't
- 18 have the same transparency or accountability, and
- 19 don't necessarily submit adverse event reports in the
- 20 same way that the others do.
- 21 So I think that it's a little glib to say,
- "Gee, we save you 30 percent," but if it results in 40
- deaths, 294 serious injuries, and 38,500 patients and
- operators exposed, then I'm not sure it's something
- 25 that we wave off with a hand.

- 1 So I would encourage the Copyright Office to
- 2 be very cautious for over interpreting the cost
- 3 reduction as something that should drive this forward,
- 4 especially since the market exists.
- 5 MR. INACKER: May I please respond to Mr.
- 6 Reed?
- 7 Mr. Reed, all of our organizations are ISO
- 8 13485 certified, the same certification as the OEMs.
- 9 Your numbers -- if you look at how many of the OEM
- 10 organizations have caused issues with imaging
- 11 equipment because of their delays and lack of
- 12 responsiveness, those numbers will be a heck of a lot
- higher than they are for the independent service
- 14 organizations.
- MR. REED: And, Steve, I'd be happy to go to
- 16 the FDA and talk with you about some of those
- 17 failures. The Copyright Office is not the place --
- 18 MR. INACKER: The FDA -- the FDA -- the FDA
- 19 --
- 20 MR. REED: -- to have that discussion.
- MR. INACKER: The FDA --
- MR. REED: This is not --
- MR. INACKER: -- clearly --
- MR. BARTELT: I'm sorry, gentlemen,
- 25 gentlemen, for the sake of the discussion --

- 1 MR. INACKER: The FDA clearly said in 2018
- 2 that --
- 3 MR. BARTELT: -- speaking over each other.
- 4 MR. INACKER: -- independent service
- 5 organizations provide a valuable service to the health
- 6 care providers, and no difference between what an OEM
- 7 is doing and a qualified --
- 8 MR. BARTELT: Yeah, so again --
- 9 MS. SMITH: Just a moment.
- 10 MR. INACKER: servicer --
- MS. SMITH: Just a moment. Just a moment.
- 12 Just a moment. Just a moment. Thank you. Everyone
- is going to get an opportunity to speak, but we cannot
- have cross talk over this, and we cannot have going
- 15 back and forth without the moderator. That will not
- 16 work for the court reporter, and we want to make sure
- 17 everyone gets a chance to speak.
- 18 So we're going to go a little bit over time
- 19 because we know there's a lot of issues. We do want
- 20 to cover them. But I have to ask you to respect my
- 21 colleague who's moderating.
- 22 So I think, just to take some of the tension
- 23 off of that issue, and also I think some of these
- 24 issues might be going a little bit beyond, I want to
- 25 make sure we're centered on the 1201 rulemaking.

- think let's give Ms. Sheehan a chance to weigh in.
- 2 Thank you.
- 3 MS. SHEEHAN: Thank you. I just wanted to
- 4 respond really quickly to what Mr. Reed mentioned
- 5 about the FDA, and I'll say that it's possible Mr.
- 6 Reed is not familiar with the FDA's 2018 study
- 7 reporting on the quality, safety, and effectiveness of
- 8 servicing of medical devices.
- 9 In that study, the FDA issued a report
- 10 which, in part, sought to determine how valid these
- 11 concerns were about the quality of servicing provided
- 12 by the original equipment manufacturers versus third-
- party independent entities. And the report found that
- 14 the objective evidence indicates that many OEMs,
- original equipment manufacturers, and third-party
- 16 entities provide high quality, safe, and effective
- 17 servicing of medical devices, and in fact, that the
- 18 continued availability of third-party entities,
- including independent service organizations, to
- 20 service and repair medical devices is critical to the
- 21 functioning of the U.S. health care system. So just
- 22 to address some of those FDA concerns that Mr. Reed
- 23 raised.
- 24 But moving on and refocusing on really the
- 25 core inquiry here, if Mr. Reed would contain his

818

- 1 emotional responses, that would be delightful.
- 2 But also just this is a Copyright Office
- 3 hearing. This isn't an FDA regulatory proceeding.
- 4 And so the Copyright Office is concerned with whether
- or not there should be an exemption issued to section
- 6 1201 for the purpose of medical device repair.
- 7 And I'll say again, as I said throughout
- 8 this hearing, that repair is a non-infringing
- 9 activity. The absence of an exemption to permit
- 10 repair on medical devices as well as other software-
- 11 enabled devices causes real tangible harms. In
- medical devices, that's very prescient.
- We have people who are left without a
- 14 functioning wheelchair for months at a time, waiting
- for original equipment manufacturers to send out a
- 16 qualified repair technician.
- 17 We have hospitals unable to repair rooms
- 18 full of ventilators because they can't get access --
- 19 they have to wait months for manufacturer-branded
- 20 repair services to come out and provide them with a
- 21 special dongle which is needed in order to get access
- 22 to the device to do the repair, or to provide the
- 23 service keys -- again, another TPM -- that's used to
- lock out hospitals and technicians as well as
- 25 independent service technicians and privilege

- 1 manufacturer technicians.
- 2 And as I said before, the Federal Circuit
- 3 found in Chamberlain -- and this has not been -- this
- 4 has not been disputed -- that 1201 doesn't give new
- 5 exclusive rights to copyright holders. So that means
- 6 that 1201 does not give a right to medical device
- 7 manufacturers or medical device app manufacturers to
- 8 control the market for repair or to exclude
- 9 independent repair providers.
- 10 MR. BARTELT: Okay. Thank you, Ms. Sheehan.
- I do have a question about maybe how these TPMs would
- 12 work and how the -- you know, just hypothesizing, that
- if the circumvent -- this is maybe directed to Mr.
- 14 Wiens.
- 15 I don't know if you have any technical
- 16 background that you could help with -- or maybe Mr.
- 17 Kerwin -- that once the TPMs would be circumvented on
- 18 these types of devices, would the copyrighted works --
- 19 would the software programs or the data remain on the
- 20 machine afterwards? Would they need to be put onto
- 21 another device?
- 22 I'm just curious about sort of the actual
- 23 mechanics of circumventing on these medical devices.
- I think we've heard about a lot of other devices over
- 25 the years. But I'm not sure, maybe you could provide

- 1 specific examples of how circumvention works in these
- 2 instances and if it could be restored in such a way
- 3 that it would be sort of to the original
- 4 specifications.
- 5 First I'll let Mr. Wiens -- I see you've had
- 6 your hand raised for a little while -- then maybe Mr.
- 7 Kerwin.
- And we can maybe come back to you, then,
- 9 after that, Mr. Reed.
- 10 MR. WIENS: Sure. Thanks for the question.
- 11 These are relatively -- oftentimes, like with the
- wheelchair, there is a service password that you need
- to enter, and so if you don't have the service
- 14 password to get into additional menus, then you're out
- 15 of luck.
- 16 So really, the goal is just to bypass the
- 17 password so then you can get in. There are very
- 18 common settings, like traction settings, that you
- 19 might want to change on a wheelchair. And kind of the
- 20 same thing with the ventilators and other equipment.
- You know, you plug the service dongle in.
- 22 So, no, the software should remain on the
- 23 device. The data should remain on the device. The
- 24 goal isn't to exfiltrate the firmware from the device.
- It's simply to bypass whatever check is there to see

- if a branded manufacturer representative is sitting in
- 2 the chair.
- In many cases, the larger hospitals have
- 4 been given these service passwords, and it's the
- 5 smaller hospitals that aren't given the passwords.
- 6 And I'll defer to Mr. Kerwin to share the situation on
- 7 the ground.
- 8 MR. BARTELT: Thank you, Mr. Wiens.
- 9 MR. KERWIN: I, I --
- 10 MR. BARTELT: Mr. Kerwin, go ahead.
- 11 MR. KERWIN: I quite agree. The CMS has
- 12 issued various bulletins consistent with the laws
- 13 cited that require you to keep your equipment in
- 14 accordance with the original equipment manufacturer
- 15 specifications or, for certain types of non-diagnosed
- 16 equipment, to maintain alternative maintenance
- 17 activities with a risk analysis.
- 18 So that information will stay with the
- 19 hospital and is expected to be there because, as we
- 20 know, the Joint Commission has oversight of these
- 21 hospitals and is the delegated authority for many of
- the states.
- 23 And in addition to your earlier point about
- vendor management, unauthorized independent providers,
- 25 the hospitals will undertake their own vendor

822

- 1 management programs. Some have formalized
- departments. Some are much smaller. And they do like
- 3 to see members ISO 13485 qualified, which is the ISO
- 4 standard.
- 5 So the risk is minimal, and I also affirm
- the other speaker's reference to the 2018 report,
- 7 which I believe addresses some of the concerns raised.
- 8 MR. BARTELT: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Kerwin.
- 9 Mr. Reed, I had a specific -- well, two
- 10 specific questions to you, maybe that you could -- and
- then any other things that you needed to respond to.
- 12 One was to what extent are the existing
- other types of laws that -- maybe the Computer Fraud
- and Abuse Act, HIPAA, FDA regulations, other existing
- 15 things -- alleviate any sort of safety concerns here?
- 16 And the second was -- I don't know how much
- 17 particular insight you have as you're not directly
- 18 representing -- one of the opposition comments that we
- 19 had received was a lot of -- some of the examples that
- 20 were cited were -- seemed to relate to physical issues
- 21 rather than issues resulting from circumvention of a
- 22 TPM.
- I was curious if you have any examples or
- 24 maybe I can't --
- MR. REED: Yeah.

- 1 MR. BARTELT: Where circumvention of TPMs
- 2 has led to the types of instances that you've referred
- 3 to. But go ahead.
- 4 MR. REED: Right. I think the long and the
- 5 short of it is, interestingly enough, I think all of
- 6 this talk about the FDA and Ms. Sheehan's comment
- 7 directed at me kind of points to the reality. The FDA
- 8 actually has structures in place to do this the right
- 9 way. The Copyright Office and the 1201 proceeding is
- 10 not the right place to do so.
- By the way, HIPAA doesn't apply in any of
- 12 these instances. Just so you all understand, HIPAA
- actually deals with portability of electronic
- information. The section that you might be referring
- to is the privacy rule, which came separately. HIPAA
- 16 actually only covers what are called covered entities,
- 17 and covered entities are organizations that file
- 18 electronic insurance claims or their business
- 19 associates.
- 20 So HIPAA doesn't actually have any
- 21 constrains around this. OCR, the Office of Civil
- 22 Rights, doesn't have any oversight over this space at
- 23 all, unless a covered entity is engaging in a practice
- that exposes someone's PHI. So it's really, really
- 25 separate.

1	But you hit the nail on the head. The
2	agency that does have oversight over this is the FDA,
3	and I'm very familiar with the 2018 report. I
4	actually think that the work that's being done in this
5	conference on this call right now is kind of
6	misdirected.
7	Our efforts should really be at how do we
8	ensure that the FDA and its Quality Systems Regulation
9	moves forward in a way that appropriately allows for
10	repairs in a way that actually keeps patients safe.
11	I'm not sure why we're talking about medical devices
12	at a 1201 hearing which was more around protecting
13	people's movies and music. So I think that
14	MR. AMER: Well
15	MR. REED: part of the problem we're
16	running into is
17	MS. SMITH: Well, Mr
18	MR. REED: But sorry, Regan. Did I
19	MS. SMITH: I bet Mr. Amer and I have the
20	same question, which is does that also cut the other
21	way, which is if we're looking at whether the
22	copyright law should be playing a role in this field
23	

MS. SMITH: -- where what we're looking at

MR. REED: Yeah.

24

25

- is whether it's likely to be a non-infringing use, and
- 2 we don't -- we haven't really necessarily seen, I
- 3 think, a reliant interest from the FDA on the
- 4 copyright law for the discussion.
- 5 MR. REED: Yeah. I think that's a great
- 6 question. It was exactly where I was going. So you
- 7 heard a little hint about it, about on the manuals
- 8 part of it. The reality is the manuals are protected
- 9 intellectual property, and so if breaching TPMs is a
- 10 way to have access to the manual, the manual is
- 11 copyrighted material.
- So there are some instances where copyright
- does come into play, and I do know that has been an
- area of significant dispute, which is access to the
- 15 manuals, which is copyrighted material. So where the
- 16 tools are -- where the infringing tools are -- or I'm
- 17 sorry, the tools are intended to allow access to the
- 18 manual, it is intended to allow access to material
- that the owner of the copyright doesn't want to
- 20 provide access to, and that the use would be
- 21 infringing in terms of the purpose of what their
- 22 product is.
- 23 But I think those are kind of two separate
- questions, so the first question that I was asked was,
- "Is this the right venue?" My argument is no, FDA has

826

- 1 these things in place. Let's look there. Your second
- 2 question was, "Are there infringing or potential
- 3 infringing uses?" And I would say you hit it earlier
- 4 when we heard the discussion about manuals and access
- 5 to the IP.
- 6 So I think that's a place that is, in fact,
- 7 in dispute, and there are conflicts about access to
- 8 the IP.
- 9 MR. BARTELT: Thank you, Mr. Reed.
- 10 MR. AMER: Well, what is the --
- MR. BARTELT: Go ahead, Mr. Amer.
- 12 MR. AMER: Is the concern about access to
- the manuals a copyright-related concern? I mean, it
- doesn't seem to me that you're concerned about people
- 15 getting access to the manuals so they can read them in
- 16 the way that movie manufacturers or makers are worried
- 17 about people seeing a movie without paying for it. I
- 18 mean --
- 19 MR. REED: I -- the --
- 20 MR. AMER: -- are you worried about people
- 21 copying of the manuals that --
- MR. REED: Well, yeah, and --
- MR. AMER: -- seems like a --
- 24 MR. REED: Yes. Yeah. I don't want to
- 25 stick up for the manual manufacturers, but what I do

- 1 know is, yeah, manuals actually contain an enormous
- 2 amount of very specific proprietary information. They
- 3 may include information about pin-outs. They may
- 4 include information about access to specific
- 5 information.
- 6 Now, there are questions that we all have to
- 7 answer about whether or not that limits repair, but
- 8 the reality is yes, absolutely, manuals contain
- 9 information that is protected, proprietary, and, in
- 10 fact, again, not speaking for that industry, it's my
- 11 understanding that that's part of what they provide to
- 12 licensed OEM repair shops, is they license access to
- all of that copyrighted material to enable the repairs
- to take place, and that's part of their license
- 15 agreement with those third-party repair shops.
- 16 So I think it's considered a valuable
- 17 resource to them. It's adjacent to my industry. I
- 18 don't represent -- you know, they're not part of my
- 19 membership. But yeah, I do know that they definitely
- license access to those repair manuals, and that's a
- 21 key part of their control and income stream and value
- 22 for the IP that they're creating.
- MR. AMER: Okay.
- So I think we're going to go to Mr. Inacker
- and Ms. Sheehan, and then I think we're going to have

- 1 to move on to vehicles.
- MR. INACKER: All right, thank you. And I
- 3 just wanted to answer Mr. Bartelt's question directly.
- 4 So for a medical device, after TPM circumvention, the
- 5 data remains on the device. The software remains
- 6 intact. The device is left in its original state
- 7 after the repair is complete. This is all about fair
- 8 and equitable access.
- 9 MR. AMER: Thank you.
- 10 Ms. Sheehan?
- 11 MS. SHEEHAN: So first off, I want to say
- 12 I'm kind of unaware of the circumstance where a TPM
- would protect access to the service manual, but in the
- 14 case where it would, I just wanted to address Mr.
- 15 Reed's claims that that would be infringement. I
- 16 would say that if the purpose is repair, and the use
- of the manual -- again, the purpose is repair -- this
- is a non-infringing purpose.
- 19 Also if you have a license to use the
- 20 machine and the manual, you have a license to use it,
- 21 to read it, to use the instructions.
- 22 And then I also want to address just one of
- 23 the fair use factors here, weighing in on whether that
- 24 would be infringing, whether the use of a manual in
- 25 this case would be infringing, and just say that the

1	nature of the copyrighted work at issue with a manual
2	is highly functional, right?
3	So copyright will protect the expressive
4	content in that manual, but it's not going to protect
5	the instructions, the set of steps, the information
6	contained within that manual, and so we're not talking
7	here about a movie or a novel. Most service manuals
8	are, indeed, a set of instructions.
9	Refocusing on kind of what we're really
LO	concerned with her, which is technological protection
L1	measures that keep certified biomedical engineers that
L2	work in hospitals or that work with independent
L3	service organizations, independent repair people, or
L4	people who own take-home medical devices
L5	encountering TPMs that prevent them from repairing
L6	their device.
L7	And most often, we see those occurring
L8	through the existence of passwords, or security keys
L9	that someone has to use to get into the service
20	terminal for those devices, or to authorize a
21	replacement part, or to calibrate with a new part, or
22	kind of dongle-based security mechanisms. And so
23	MR. AMER: Okay, thank you.

24

25

MS. SHEEHAN: -- beyond the manual it's --

MR. AMER: I'm sorry, could I just --

- 1 MS. SHEEHAN: -- largely irrelevant here.
- 2 We're really focused on the TPMs that are obstructing
- 3 repair of the medical device itself. Thank you.
- 4 MR. AMER: Could I just stop you there? And
- 5 I'm sorry to interrupt.
- 6 And, Mr. Kerwin, I see your hand up, so I
- don't want to leave you out, but if you could be
- 8 brief, and then we're going to turn to our last topic.
- 9 And thanks for everybody's patience.
- 10 MR. KERWIN: Well, thank you. And could I
- just, on behalf of IAMERS, thank you. What I was going
- 12 to say is that relative to the cyber issue that was
- inquired about, the FDA has issued its own guidances,
- and those of us who are participatory in the joint
- public-private partnership of HSCC with 600 members
- are working on quality and white papers.
- 17 But the HHS, the Health and Human Services,
- 18 is where people record in the civil rights division
- 19 when a cyber issue has happened, and I urge you to
- look to see that there is very few that are related to
- 21 servicing, if any at all. So it's important to
- 22 realize that the FDA is not in the business of
- 23 intellectual property. They have publicly indicated
- 24 such. And it's entirely appropriate to have it here
- 25 today. Thank you.

1 MR. BARTELT: Thank y	you, Mr.	Kerwin.
------------------------	----------	---------

- 2 As Mr. Amer said, we're going to turn to our
- 3 last topic, which is vehicles. We heard briefly from
- 4 Mr. McHarque and Mr. Rosenbaum earlier. I think we
- 5 are going to -- I have just basically one question for
- 6 you each, maybe a little bit more.
- 7 First, Mr. McHargue, you had mentioned
- 8 earlier issues with access to tools, but my question
- 9 is going to be a little bit different. It's under the
- 10 current existing exemption for vehicles, there's a few
- 11 different limitations, one that it not violate other
- 12 laws. There was a comment about gaining access to
- 13 vehicle user data.
- 14 I'm just wondering, under the existing
- 15 exemption, how repairers or potential users of the
- 16 exemption are being inhibited from making necessary
- 17 repairs. If you have examples that you could provide
- 18 us, or where the existing language you would suggest
- 19 be modified in order to accommodate those users.
- MR. McHARGUE: Well, I appreciate that
- 21 question and I probably can't get into, again, the
- 22 technical side. Probably where I think the need for
- 23 additional repair people in our area -- there's been a
- 24 proliferation of expert third-party repairs groups in
- 25 the ag equipment sector, and so I think possibly

- 1 because of the 2018 ruling, I think that has given
- 2 credence to allowing that possibility.
- 3 What, again, has been difficult is even the
- 4 third-party experts can't get access to -- if I'm the
- 5 owner, have access to, say, a service advisor from
- John Deere, they're having difficulty getting access
- 7 to that same software that I could use to repair, but
- 8 yet I can infer that to my expert, and they're having
- 9 difficulty getting the same amount of tech that, say,
- 10 an OEM can provide.
- 11 And even if they could do that, there's
- 12 still these issues relative to the final repair that
- was mentioned, whether it be the dongle or the
- 14 payload, that's needed. So again, I don't know if
- 15 that's technically within the copyright part. I think
- there are other laws. When it comes to EPA, safety,
- 17 some of those things are probably outside this
- 18 conversation.
- But just from on the ground, that's kind of
- what's going on in the equipment repair side of the
- 21 equation. I don't know if I answered your question.
- 22 MR. BARTELT: Okay, sure. No, thank you.
- I do see that we have a few other hands
- 24 raised that may be able to -- that may be responsive
- to this question, so I'm going to turn to Mr. Wiens,

- 1 Ms. Sheehan. I see Mr. Cheney has a question.
- 2 And then, Mr. Rosenbaum, I have a question
- for you, too that we'll get back to after those
- 4 comments.
- 5 So, Mr. Wiens first?
- 6 MR. WIENS: Sure, and just to share the
- 7 specific challenge that the farmers are having, if you
- 8 are familiar with the case Dorman v. G.M., the part
- 9 that you get from the factory -- let's say you get a
- 10 new transmission or a new ECU. It comes without
- 11 firmware, and so you need to move your copy of the
- 12 firmware from your existing ECU onto the new part.
- 13 And in the ag industry, these are called
- 14 payload files. The payloads are the firmware. And a
- 15 circumvention would be exactly what Dorman did in the
- 16 G.M. case, where you basically move your copy onto the
- 17 new one.
- 18 What the branded kind of the John Deere reps
- are doing is they're downloading from John Deere's
- 20 servers a copy of that firmware and loading it onto
- 21 the device, so just to clarify the farm situation.
- 22 Did you --
- 23 MR. BARTELT: Oh, no, I just wanted to see
- 24 -- I was going to turn to Ms. Sheehan, but if you had
- one more point you wanted to make, we can do that, and

- 1 then --
- 2 MR. WIENS: Sure.
- 3 MR. BARTELT: move on.
- 4 MR. WIENS: Well, yeah, and real fast to
- 5 talk about the auto industry and what's different,
- 6 because things have changed so much in the last three
- 7 years in the car world. Three years ago, when we were
- 8 talking about circumventing -- or the telematic system
- 9 and the infotainment system, the state was new cars
- were coming with Blu-ray drives, right?
- I was looking this morning. I couldn't find
- 12 a single new 2021 model year car that comes with a
- 13 Blu-ray drive. I think that kind of -- like that has
- 14 passed. And instead, the media is played from your
- 15 phone, so I take my phone, and I use Apple CarPlay or
- 16 I use Android Auto, and so the media -- any sort of
- 17 concern that we have about piracy is centered around
- 18 these mobile devices and not actually the car itself.
- 19 So media has moved off of cars.
- 20 And then in the other direction, all of the
- 21 data that you need for repair has moved into the
- 22 telematic system, has moved into telematics. And
- 23 that's where you've seen the most recent Massachusetts
- 24 auto Right to Repair bill, which was introduced
- 25 because of all of the problems that the mechanics are

- 1 having because the data, instead of being passed to
- the service technician via the wired port, it's coming
- 3 wirelessly.
- 4 And as we talked about three years ago, that
- 5 wireless telematic system and the infotainment system
- 6 on the car is one and the same. It's the same ECU.
- 7 MR. BARTELT: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Wiens.
- 8 Ms. Sheehan?
- 9 MS. SHEEHAN: I'd like to reiterate what
- 10 Kyle said. So in 2018, the Register passed on the
- opportunity to recommend an exemption for vehicle
- telematic systems. But as we're seeing these
- telematic systems are increasingly ubiquitous.
- 14 If I have a Tesla right now, and I need to
- 15 repair it, the current exemption from 2018 doesn't
- 16 cover my repair because my mechanic would need access
- 17 to the telematic system in order to complete that
- 18 repair.
- 19 And again, as Kyle said the politics are
- 20 changing around this, and we've seen a ballot
- 21 initiative pass in Massachusetts with over 75 percent
- 22 of people who are recognizing the need to access these
- 23 wireless telematic systems and the need for their
- 24 independent repair providers to be able to access
- 25 those wireless telematic systems. So that's one area

- where we'd like to see this exemption expanded.
- In addition, we'd like to see the removal of
- 3 the kind of duplicate liability for violating another
- 4 law. So to the extent that the current language of
- 5 the exemption imposes an obligation to follow other
- 6 laws, we think that compounds liability in a way that
- 7 really doesn't add any extra deterrent effect and is
- 8 just kind of hammering on, and adding complexity and
- 9 risk of litigation, to people using the exemption.
- 10 We'd be open to phrasing that in a different
- 11 way that, again clarified that the exemption is not
- 12 authorizing or making lawful any activity that
- violates another law, but this compounding of
- liability we think is an extra burden on the people
- 15 who benefit from the exemption that should be trimmed.
- 16 MR. BARTELT: Okay. Thank you, Ms. Sheehan,
- 17 and I'm actually going to ask Mr. Rosenbaum about that
- in a second, but I wanted to turn to Mr. Cheney first,
- 19 because he had his hand raised.
- 20 Please go ahead, Mr. Cheney.
- MR. CHENEY: Thank you.
- 22 And my line of questions actually followed
- the same line of reasoning here, because you brought
- that up originally, and so I just wanted to pivot just
- 25 a little bit on what Ms. Sheehan said.

1	And so this has come up a little bit in
2	other exemption discussions. In Class 13, Rapid7
3	proposed some language, and this language has been
4	talked about in other exceptions, possibly to replace
5	"this does not violate any other applicable law."
6	So let me read what they proposed, and this
7	has been endorsed in that space, good faith security
8	research, by the Department of Justice and others, so
9	let me read what they propose here and just sort of
10	substitute the words in.
11	In this case, it says, "Good faith security
12	research that qualifies for the exemption under
13	Paragraph A, whatever we write there, "may
14	nevertheless incur liability under other applicable
15	laws, including, without limitation, and in this
16	case, they list Computer Fraud and Abuse Act, et
17	cetera.
18	So would that be acceptable modification
19	language, Ms. Sheehan and others, both opponents and
20	proponents, in sort of finding a middle ground on tha
21	change? Just if you think.
22	MS. SHEEHAN: I think that would absolutely
23	be acceptable.

MR. BARTELT: Okay. And, Mr. Rosenbaum, go

24

25

ahead.

- 1 MS. SMITH: Can I --
- MR. BARTELT: Oh, go ahead, Regan.
- 3 MS. SMITH: Just a second, Mr. Bartelt.
- 4 Yeah. I might have missed it, but either I need to
- 5 clarify for myself what was said, or we need to
- 6 clarify the record.
- 7 I think in 2018, the Register recommended
- 8 removing the limitation that excluded access to
- 9 telematics and made it when it is necessary for
- 10 repair, so I think I'm still a little confused as to
- 11 what the proposed scope of the change is, because it
- seems like some of what you're saying about modern
- cars is already being addressed. If I'm missing
- 14 something, let --
- MS. SHEEHAN: Sorry, Ms. Smith. You said
- 16 the 2018 exemption covers access to wireless telematic
- 17 systems for the purpose of repair?
- 18 MS. SMITH: That's right. We considered
- 19 that, and we granted that adjustment and removed the
- 20 limitation that had been put in place in 2015. So
- 21 it's broader. That was a change made in 2018. That
- 22 is --
- MS. SHEEHAN: Then I must --
- 24 MS. SMITH: -- we are recommending renewal
- 25 for. That's fine. I just -- glad that we just --

Heritage Reporting Corporation (202) 628-4888

- we're making progress and getting things clear. Okay
- 2 Mr. Bartelt?
- 3 MR. BARTELT: Sure.
- I wanted to -- I guess that my question was
- 5 similar to Mr. Cheney's, so I was going to ask Mr.
- 6 Rosenbaum about this sort of -- the removal of the
- 7 language concerning -- or modification of the language
- 8 concerning that the exemption not violate any other
- 9 applicable law and any concerns that he might have
- 10 about that. And he may have wanted to respond to some
- of the other comments that were made.
- 12 Please go ahead, Mr. Rosenbaum.
- 13 MR. ROSENBAUM: Yeah, thank you. Thank you
- 14 very much. I'll start with what I call the illegality
- 15 limitation, which is the limitation in the existing
- 16 vehicle exemption that circumvention does not
- 17 constitute a violation of applicable law. We would
- 18 not support any relaxation of that. That is a
- 19 critical limitation.
- The 2015 record was replete with information
- 21 on automotive vehicle software which controls complex
- 22 aspects of motor vehicle performance and ensures that
- vehicles meet stringent regulatory standards for
- 24 safety, fuel efficiency, and emissions control.
- 25 You know, the Copyright Office rightly

Heritage Reporting Corporation (202) 628-4888

- 1 recognized this in crafting the vehicle exemption in
- 2 the 2015 rulemaking, that the automotive industry is
- 3 highly regulated, and so they took into account --
- 4 rejecting arguments that these risks were unrelated to
- 5 copyright concerns, finding that these were of
- 6 overriding importance, basing it on letters received
- 7 from the EPA, the Department of Transportation, and
- 8 California's Air Resources Board finding the
- 9 illegality limitation was necessary.
- There's nothing in this record that would
- 11 mitigate anything that was provided in 2015.
- 12 Expanding the exemption would risk public safety and
- cause environmental harms, potentially. So again, we
- would not support any relaxation of the illegality
- 15 limitation.
- 16 Sort of getting to the -- you know, I don't
- 17 want to get too much into telematics, since, as Regan
- pointed out, that was at issue in 2018.
- 19 You can see from our 2018 filing that
- 20 telematics, all -- again, back to the MOU, but not
- just the MOU, state and federal regulations going back
- 22 to 2002 requires automobile manufacturers to provide
- 23 repair and diagnostic tools and information to
- independent repair shops to the same extent as
- 25 dealers.

1	And whether that information is in
2	telematics or not, that information needs to be
3	provided to the independent repair shops. So it's
4	just simply not an issue. And our view here is that
5	the existing language of the exemption does not cover
6	third-party repair, commercial repair, shops.
7	And to the extent that there's any
8	suggestion that there should be some affirmative
9	language that would cover them, we would oppose that,
10	and we don't believe there's anything in this record
11	that would support that.
12	You know, as we've said, and you can look at
13	our filing, again, the MOU obviates any need for that
14	sort of thing. Anyone who needs their car repaired is
15	able to get it repaired. There's nothing on the
16	record suggesting otherwise. And of course, the
17	statutory framework doesn't permit it. So I don't
18	want to get I could go into depth on each of those
19	things, even further.
20	I guess one thing that was a reply and
21	this might be my only opportunity to reply to this
22	there was a reply from the Auto Care Association on
23	the MOU that was extremely misleading, suggesting that
24	it does not apply to all users and to all independent
25	repair shops. In fact, it does. You know, under the

- 1 MOU, manufacturers make the tools and information
- 2 available to everyone.
- And also, there's a provision in the MOU
- 4 requiring standardized tools so it's not -- the
- 5 suggestion was that independent repair shops are
- 6 forced to buy tools from the manufacturer. That is
- 7 not the case.
- And finally the issue of whether they're
- 9 prohibitively expensive, which we've heard -- the MOU
- 10 includes provisions that these tools and information
- 11 are provided on fair and reasonable terms, and this
- language goes back to regulatory language back to
- 13 2002.
- 14 There's never been any dispute brought under
- either regulation or the MOU suggesting that these are
- 16 not being provided on fair and reasonable terms. You
- 17 know, and this just simply isn't the forum to litigate
- 18 that. You know, there should be the MOU. There are
- other places if there's a dispute.
- 20 So with that I appreciate the opportunity to
- 21 say my piece. Thank you.
- 22 MS. SMITH: Thank you, Mr. Rosenbaum. And
- 23 thank you for your patience, because I understand on
- the road map, this came to the end, so we're glad
- 25 you're here, and we know this is a tremendous amount

- of issues. We've got the benefit of your briefing.
- We also went a little bit over. I think
- 3 this is sort of last call for comments, and people
- 4 could try to keep it a little bit short, because we've
- 5 got a lot here.
- But, Ms. Gagliano?
- 7 MS. GAGLIANO: Sure. So first, I wanted to
- 8 share one quick point in response to what Mr.
- 9 Rosenbaum was saying about the safety and emissions
- 10 regulations.
- 11 EFF actually sent FOIA requests to the EPA
- and Department of Transportation, and their responses
- 13 confirmed that they have never actually used 1201 or
- relied on it in any way to help enforce these
- 15 standards.
- 16 They aren't actually making use of it, which
- 17 I think reinforces Ms. Sheehan's point that it's
- 18 really superfluous, second layer, and draw attention
- 19 to the distinction only the Copyright Office can grant
- 20 exemptions. FDA and then --
- MS. SMITH: Can I ask you --
- MS. GAGLIANO: Okay.
- MS. SMITH: -- is that response in the
- 24 record? It might be, but have you provided that to
- 25 us?

- 1 MS. GAGLIANO: I don't think that we have.
- MS. SMITH: Okay. Thanks.
- 3 MS. GAGLIANO: Probably not. And then in
- 4 terms of just --
- 5 MS. SMITH: Okay, thank you.
- 6 MS. GAGLIANO: -- the closing comment
- 7 quickly is that on modification, which was really the
- 8 focus of our request, especially want to reiterate
- 9 that the question is not whether there are infringing
- 10 modifications that are prevented by TPMs in 1201, but
- 11 that the question is whether there are non-infringing
- 12 modifications that are being adversely affected and
- prevented by 1201. And we have shown that there are.
- 14 And these include modifications that promote
- the creation of new copyrighted works, including new
- 16 photographic works by modifying digital cameras, new
- 17 software works by building on what's come before. And
- 18 I think the recent decision in Google v. Oracle really
- 19 reinforces the importance and transformative nature of
- 20 that purpose, the purpose of expanding the utility of
- 21 software. So I think that is the point that I wanted
- 22 to leave you all with.
- MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- Mr. McHarque?
- MR. McHARGUE: Well, I appreciate this

Heritage Reporting Corporation (202) 628-4888

- 1 conversation. Unfortunately, the ag exemption isn't
- quite the same as the auto sector, because we do not
- 3 have a national MOU, and so we still are constrained
- 4 by a lot of necessary tools having to go back to the
- 5 original OEM to get that service.
- 6 And we desperately need access to those
- 7 third-party experts on a broad scale, because, again,
- 8 we don't have an MOU nationally that is kind of
- 9 putting in place these standards, nor do we have a
- 10 dispute arena that we can go back and we can say, "We
- 11 need to be playing together in a certain form or
- 12 fashion."
- But again, thank you for allowing me to be
- 14 here. I appreciate the work of the Office.
- 15 MS. SMITH: Thank you. We appreciate you
- 16 coming and bringing your perspective, too.
- 17 Ms. Sheehan, I saw you sort of nodding
- during the last comment. If you wanted at all to
- 19 comment on -- obviously, this rulemaking is limited to
- 20 the anti-circumvention provision and not the anti-
- 21 trafficking provision. But that was a question that
- just sparked me about the ag market.
- 23 MS. SHEEHAN: Absolutely. We completely
- 24 agree with the Office's interpretation of the statute,
- 25 that Congress, in using the term "user," deliberately

- chose not to use the term "owner." And therefore, the
- 2 exemption is not limited to the owner of the device.
- 3 It's to anyone who is using the device, including
- 4 potentially a third-party provider of repair services.
- 5 And so we fully endorse that, and we would
- 6 request that permission for third-party assistance
- 7 extend to all exempted categories.
- I just wanted to say a couple of things, one
- 9 in response to Mr. Rosenbaum and one kind of wrapping
- 10 up our testimony as a whole, and just say that Mr.
- 11 Rosenbaum put a lot of weight on the existence of
- 12 alternatives and the existence of branded repair
- 13 services.
- 14 But this office has never found the
- 15 existence of alternatives sufficient to defeat an
- 16 exemption where adverse impact exists. And to do so
- in this case would, as I've said before in this
- 18 hearing, give copyright holders a new right that they
- don't have under the Copyright Act, that they don't
- 20 have under section 106, which is the right to control
- 21 the market for repair services.
- 22 And you know, we know from *Chamberlain* that
- 23 that right does not exist. And so I would argue that
- even though there might be alternatives, in some cases
- 25 those alternatives are going to be inadequate. In

- 1 some cases, they might not exist at all. But even
- when they are there, that itself is not determinative.
- 3 And then I just want to close by just
- 4 summing up whether we're talking about medical
- 5 devices, or tractors, or cars, or software-enabled
- 6 litter boxes, we're essentially talking about the same
- functional software, the same copyright analysis, the
- 8 same purpose of the use.
- And so in our perspective, the proper scope
- 10 for an exemption here is an exemption for the repair
- of all software-enabled devices. We just want to fix
- 12 stuff.
- MS. SMITH: Thank you.
- 14 Mr. Wiens?
- 15 MR. WIENS: Thank you. One thing I thought
- 16 that I would mention is -- you think about how to
- 17 craft this -- is John Deere's Service ADVISOR is a
- 18 subscription repair service. And in the existing
- 19 rule, you separated out subscription services. I
- think that it was thinking of Spotify or SiriusXM, or
- 21 something.
- 22 But imagine a world where like OnStar, you
- 23 may be paying the manufacturer for a repair service,
- 24 and that may implicate whatever decision that you
- 25 make. Thank you very much.

848

1	MS. SMITH: Okay. Thank you.
2	And, Mr. Williams, I think you're usually
3	the last to be introduced as a "W," so it's kind of
4	fitting for you to get the last word so go ahead.
5	MR. WILLIAMS: Yeah, thank you. Just
6	quickly, on the question that's mostly been related to
7	medical devices and vehicles but is coming up as a
8	general proposition of how far the Office should go
9	with respect to third-party services, I just wanted to
LO	reemphasize that it's extremely important to my
L1	clients that the Office remain cognizant of that line
L2	between trafficking and 1201(a)(1). And so I just
L3	wanted to reiterate that.
L 4	And then a couple of points that Ms. Sheehan
L5	made a couple of times that I did want to respond to.
L6	One is that she said "alternatives to circumvention
L7	has never been a basis to deny a proposal." That's
L8	not correct. It's consistently been a basis to deny
L9	proposals. And where there are alternatives to
20	circumvention, exemptions should not be granted.
21	Another point was just that and I know
22	the Office staff is aware of this, but I wanted to get
23	it on the record, because it came up a few times. I
24	believe she said that Chamberlain has never been

challenged. Chamberlain is wrong. The Office has

25

849

- 1 said it's wrong. MDY says it's wrong. Chamberlain is
- 2 not good law at this point, in my view, and we
- 3 shouldn't be granting exemptions -- or you should not
- 4 be, excuse me, based on the reasoning in Chamberlain.
- 5 There is a new exclusive right. It's the
- 6 right of access. It's in 1201(a)(1). And it's a good
- 7 thing. Thank you.
- 8 MS. SMITH: All right.
- 9 Thank you, everybody. Thank you for your
- 10 patience and willingness to go over as we help develop
- 11 the record through this discussion. If we think we
- 12 need anything further, we'll be issuing letters for
- 13 post-hearing comments. And there will also be
- opportunity to participate through ex parte meetings
- 15 subject to transparency disclosures once we initiate
- 16 that.
- 17 So thanks again, and then tomorrow will be
- our last day of hearings, in which we will address
- 19 proposed classes for jail-breaking and unlocking.
- 20 Thank you. Bye bye.
- 21 (Whereupon, at 1:08 p.m., the meeting in the
- above-entitled matter was adjourned, to reconvene at
- 23 10:30 a.m. April 21, 2021, the following day.)
- 24 //
- 25 //

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE

CASE TITLE: Copyright Office Section 1201 Hearing

HEARING DATE: April 20, 2021

LOCATION: Washington, D.C.

I hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence are contained fully and accurately on the tapes and notes reported by me at the hearing in the above case before the Library of Congress.

Date: April 20, 2021

John Gillen

Official Reporter

Heritage Reporting Corporation

Suite 206

1220 L Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20005-4018

Section	on 1201 Rulemaking Hearing	g April 20), 2021
\$	70 [1] 807:1	action [3] 786:15,15 806:10	agriculture [2] 781:4 810:18
	710 [1] 814:4	active [1] 798:25	ahead [14] 736:22 759:5 779:5 802:
\$150 [1] 808:1	75 [1] 835: 21	activities [6] 794:16 796:5,13 804:	14 804 :24 812 :7 821 :10 823 :3
\$250 [1] 808:1	9	22 808: 13 821: 17	826 :11 836 :20 837 :25 838 :2 839 :
\$60 [2] 778:4 779:5	————————————————————————————————————	activity [6] 787:21,23 789:12 792:	12 848 :4
\$ <u>800 [1]</u> 808:2	99 [6] 745 :18,18,21 748 :14 756 :19	9 818 :9 836 :12	AIAT [2] 805:9 806:4
1	757:7	actual থে 761: 25 791: 5 819: 22	air [2] 745: 6 840: 8
// [2] 849 :24,25	A	actually [40] 753: 5 756: 9,13 759: 8,	alert [1] 731:22
1	a.m [3] 731 :2 745 :4 849 :23	12 761 :2,22 768 :25 769 :2,21,22	alive [1] 806:16
	A/V [1] 763:23	770 :21 775 :8 778 :9 782 :24 785 :	alleviate [1] 822:15
1:08 [1] 849:21	AACS [3] 734:19 753:11 785:2	13,21 786 :15 790 :12 791 :1 797 :2,	Alliance [1] 735:4
10:30 [1] 849:23	abiding [1] 790 :14	13 800:7 804:9 810:2,6 813:24	allow [9] 755:11 757:3,13 772:9
10:35 [1] 731:2	ability [10] 745 :15 754 :7 758 :12	823 :8,13,16,20 824 :4,10 827 :1	773:17,22 778:10 825:17,18
106 [2] 765 :11 846 :20	779 :16 787 :13 789 :23 799 :17 800 :	834: 18 836: 17,22 843: 11,13,16	allowed [3] 776:13 784:23 812:16
107 [1] 748 :24	8 806 :11 809 :2	ad [2] 759:16,18	allowing [4] 755:13 787:19 832:2
117 [2] 737 :5 748 :24	able [29] 742 :8 743 :16 744 :5 745 :9	ad-supported [1] 759:14	845 :13 allows [1] 824 :9
12 [1] 731 :6 1201 [26] 731 :5 744 :13 748 :2 761 :	755 :14 767 :12 772 :19 775 :2,5,13,	adage [1] 800:22 add [4] 739:5 777:24 800:23 836:7	alluded [1] 795 :16
1201 [20] 731: 5 744: 13 748: 2 761: 17 765: 8,11 766: 8 768: 23 769: 2	22,23 777 :8,9 779 :21 781 :2 787 :	added [1] 800:21	almost [3] 742:19 792:25 800:18
783 :6,9 789 :8,10 793 :15 797 :14	22 789 :2,9 797 :15 799 :21 805 :22	adding [1] 836:8	alphabetically [1] 733:9
798 :2,15 816 :25 818 :6 819 :4,6	808:19 812:23 813:9 814:9 832:	addition [4] 748:4 806:3 821:23	already [16] 739 :8 740 :6,7 751 :17
823 :9 824 :12 843 :13 844 :10,13	24 835 :24 841 :15	836:2	753 :16 762 :12 765 :10 777 :9 787 :
1201(a)(1 [2] 848:12 849:6	above-entitled [1] 849:22	additional [12] 759 :16,18 766 :1	18,20 789 :7 792 :8 795 :2 814 :2,5
13 [2] 799 :10 837 :2	absence [2] 762:18 818:9	770 :19 787 :4 795 :23 796 :11,16	838: 13
13485 [3] 807 :12 815 :8 822 :3	Absolutely [10] 742:10 762:17 763:6 766:12,14 768:21 800:16	810 :19 811 :7 820 :14 831 :23	alter [1] 793:17
2	827:8 837:22 845:23	address [16] 735:17 738:20 749:	altered [1] 771:11
	abstract [1] 747:14	16 750 :13 755 :12 760 :13 763 :7,	alternative [1] 821:16
200 [3] 748 :13 756 :20 757 :5	Abuse [2] 822:14 837:16	21 767 :20 785 :21 786 :14 793 :14	alternatives [16] 742:6 748:5,24
2002 [2] 840 :22 842 :13	abuses [1] 764:20	817: 22 828 :14,22 849 :18	764: 23,24,25 765: 4,5,16 782: 18
2007 [1] 785:5	acceptable [3] 805:7 837:18,23	addressed [3] 764:16 767:24 838:	846: 12,15,24,25 848: 16,19
2012 [1] 782:14	accepted [1] 791:21	13	Amer [40] 732 :17,19,19 770 :14,18,
2015 [4] 838 :20 839 :20 840 :2,11	accepts [1] 751:20	addresses [1] 822:7	21 773 :10,13 774 :9 776 :1 778 :24
2017 [1] 813 :21	Access [64] 734:18 741:23 748:1	adequate [1] 805:6	780 :11 781 :14,16 783 :12,15 784 :
2018 [21] 761 :9 764 :16 795 :17,22 798 :17,19 800 :3 810 :20,22 816 :1	749 :19,21 751 :3 752 :1 756 :22	adjacent [1] 827:17	16 785 :18 787 :2,7 788 :17 790 :1
817 :6 822 :6 824 :3 832 :1 835 :10,	762 :5 771 :2,7 779 :21 781 :6,9 787 :	adjourned [1] 849:22	791:6 793:21 794:5,7 795:8 824:
15 838 :7,16,21 840 :18,19	20 788 :24 791 :25 793 :5 797 :2,13	adjustment [1] 838:19	14,19 826 :10,11,12,20,23 827 :23
2019 [1] 798: 23	800 :7,12,13 802 :3 804 :9,13,18,21	adjustments [2] 731:7 734:14 Administrator [1] 734:18	828:9 829:23,25 830:4 831:2
2020 [1] 800:18	809 :10,18,20,21 811 :9,10 812 :17	Advanced [1] 734:18	American [2] 734:5 770:2 amount [6] 745:8 746:2 808:18
2021 [2] 834:12 849:23	813 :8 818 :18,21 825 :10,14,17,18,	adverse [10] 742:1 752:9 766:9,15	827:2 832:9 842:25
21 [1] 849: 23	20 826:4,7,12,15 827:4,12,20 828:	706.4 907.00 04 909.5 944.40	amusing [1] 742 :13
294 [2] 813 :21 814 :23	8,13 831 :8,12 832 :4,5,6 835 :16,22,	846: 16	analogous [1] 749:2
3	24 838:8,16 845:6 849:6	adversely [4] 761:13 797:14 805:	analogy [3] 736 :24 741 :19 755 :6
	accessed [2] 742:9 751:20	17 844:12	analysis [9] 738:11 748:2,3 797:4,
3:00 [1] 745:4	accessibility [1] 764:7	Advisor [4] 733:4 809:25 832:5	5 798 :15 807 :9 821 :17 847 :7
30 [3] 767 :8 813 :6 814 :22	accessing [1] 743:20 Accolade [1] 768:1	847 :17	ancillary [1] 809:14
360 [1] 798: 25	accommodate [2] 758:12 831:19	advocates [1] 737:16	and/or [1] 813:22
38,500 [2] 813:21 814:23	accomplished [1] 752:1	affected [2] 761:13 844:12	Android [1] 834:16
4	accomplished 19752.1	affects [1] 797:14	announced [1] 798 :23
4 [1] 779 :12	according [1] 813:20	affirm [1] 822:5	another [15] 737:23 738:23 745:16
40 [2] 813 :21 814 :22	account [2] 808:8 840:3	affirmative [1] 841:8	746 :4 750 :1 760 :21,23 765 :9 788 :
42 [1] 805 :5	accountability [1] 814:18	after-market [2] 801:6,12	19 794 :24 818 :23 819 :21 836 :3,
482 [1] 805: 6	acknowledge [2] 747:11 750:4	aftermarket [1] 750:18	13 848: 21
<u></u>	acknowledged [4] 748:21 764:10,	afterwards [1] 819:20	answer [9] 748:14 776:13 778:21
	15 806 :8	ag [6] 769 :14,24 831 :25 833 :13	784 :14 802 :1 803 :20 804 :3 827 :7
5 [1] 779:12	acquire [1] 740:4	845:1,22	828 :3
50 [2] 767:8 813:6	acquired [3] 740:17 764:6,9	agency [1] 824:2	answered [1] 832:21
6	across [6] 742:1 747:12 748:7 760:	agnostic [1] 736:12	answers [1] 795:11
60 [1] 778 :22	4,12 802 :8	ago [3] 738:3 834:7 835:4	anti [1] 845:20
600 [1] 830 :15	act 5 740:2 814:4 822:14 837:16	agree [5] 739:3 749:7 756:9 821:	anti-circumvention [2] 755:4
7	846: 19	11 845:24	845:20
	acting [1] 795 :19	agreement [1] 827:15	anti-competitive [1] 765:18
		I	1

anticipating [1] 752:3 anyway [3] 769:18 770:22 773:1 App [5] 734:25 741:3,11 757:8 819: Appalachia [1] 805:19 apparent [1] 792:10 appellate [1] 783:9 Apple [5] 766:25 767:3 801:9 802: 4 834:15 Apple-authorized [1] 766:24 appliances [1] 762:15 applicable [7] 773:21 805:4 814:7 **837**:5.14 **839**:9.17 application [3] 782:10 783:1 786: applications [1] 783:3 applies [2] 761:7 778:17 apply [4] 771:4 793:4 823:11 841: appreciate [14] 770:9 781:16 782: 5 **793**:13 **805**:2 **808**:19 **809**:16 **810**:20 **811**:3 **831**:20 **842**:20 **844**: 25 **845**:14 15 approach [5] 749:1 751:22 752:5 **792**:2.3 approaches [1] **782**:17 appropriate [4] 757:14 760:25 **761**:1 **830**:24 appropriately [1] 824:9 apps [1] 741:2 April [1] 849:23 area [6] 741:19 769:18 807:16 825: 14 831:23 835:25 areas [2] 736:20 802:14 aren't [7] 740:8 775:19 790:9 792: 7 **798:**23 **821:**5 **843:**16 arena [1] 845:10 arguably [1] 794:16 argue [1] 846:23 argument [3] 762:10 791:13 825: arguments [1] 840:4 around [7] 789:18,18 812:23 823: 21 824:12 834:17 835:20 arrangements [1] 807:6 artificial [1] 745:24 aspect [1] 810:16 aspects [1] 839:22 assembly [2] 805:12 806:4 assistance [2] 731:23 846:6 Assistant [1] 732:24 associated [2] 812:13.13 associates [1] 823:19 Association [10] 733:25 734:11, 20.25 736:10 737:15 741:11 766:

attractive [3] 771:12 773:5.7 attractiveness [1] 754:10 attributable [1] 761:10 audience [2] 731:20 732:2 audio [1] 751:25 authentication [1] 784:7 authoring [1] 772:1 authority [1] 821:21 authorize [2] 764:13 829:20 authorized [2] 753:13 769:19 authorizing [1] 836:12 Auto [9] 735:5 750:21 751:2.10 **834**:5.16.24 **841**:22 **845**:2 automation [4] 743:15.21 745:17 746:10 automobile [4] 750:12,22 781:3 840:22 automobiles [2] 750:16.17 Automotive [3] 735:5 839:21 840: availability [4] 790:8 798:19 799: 12 817:18 available [10] 754:5 757:3 781:7 785:4.7.12 787:4 789:1 792:17 842.2 Avante [2] 733:21 780:18 avenue [1] 777:13 avoid [2] 759:9 803:11 aware [1] 848:22 away [5] 744:18 759:9,17,24 790:7 Ayers [24] 734:15,16,17 751:15 **752**:12 **754**:11,17 **770**:12,23 **771**: 16 773:12.19 776:12.21 777:15 **781**:24 **784**:19 **785**:18.20 **793**:22 794:2.3.6.9 Ayers's [1] 770:20

В

back [23] 737:17 752:17 754:13 763:23 767:3.10 769:22 777:8 779:22 782:13 792:23 800:17 805: 13 808:20 816:15 820:8 833:3 840:20,21 842:12,12 845:4,10 background [1] 819:16 bad [3] 753:16 759:12 793:18 ballot [1] 835:20 bar [2] 758:10 778:17 barn [1] 788:25 barred [1] 797:23 Bartelt [39] 732:17,21,21 795:12, 14 **797**:16 **799**:23.25 **802**:15 **804**: 4 **808**:14.16 **809**:5 **810**:23 **811**:2 **812:**3 **813:**10.14 **815:**24 **816:**3.8 819:10 821:8.10 822:8 823:1 826: 9,11 831:1 832:22 833:23 834:3 835:7 836:16 837:24 838:2,3 839: Bartelt's [1] 828:3

based [3] 785:16 792:9 849:4 basic [7] 767:1 804:15,21 805:24 812:14,18,22 basically [4] 745:9 799:6 831:5 **833:**16

basing [1] 840:6 basis [4] 765:15 781:7 848:17,18 batteries [5] 800:25 801:3,4,5,9 battery [4] 800:22,23 801:6,10 become [3] 772:18 785:12 805:15 begin [1] 736:7 behalf [2] 734:11 830:11 behave [1] 757:22 believe [10] 782:13 783:20 796:7 797:10 802:20 808:22 812:7 822: 7 841:10 848:24 believed [1] 799:14 benefit [3] 772:11 836:15 843:1 besides [1] 809:12 best [4] 744:2 747:12 776:12 809: bet [1] 824:19 better [2] 752:15 794:11 between [8] 738:13 748:22 755:18 760:14 795:1 796:12 816:6 848: beyond [5] 753:5,6 761:2 816:24 829:24 bia [2] 731:9 793:15 bigger [2] 735:13 777:13 biggest [1] 783:7 bill [1] 834:24 biomedical [1] 829:11 bit [30] 740:21 741:11 742:7 747:6 **753**:22 **762**:24 **776**:5,18 **781**:19 788:23 794:19 795:21 798:22 802: 21 **804**:7,8,17 **810**:4 **811**:11,13,20 **813**:17 **816**:18,24 **831**:6,9 **836**:25 837:1 843:2 4 black [1] 779:7 blah [2] 740:17 18 Blu [1] 790:21 Blu-Ray [13] 735:24 752:7 753:25 761:8 774:5 779:15 784:20 785:1, 6,15 787:17 834:10,13 Blu-Rays [3] 752:18 774:15 786: board [3] 788:2 802:9 840:8 boards [1] 788:1 bog-standard [1] 802:2 boot [1] 802:8 bootloader [1] 756:11 both [12] 764:7 768:18 771:20 773: 2 786:21 788:8 796:20.22 797:8 804:16,17 837:19 bounding [1] 794:13 box [3] 738:15 778:10 796:21 boxes [3] 750:2 796:6 847:6 Brad [1] 732:23 branded [7] 746:6 765:14 766:7 801:5 821:1 833:18 846:12

briefing [1] 843:1 briefly [3] 767:24 768:18 831:3 bring [1] 808:8 bringing 3 751:18 797:23 845:16 broad [2] 738:9 845:7 broaden [1] 736:10 broader [4] 741:1 776:17,22 838: broken [4] 757:3 759:15 789:14.23 brought [5] 754:17 785:3 811:24 836:23 842:14 bucks [1] 778:23 budgets [1] 805:23 build [1] 756:15 building [8] 743:15,21 744:24 745: 17 **746**:10 **749**:5 **756**:18 **844**:17 bulb [1] 738:14 bulbs [1] 738:5 bulletins [1] 821:12 bumping [1] 809:23 bunch [1] 738:4 burden [1] 836:14 Bureau [2] 734:5 770:2 Burke [17] 733:12.13.13 754:16.24 **764**:12 **774**:10,11 **788**:18 **790**:2,3 **796**:16 **797**:17,19 **799**:24,25 **802**: business [3] 757:8 823:18 830:22 businesses [1] 780:18 button [2] 731:16 755:8 buy [8] 740:4 757:6 767:2 787:15 **799:**5 **809:**24 **810:**2 **842:**6 Bve [2] 849:20.20 bypass [3] 760:21 820:16,25 bypassing [1] **785:**9 C C.F.R [1] 805:5 C.T [1] 781:11 Cal [1] 811:21 calibrate [1] 829:21

California's [1] 840:8 call [8] 738:17 742:21 746:16 776: 23 787:15 824:5 839:14 843:3 called [4] 812:4 814:2 823:16 833: calling [2] 753:3 811:14 cam [3] 742:19 743:13 752:11 came [4] 796:7 823:15 842:24 848: cameras [1] 844:16 camps [1] 759:11 Canal [1] 799:16 cannot [5] 751:25 782:15 810:3 816:13,14 cap [1] 808:4 capable [2] 784:7 813:7 capacity [1] 807:15 capital [1] 805:23 car [5] 834:7,12,18 835:6 841:14

Cara [1] 733:17

card [2] 779:6.11

breaching [1] 825:9

breaks [1] 806:3

breaking [2] 751:25 760:5

2811:9

break [5] 745:9 758:12 759:25 761:

brief [4] 779:2 781:23 794:10 830:

19 786:10 841:22

assume [1] 739:1

assuming [1] 761:16

attention [1] 843:18

attached [2] 739:22.23

Attorney [2] 733:4 769:10

Attorney-Advisor [1] 732:22

cards [2] 745:18.21 care [9] 780:17,21 781:13 807:13 812:19 813:5 816:6 817:21 841: careful [2] 770:4,7 CarPlay [1] 834:15 carried [1] 768:5 carry [1] 766:22 cars [4] 834:9,19 838:13 847:5 cartridges [1] 796:5 carve [1] 752:6 carving [1] 752:22 case [24] 743:9.18 745:9 746:20. 25 756:15 761:25 773:25 778:16. 20 783:8,11 786:13 787:1 789:12 801:8 828:14,25 833:8,16 837:11, 16 842:7 846:17 cases [12] 742:16,19 758:2 769:5 **780**:24 **783**:5 **786**:18,21 **806**:14 821:3 846:24 847:1 cat [2] 756:6 796:21 categories [9] **737**:7,8,21,25 **742**: 1 **748**:19,22 **770**:16 **846**:7 category [5] 737:22 738:9 770:2 **792**:5 **795**:25 CatGenie [1] 796:21 cath [1] 781:11 causal [2] 795:20 796:12 causation [8] 736:2 738:21 739:6 **741**:25 **763**:9 **795**:17,24 **797**:18 cause [3] 774:14 807:9 840:13 caused [1] 815:10 causes [2] 806:10 818:11 causing [3] 796:4 807:24 808:5 cautious [1] 815:2 CCA [3] 734:19.21 785:2 Center [1] 805:4 centered [2] 816:25 834:17 centers [1] 812:20 Central [1] 734:4 certain [8] 737:8 748:5 752:23 762: 14 **766**:23 **772**:2 **821**:15 **845**:11 certainly [13] 736:5 752:12,20,23 **753**:17,20 **772**:15,24 **786**:16,18 **791**:22 **792**:7 **794**:12 certificates [1] 754:2 certification [1] 815:8 certified [2] 815:8 829:11 cetera [3] 784:8 799:19 837:17 chains [1] 799:11 chair [1] 821:2 challenge [1] 833:7 challenged [1] 848:25 challenges [1] 779:18 challenging [1] 799:19 Chamberlain [7] 765:7 819:3 846: 22 848:24.25 849:1.4 chance [4] 793:22 808:22 816:17 817.1 change [18] 745:10,19 746:3 755: 2 757:22 758:1.8.11 774:25 775:3. 5 **798**:11 **802**:12,18 **820**:19 **837**:

21 838:11.21 changed [8] 761:20 795:22 797: 19 799:8 800:2,19,19 834:6 changes [4] 798:9,17 801:18 802: changing [4] 753:10 755:13,25 835:20 channels [1] 798:20 charge [1] 766:1 charging [1] 759:23 chat [3] 731:19,21 732:1 cheap [1] 775:16 cheaper [1] 778:5 cheating [3] 747:23 768:20 769:3 check [1] 820:25 checking [1] 758:4 Cheney [15] 732:25 733:2,3 776:2, 3 777:15 808:22 810:24 811:1,3 812:3 833:1 836:18,20,21 Cheney's [1] 839:5 Chief [1] 733:4 China [1] 799:15 chip [1] 802:5 choice [1] 799:5 chose [1] 846:1 circle [1] 808:20 Circuit [2] 765:8 819:2 circumstance [1] 828:12 circumstances [4] 767:11 797:20 798:10 800:3 circumvent [11] 745:15 749:21 **753**:11 **762**:7,9 **773**:14 **775**:1 **784**: 23 800:8 804:2 819:13 circumvented [2] 775:11 819:17 circumventing [4] 749:19 812:14 819:23 834:8 circumvention [36] 748:1.5.25 **751:**24 **752:**8 **761:**23 **763:**15.19 **764**:10,13,20,24 **765**:1 **771**:6 **774**: 7 777:1,2,6,12 782:16,18 791:10, 19,20,24 796:2 802:11 803:23 820:1 822:21 823:1 828:4 833:15 839:16 848:16.20 circumventions [1] 797:3 cited [2] 821:13 822:20 citizen [1] 754:3 citizens [1] 790:13 City [1] 734:4 Civil [2] 823:21 830:18 claiming [2] 806:12 809:12 claims [2] 823:18 828:15 clarification [1] 812:10 clarified [1] 836:11 clarify [6] 741:9 809:8 811:4 833: 21 838:5.6 Class [7] 731:6 735:13,18 736:16 739:16 744:12 837:2 classes [3] 744:9 804:1 849:19 clear [5] 770:2 796:2 810:18 811:5 839:1 clearly [4] 732:12 791:24 815:23 816:1

clients [6] 752:16,24 769:1 786:16, 21 848:11 clinical [1] 807:14 clinics [1] 811:16 close [1] 847:3 closing [1] 844:6 CMS [1] 821:11 coaster [1] 742:20 codes [1] 810:1 coffee [1] 796:6 cognizant [2] 736:19 848:11 colleague 3 770:14 795:12 816: colleagues [1] 731:13 color [1] 742:7 combine [2] 810:5.11 come [12] 746:7 747:2 748:9 753:1 769:21 810:15 811:21 818:20 820: 8 825:13 837:1 844:17 comes [11] 775:4 778:2,7,14 799: 10.15 810:12 812:25 832:16 833: 10 834:12 comfort [1] 741:12 coming [8] 731:10 737:17 806:14 810:12 834:10 835:2 845:16 848: comment [17] 747:8 751:17 753: 15 754:18 757:16,17 760:10 773: 9 785:22 786:14 796:20 809:17 823:6 831:12 844:6 845:18,19 commenters [1] 754:19 comments [27] 750:13 753:1,4,23 760:13 762:23 768:19 782:5.6 783:11.21 785:3 786:8 792:13.16 793:25 796:17 797:17.22 802:20 803:3 804:10 822:18 833:4 839: 11 843:3 849:13 Commerce [1] 733:5 commercial [2] 772:16 841:6 Commission [1] 821:20 common [3] 739:16 746:22 820: 18 commonalities [1] 739:1 communicating [1] 731:21 communication [2] 732:13 787: Company [2] 733:21 745:23 compensated [1] 740:8 complete [3] 805:22 828:7 835:17 completely [6] 767:15,18 788:4,6 **799:**5 **845**:23 complex [1] 839:21 complexity [1] 836:8 compliance [1] **786**:12 complicated [2] 769:15 780:9 compounding [1] 836:13 compounds [1] 836:6 compromised [1] 772:19 compromises [1] 773:6 compromising [1] 774:2 computer [9] 736:15 739:12.19 740:16 774:23,24 809:10 822:13

computers [5] 801:21,22 802:1,7, computing [2] 800:5,10 concept [2] 756:10 771:17 concepts [1] 757:9 concern [11] 749:25 752:16 755: 12 **761**:18 **766**:7 **773**:19.24 **782**: 23 826:12 13 834:17 concerned [8] 760:3 769:12 24 776:22 794:19 818:4 826:14 829: concerning [4] 795:16 809:17 839:7.8 concerns [17] 731:6 749:16,20 **753**:8 **764**:19 **775**:4 **781**:25 **782**:2 **791:**3 **793:**15 **799:**24 **817:**11,22 822:7,15 839:9 840:5 conclude [2] 763:3 802:21 concluded [3] 736:15 741:20 782: concluding [1] 732:6 condense [1] 736:10 condition [1] 794:20 conditioning [1] 745:6 conditions [1] 766:10 conduct [2] 807:9,23 conducting [1] 805:20 conference [1] 824:5 configured [1] 744:24 confirmed [1] 843:13 conflicts [1] 826:7 confused [1] 838:10 confusing [1] 785:1 Congress [2] 798:7 845:25 Connected [3] 735:1 743:24 766: connection [4] 736:18 755:17 **758:2 805:2**5 consequences [1] 812:13 consider [4] 752:6 760:25 761:1 798:14 considered [2] 827:16 838:18 considering [1] 738:24 consistent [3] 747:21 748:7 821: consistently [3] 737:1 814:7 848: console [25] 748:16 749:20 755: 21 774:19 775:6.16 782:23 783: 21,22 784:1,13,14 785:24 786:3 787:11 788:15 792:25 793:2 795: 4 797:22 798:18 799:6 803:8,9,18 consoles [33] 735:25 747:20 748: 6 **750**:5 **752**:7,19 **754**:20,23 **761**:7 770:17 774:20 778:3 781:18,24 **787:**9 **788:**5,6,11 **789:**3,7,16,21 **792**:4,14,18,24 **798**:16 **799**:4,9 803:4 5 11 15 consolidation [1] 806:25 constitute [2] 736:15 839:17 constrained [2] 788:4 845:3

constrains [1] 823:21 constructed [1] 756:3 consumable [1] 801:2 consumables [5] 796:1,14,22 800:25 801:10 consumer [6] 762:15 771:17 772: 13,15 773:5 813:4 consumers [8] 772:12 775:14.20 **780**:17.21 **783**:13 **793**:17 **799**:4 contain [3] 817:25 827:1 8 contained [4] 740:16.19.24 829:6 Content [42] 734:18 751:22 752: 18 **753**:12 **754**:3.5.6.10 **756**:1 **763**: 23 764:2,3,6,17 771:17,18,19,20, 22,23 772:7,10,20,21,23 773:3 **774:**8 **775:**8,19 **784:**22,25 **785:**9, 14 786:1,9,19,22 787:1 790:19 **793**:5 **795**:6 **829**:4 context [9] 751:25 753:24 771:25 776:22 779:15 784:20 794:11 795: contexts [3] 764:20 773:23 795:1 continue [5] 737:14 744:3 752:20 803:4 813:12 continued [1] 817:18 continues [2] 737:19 786:23 Continuing [1] 737:6 contribute [1] 808:10 Control [11] 734:20 740:16,19 745: 7 **765**:12.19 **767**:14 **819**:8 **827**:21 839:24 846:20 controlling @ 739:13 740:25 741: 23 790:23 800:12 807:3 controls [15] 741:4 745:1.2.5 748: 1 **749**:19.21 **751**:3 **764**:2 **769**:3 771:2.5 797:2.13 839:21 conversation [11] 753:4 763:13 769:10.25 780:15 786:5 790:6 808:11 812:2 832:18 845:1 copied [2] 743:9 776:13 copies [4] 740:8,9 764:6 782:4 Copy [9] 734:20 743:7,8 764:2 779: 24,25 833:11,16,20 copying [1] 826:21 Copyright [44] 731:4,22 732:9,18 **735**:10 **738**:11 **740**:7 **743**:6 **749**: 24 750:3 757:24 758:10 759:20. 22 765:9.12 768:22 775:22.25 778:11 789:6.7 790:11 791:1 809: 12 810:19 815:1.17 818:2.4 819:5 **823**:9 **824**:22 **825**:4,12,19 **829**:3 **832**:15 **839**:25 **840**:5 **843**:19 **846**: 18,19 847:7 copyright-based [1] 768:23 copyright-related [1] 826:13 copyrighted [10] 738:25 752:2,10 **762**:5 **819**:18 **825**:11,15 **827**:13 829:1 844:15 core [3] 757:19 778:12 817:25 correct [1] 848:18 correctly [1] 763:24 Corresponding [1] 772:3

cost [5] 767:7 780:24 813:6 814:9 815:2 costly [2] 767:5 789:24 cough [1] 747:3 couldn't [2] 745:11 834:11 Counsel [5] 731:4 732:20.24 733: country [1] 789:18 couple [10] 736:1 752:25 756:8 **763**:7 **795**:9 **797**:11 **812**:10 **846**:8 848:14.15 course [9] 738:23 750:21 751:1 **757**:4 **792**:20 **797**:25 **798**:5 **800**: 14 841:16 court [3] 732:10 768:1 816:16 cover [5] 762:3 816:20 835:16 841: covered [3] 823:16.17.23 covers [2] 823:16 838:16 COVID [1] 799:14 cracked [1] 779:13 craft [1] 847:17 crafting [1] 840:1 created [2] 756:21 766:9 creating [2] 779:17 827:22 creation [2] 761:25 844:15 creative [1] 790:11 Creators [1] 735:10 credence [1] 832:2 credit [2] 779:6,11 criminal [1] 787:21 criminals [1] 787:21 crisis [1] 799:20 critical [4] 747:13 751:5 817:20 839:19 cross [1] 816:14 cross-cutting [1] 736:5 cryptographic [10] 754:1,8 771:9, 14 772:2,4 773:16,21 776:8 777: 18 CSS [1] 753:11 curious [3] 800:9 819:22 822:23 current [7] 742:9 751:19 758:15 777:2 831:10 835:15 836:4 currently [2] 735:20 803:7 customers [3] 781:6 789:22 812: cut [1] 824:20 cvber [2] 830:12.19 cycle [1] 762:11 cycles [1] 747:17

damn [1] 813:17 data [6] 819:19 820:23 828:5 831: 13 834:21 835:1 daughterboard [3] 755:17 757:18 758:3 Davidson [1] 783:8 day [4] 731:5 769:15 849:18,23 days [1] 746:23 deal [2] 806:19 808:12 dealers [2] 750:25 840:25 dealership [1] 766:23 dealerships [2] 769:19,19 dealing [1] 810:21 deals [1] 823:13 deaths [2] 813:21 814:23 decided [1] 765:8 deciding [1] 760:25 decision [2] 844:18 847:24 decisions [1] 748:18 decrease [1] 785:14 decreased [1] 747:25 decrypt [3] 772:6,9 774:5 decrypting [1] 785:4 decryption [7] 754:1 772:9 774:4, 15 **785**:5 **788**:24 **790**:8 DeCSS [1] 785:3 deep [1] 766:18 Deere [3] 766:23 832:6 833:18 Deere's [2] 833:19 847:17 default [1] 743:18 defeat [1] 846:15 defer [1] 821:6 define [1] 812:16 defined [2] 812:14.15 defining [1] 763:4 definitely [2] 799:12 827:19 definition [2] 740:24 784:5 delayed [1] 808:12 delays [2] 767:10 815:11 delegated [1] 821:21 deliberately [2] 789:6 845:25 delightful [1] 818:1 delivery [1] 807:13 demonstrated [1] 747:18 demonstrates [2] 790:9 799:16 denied [2] 797:24 798:19 denv [3] 765:15 848:17.18 Department [5] 733:5 783:10 837: 8 840:7 843:12 departments [1] 822:2 depend [2] 767:17 784:5 depending [2] 755:3 782:16 depth [1] 841:18 Deputy [1] 732:19 derivative [1] 760:15 descendant [1] 786:2 describe [3] 776:9 18 811:11 described [1] 776:11 description [2] 740:21 758:18 designed [1] 746:21 designing [1] 743:24 desirable [1] 774:3 desperately [1] 845:6 despite [1] 765:3 detail [4] 797:1,7,12 811:20 details [1] 810:8 determinative [1] 847:2 determine [1] 817:10 determined [1] 748:4 deterrent [1] 836:7

deviate [1] 748:17 device [75] 736:12 737:3,7,22 739: 24 740:4,5 747:25 748:10,10,19, 19 753:10 754:1,3,8 758:3 761:20 **763**:10,13,16 **764**:1 **767**:2,6,7 **768**: 2 771:5,11,19,22,24 772:4,5 773:3, 20,23 775:17,21 776:16,23,24 777: 6,8,10,14 779:22,23 780:1 782:11 **794**:20.21.21.23.23 **795**:18 **801**:11 803:20 804:6 807:13 818:6 22 819:6.7.21 820:23.23.24 828:4.5.6 829:16 830:3 833:21 846:2.3 device-agnostic [1] 735:22 device-specific [1] 770:16 devices [85] 735:23 736:2 737:9, 11,18,19 738:3,10,10 739:14,21 740:10 741:21 742:8,12,13,17 743:1,4,12,24 744:3,14 747:12,16, 22 748:7,21,22 750:14 752:17,22 **753**:6,18,19 **755**:18 **758**:23 **760**: 13 762:15 763:17.18.22 764:5 766:16 771:18 772:18 774:21 780: 3 **781**:18 **790**:14 **794**:18 **795**:13 24 796:14 798:24 799:9.12.17.17 800:13 802:5,7,19 803:25 804:9 **805**:5,11 **811**:17 **813**:2 **817**:8,17, 20 818:10,11,12 819:18,23,24 824: 11 829:14,20 834:18 847:5,11 848:7 diagnostic [6] 750:24 781:12 806: 12,25 807:2 840:23 differ [1] 738:13 difference [2] 794:25 816:6 different [20] 736:18 742:13.17 **745**:3 4 **748**:14 15 **749**:23 **750**:9 773:23 778:9 781:3.4 782:17 784: 11.13 831:9.11 834:5 836:10 differential [1] 808:1 difficult [4] 737:9 793:6 807:9 832: difficulties [1] 769:18 difficulty [4] 750:16 782:6 832:6,9 digital [2] 809:21 844:16 dire [1] 788:13 direct [4] 777:20 786:1 795:6 796: directed [3] 809:7 819:13 823:7 direction [1] 834:20 directly [2] 822:17 828:3 Director [1] 735:1 disability-related [1] 804:1 disadvantages [1] 760:1 disclosures [1] 849:15 discrepancy [1] 792:10 discuss [4] 740:15 797:9,12 802: discussed [2] 801:2 803:25 discussing [1] 802:22 discussion [8] 731:11 770:15 776: 4 815:20 25 825:4 826:4 849:11 discussions [1] 837:2

develop [2] 769:17 849:10

developed [1] **759**:13

disk [9] 752:17 771:25 772:2.8.10

774:5 778:2 783:2 795:1 disks [7] 772:7 778:11,22 782:1,5 **783**:3 **790**:22 dispute [8] 740:18 770:25 783:24 825:14 826:7 842:14,19 845:10 disputed [1] 819:4 distinct [1] 749:9 distinction [2] 751:1 843:19 distinctions [6] 747:16.18 748:22. 23 750:11 751:10 distinguishing [1] 760:14 distribute [1] 785:8 distributed [1] 759:13 distribution [3] 752:10 786:7 787: distributions [1] 742:23 division [1] 830:18 DMCA [1] 806:9 documented [1] 765:6 doing [13] 743:12 749:6 755:5 756: 24 757:21 759:23 787:21 789:8. 11 790:12 813:7 816:7 833:19 done [6] 750:19 760:2 773:25 810: 20 811:10 824:4 dongle 3 818:21 820:21 832:13 dongle-based [1] 829:22 door [3] 743:21 745:4 789:1 doors [2] 743:17 745:2 Dorman [2] 833:8.15 down [8] 743:4,15 746:14 770:5 **781**:10,11,11 **806**:3 downloading [1] 833:19 dozen [1] 746:12 draw [1] 843:18 drive [39] 755:2.14.15.16.20.25 **774**:13.18.23.24 **775**:5.8.9.13 **778**: 1.2.9.10.15.21 779:16.20 780:5.7 **782**:16 **783**:2.23 **784**:1 **787**:10 **788:**3 **789:**13,14,23 **791:**2 **795:**1 800:6.13 815:3 834:13 drives [7] 752:17 774:21 775:2,14 **782**:9 **788**:1 **834**:10 DRM-protected [1] 771:7 druthers [1] 743:25 duplicate [1] 836:3 during [2] 772:5 845:18 Duty [1] 787:15 DVD [22] 734:19.20.21 735:24 743: 7.7 **752**:7 **753**:25 **761**:7 **770**:22 771:2.9 772:13 773:15 774:5 776: 6 **778**:9 **784**:19 **785**:1,2,15 **792**:4 DVDs [8] 752:18 755:11 773:18 **774**:16 **780**:16 **781**:17 **785**:4 **790**: 22 Ε

e-recycling [1] 803:10 e-waste [1] 803:11 each [5] 738:10 773:20 816:3 831: 6 **841**:18 earlier [16] 763:7 767:13 771:8 773:8 783:17 785:22 786:5 790:6 795:16 802:19 804:7 812:5 821:

23 826:3 831:4.8 early [2] 746:23 786:2 easier [2] 756:1 806:4 easiest [1] 731:15 easily [1] 778:18 Eastern [1] 805:19 easy [1] 758:8 echo [1] 790:3 ecosystem [5] 755:21 757:8 771: 20 774:6 807:12 ECU [3] 833:10.12 835:6 EFF [4] 736:9 737:15 796:7 843:11 effect [9] 738:21.24 739:2.7 744: 13 752:9 766:9 814:5 836:7 effective [2] 754:9 817:16 effectively [3] 741:23 780:24 800: effectiveness [1] 817:7 effects [3] 739:18 742:1 796:4 efficiency [1] 839:24 effort [3] 741:9 786:12.19 efforts [6] 786:2 18 793:13 795:7 803:10 824:7 either [9] 736:8 761:17 762:6 767: 1 782:3.22 799:5 838:4 842:15 elaborate [2] 771:13 804:17 Electronic [3] 733:18 823:13,18 electronics [2] 771:18 772:14 element [1] 738:23 elementary [1] 744:17 elements [2] 786:20,20 else's [1] 758:12 embedded [4] 739:13 741:6 764:1 772:4 emissions [4] 768:21 769:3 839: 24 843:9 emotional [1] 818:1 enable [2] 761:21 827:13 enabled [3] 737:11 774:7 818:11 enabling [3] 758:24 762:5 777:11 **encountering** [1] **829**:15 encourage [3] 767:2 779:4 815:1 encrypt [1] 772:3 encrypted [2] 772:10 787:15 encryption [6] 738:8 772:11 779: 19 **785**:6 **787**:5 **791**:18 end [4] 773:4 788:7 810:10 842:24 endangers [1] 774:6 endina [1] 743:14 endorse [2] 788:21 846:5 endorsed [1] 837:7 ends [1] 755:4 enforce [1] 843:14 enforced [1] 783:10 engaged [1] 771:20 engaging [1] 823:23 engine [2] 778:1,17 engineer [2] 745:24 810:9

engineers [2] 807:15 829:11

enough [4] 796:25 797:1 808:17

enormous [1] 827:1

823:5

ensure [2] 814:7 824:8 ensures [1] 839:22 enter [1] 820:13 entertainment [3] 754:3 771:18 774:8 entire [6] 739:16 744:23 757:8 765: 19 774:6 787:25 entirely [2] 792:5 830:24 entities [5] 817:13.16.18 823:16. entity [1] 823:23 environmental [4] 751:4 770:3.8 EPA [3] 832:16 840:7 843:11 equation [1] 832:21 Equipment [36] 733:21 734:1 769: 14,22 780:19,25 781:4,5,9,12 804: 12 805:7 806:2,3,21 807:4,8,10,25 808:12 809:11 810:6,15 812:21, 24 **813**:1 **815**:11 **817**:12,15 **818**: 15 **820**:20 **821**:13.14.16 **831**:25 832:20 equitable [1] 828:8 errors [1] 810:1 especially [5] 749:20 768:3 812: 25 **815**:4 **844**:8 essential [2] 773:24 813:2 essentially [7] 740:22 756:25 757: 9,19 773:19 777:1 847:6 established [1] 747:21 et [3] 784:8 799:18 837:16 Even [19] 741:2 742:6,16 744:6 **760**:20.22 **761**:7 **784**:20 **785**:2 790:7,22 793:19 799:3,18 832:3, 11 841:19 846:24 847:1 event [3] 732:8 807:20 814:19 events [2] 807:22 808:5 everybody [3] 779:1,1 849:9 everybody's [1] 830:9 everyone [9] 740:13 749:12 754: 12 762:16 777:25 795:15 816:12, 17 **842**:2 everything [6] 736:4 739:4 745:14 762:25 780:16 801:22 everywhere [1] 805:19 evidence [9] 750:15 762:17.18.20 **782**:15 **785**:11.23 **792**:24 **817**:14 ex [1] 849:14 exact [3] 761:4 773:20 784:14 exactly [6] 756:14 757:11 780:1 782:21 825:6 833:15 example [18] 741:10 742:4 744:4, 9 745:16 746:15 747:20 750:15 **751**:24 **756**:20 **759**:6,21 **776**:7 **791**:15 **796**:21,22 **800**:14 **801**:1

examples [11] 741:21 748:8 753:4

796:7,25 797:8 800:10 820:1 822:

19.23 831:17

exceeding [1] 758:20

exception [1] 752:14

exceptions [1] 837:4

excited [1] 731:9

exclude [1] 819:8 excluded [1] 838:8 exclusive [4] 765:9,10 819:5 849: excruciating [1] 797:7 excuse [1] 849:4 Executive [1] 735:1 exempted [1] 846:7 exemption [83] 735:19 736:14,20 737:7 738:7 739:8 740:1 742:4 **749**:4.14 **751**:6.19 **752**:15 **753**:3 754:23 758:16 760:22.23 761:1.3. 5,7,10,15 **762**:3,6,14 **763**:14,14,25 **764**:11,12,21 **765**:3,15 **768**:23 **771:**4 **774:**13 **784:**20 **785:**10 **789:** 9,10 790:16,17,18 791:23 793:3, 20 798:11,18 801:21,24 804:1 805:17 808:5,6 810:19 812:11 **818:**5,9 **831:**10,15,16 **835:**11,15 **836**:1,5,9,11,15 **837**:2,12 **838**:16 839:8,16 840:1,12 841:5 845:1 846:2.16 847:10.10 exemptions [25] 731:8 732:6 733: 10 734:14 735:19 736:11 737:9 **740**:15 **741**:20 **742**:9 **751**:9.23 **761**:11 **762**:11,13,13 **765**:1 **791**: 15,17 792:8,21 793:14 843:20 848:20 849:3 exercise [1] 765:18 exfiltrate [1] 820:24 exist [6] 763:15,18 771:9 792:8 846:23 847:1 existence [7] 764:25 765:3,16 829: 18 **846:**11.12.15 existing [13] 736:11 751:6,8 791: 14 **822**:12.14 **831**:10.14.18 **833**:12 839:15 841:5 847:18 exists [5] 755:17 757:9.19 815:4 expanded [2] 733:10 836:1 expanding [3] 794:17 840:12 844: expansion [1] 760:4 expansions [2] 731:7 752:14 expectation [2] 793:16,18 expected [1] 821:19 expensive [3] 767:5 788:3 842:9 experience [3] 746:8 766:17.20 expert [2] 831:24 832:8 experts [4] 732:12 769:17 832:4 845:7 explain [2] 771:13,13 explanation [1] 782:21 explode [1] 737:19 expose [2] 773:16 777:18 exposed [7] 774:1 776:9,15,20,24 813:22 814:24 exposes [1] 823:24 expressed [1] 766:6 expressible [1] **751**:22 expressive [5] 752:18 763:23 764: 6.16 829:3

extent [20] 740:23 741:10 752:13, 21,23 753:9,17 754:7,25 763:11 769:21 772:18 773:6 792:21 798: 13 805:16 822:12 836:4 840:24 841:7 extra [2] 836:7 14 extracted [2] 776:23.24 extremely [7] 767:5,25 768:13,16 773:5 841:23 848:10 F facility [1] 807:18 facility's [1] 744:17 fact [10] 758:2 761:13 763:16.17 800:11 809:23 817:17 826:6 827: 10 841:25 factor [1] 798:15 factors [3] 739:17 748:3 828:23 factory [6] 746:11 747:2 780:2,4,4 833.9 facts [1] 798:22 factual [2] 770:25 783:18 fail [1] 775:15 failing [1] 804:19 failures [1] 815:17 fair [7] 737:4 748:2 797:4 828:7.23 842:11.16 fairly [2] 746:22 775:16 faith [2] 837:7,11 familiar [3] 817:6 824:3 833:8 far [6] 753:5 760:2 797:19 799:7 810:14 848:8 Farm [4] 734:5 769:11 770:2 833: farmer [2] 734:4 769:9 farmers [1] 833:7 fashion [1] 845:12 fast [1] 834:4 fatal [2] 765:1.2 FDA [26] 804:14 805:3.9 806:7 807: 17 814:1 815:16,18,18,18,21 816: 1 **817**:5,9,22 **818**:3 **822**:14 **823**:6, 7 824:2,8 825:3,25 830:13,22 843: FDA's [5] 813:20 814:4,11,15 817: FDA-mandated [1] 804:18 fearful [1] 806:17 fearmongering [2] 791:4 807:16 feature [2] 739:15 747:1 Federal [4] 765:8 806:10 819:2 840:21 fee [1] 809:22 feel [4] 747:8 749:3 791:4 808:6 felt [1] 749:5 few [8] 747:17,19 796:6 807:5 830: 20 831:10 832:23 848:23 fewer [1] 740:8 field [2] 810:11 824:22 fifth [1] 798:14 figure [2] 746:11,12

extend [2] 758:16 846:7

extensive [1] 746:8

file [1] 823:17 filed [2] 734:13 807:19 files [1] 833:14 filing [2] 840:19 841:13 final [1] 832:12 finally [2] 736:3 842:8 find [7] 745:25 746:18,22 778:21 786:10 789:25 834:11 finding [3] 837:20 840:5,8 finds [1] 771:21 fine [2] 779:20 838:25 finger [1] 747:19 finish [1] 810:16 firmware [32] 739:12,18,21,23,23, 25 740:1,3,6,9,9,11,15,20 741:6 **747:**25 **749:**15,19 **750:**2 **753:**18, 24,25 **761**:19 **764**:2 **771**:1 **773**:15 **790**:23 **820**:24 **833**:11,12,14,20 first [23] 735:17 736:21 740:5 763: 8.20 **770**:21 **773**:13 **777**:10 **778**:2. 7 14 23 795:25 796:9 797:20 805: 10 820:5 825:24 828:11 831:7 833:5 836:18 843:7 fit [1] 770:1 fitting [1] 848:4 fix [10] 749:19,25 769:21 780:10 **788**:5,10 **789**:16,22 **807**:7 **847**:11 Flash [5] 778:2,9,10,21 782:11 flexible [1] 773:22 focus [2] 802:21 844:8 focused [5] 731:6 743:6 748:20 804:6 830:2 focusing [1] 748:15 FOIA [1] 843:11 folks [7] 746:6.6.9 772:24 789:19 811:12.17 follow [4] 773:8.10 791:7 836:5 follow-up [1] 749:11 followed [1] 836:22 following [3] 750:10 795:15 849: forced [2] 757:25 842:6 form [4] 733:11 762:20 777:12 845: formalized [1] 822:1 format [2] 754:6 771:24 formats [1] 754:10 forth [2] 764:14 816:15 forum [1] 842:17 forward [6] 738:6 743:24 762:24 784:2 815:3 824:9 found [11] 743:3 767:6 768:1 780: 14 795:20 796:1 800:4 807:20

817:13 819:3 846:14

four-hour [1] 808:3

franchise [1] 750:25

11 790:7 803:11

Fraud [2] 822:13 837:16

four [1] 803:4

Foundation [1] 733:18

framework [2] 757:13 841:17

free [8] 747:8 759:9.14.18.25 786:

frequent [1] 775:15 G.M [2] 833:8,16 Gagliano [29] 733:16,17,17 738: 17 739:3 740:22 741:13.18 754: 14 760:8.16 762:20 763:24 764:

friend [1] 778:21 Frontier [1] 733:18 frustrating [1] 746:1 fuel [1] 839:24 full [6] 777:11 784:6 787:25 789:21 **797:4 818:**18 fully [4] 765:5 812:21 814:13 846:5 function [3] 755:8 783:22 784:5 functional [6] 755:10 810:7 812: 21.24 829:2 847:7 functionality [10] 737:4 753:7.10 **764**:7 **779**:22,23 **782**:20,24 **784**:6 794:17 functioning [4] 740:17,20 817:21 818:14 functions [1] 738:2 further [4] 739:11 761:14 841:19 849-12 Furthermore [1] 764:5 G

13 **767**:24 **784**:17.18 **788**:22.24 **790:**4 **796:**10.18.19 **843:**6.7.22 844:1.3.6 gaining 3 752:1 791:25 831:12 game [42] 735:25 747:20 748:6,16 749:20 750:5 752:7,19 754:20,23 **755:**21 **761:**7 **770:**17 **774:**19,20 775:6,15 776:5 778:4 781:18,24 783:7,21,25 785:24 787:9,11 788: 5,6,11,15 789:19 790:22 792:4,14, 23 795:4 797:22 798:16.18 799:8 803:15 games [4] 782:4 784:10 787:12 790:7 gave [1] 784:11 geared [2] 752:16 753:9 gee [2] 813:23 814:22 General [7] 731:3 732:20,24 733: 24 802:9 809:19 848:8 generally [1] 743:9 gentlemen [2] 815:24,25 gets [6] 759:8 769:14 770:7 776: 19 **810**:13 **816**:17 getting [10] 750:17 756:6 762:5 776:19 786:11 826:15 832:6.9 839:1 840:16 give [17] 735:14 741:11.17 759:6. 17 **765**:11 **779**:5 **784**:12 **793**:22 **797:1 802:**16 **808:**17,21 **817:**1 **819:**4,6 **846:**18 given [8] 770:12 790:7 797:6 799: 22 803:20 821:4,5 832:1 givers [1] 812:20 giving 5 759:9,24 762:6,8 811:4 gizmos [1] 800:24 glad 3 747:11 838:25 842:24 glassware [1] 813:1

glib [1] 814:21 global [1] 799:11 goal [2] 820:16,24 good-faith [1] 744:10 Google 6 777:25 778:14,20 786: 4.10 844:18 got 5 768:14 793:19 794:14 843:1, gotten [2] 780:9 798:22 Government [1] 732:16 governs [1] 814:3 grant [6] 752:13 765:9,17,17 794: 12 843:19 granted [6] 749:4 762:12 765:2 **768**:24 **838**:19 **848**:20 granting [2] 761:10 849:3 great [8] 736:23 742:10 756:10,17 **759:**3 **780:**22 **814:**14 **825:**5 Greenberg [3] 732:18,23,24 gross [1] 786:25 ground [3] 821:7 832:19 837:20 aroundwork [1] 772:16 group [3] 731:10 806:22 807:5 groups [1] 831:24 GRUB [1] 756:11 guess [10] 731:25 736:7 766:6,7 **796**:9 **803**:19 **804**:16,23 **839**:4 841:20 guidances [1] 830:13 guy [1] 746:16 guys [1] 757:20 Н

H.P [1] 797:10 hack [10] 758:7 778:1,15,21 779:7, 10,11 786:2 789:6 795:7 hacking [1] 778:3 hammering [1] 836:8 hand [15] 731:16.19 747:7 760:9. 10.15 770:12 777:22 785:21 794: 4 799:20 814:25 820:6 830:6 836: hand-wringing [1] 788:23 hands [6] 751:13 768:14 778:25 795:10 808:24 832:23 happen [5] 745:12 760:20 782:22 **793**:18 **798**:8 happened [1] 830:19 happening [2] 742:24 811:24 happily [1] 779:10 happy [1] 815:15 hard [5] 760:5 789:25 800:6.13.17 harm [4] 775:14 783:13 787:24 813:22 harmful [1] 760:6 harms [3] 781:13 818:11 840:13 HDOs [1] 807:13 head [3] 734:7 746:1 824:1 headphone [1] 737:23 heads [1] 801:25 Health [10] 733:22 735:1 780:17, 19.21 807:13 813:5 816:5 817:21 830.17

hear [5] 736:8 742:24 747:11 749: 13 776:5 heard [12] 757:17 761:8 762:10 785:11 791:14 812:1 813:16 819: 24 825:7 826:4 831:3 842:9 hearing [9] 760:17 798:3,6 801:19 **806**:24 **818**:3,8 **824**:12 **846**:18 hearings [6] 731:5 732:6 772:12 811:22.23 849:18 heck [1] 815:12 help [10] 749:16 776:20 777:20 779:9.11 809:25 814:7 819:16 843:14 849:10 helpful [11] 736:6,7,17 749:13 758: 22 776:4,5 792:21 793:12 811:25 **812**:2 hesitancy [1] 763:3 HHS [1] 830:17 Hi [4] 734:24 735:3 756:6 795:15 high [1] 817:16 high-end [1] 813:1 high-value [4] 754:5 771:23 772: 21 774:7 higher [1] 815:13 highly [3] 751:2 829:2 840:3 hijacked [1] 759:15 hint [1] 825:7 HIPAA [5] 822:14 823:11,12,15,20 historically [2] 802:1,10 history [2] 772:14,14 hit [3] 756:14 824:1 826:3 hold [2] 781:19 785:16 holders [4] 765:9.12 819:5 846:18 home [1] 762:15 hope [1] 812:2 hopefully [1] 756:6 hoping [1] **735:**15 horse [1] 788:25 hospital [2] 807:20 821:19 hospitals [15] 805:6,18,21 806:22 807:5,6 811:16 812:19 818:17,24 821:3,5,21,25 829:12 hour [2] 808:2.3 house [1] 756:18 However [1] 786:9 HSCC [1] 830:15 huge [2] 745:8 802:12 Human [1] 830:17 hundred [1] 787:25 hundreds [2] 788:10 789:21 hypothesizing [1] 819:12

IAMERS [3] 733:25 805:14 830:11 idea [4] 755:24 773:1 791:9 814:14 identical [1] 737:2 identified [2] 763:24 782:2 iFixit [4] 734:8 736:9 737:15 766: illegal [2] 782:4,4 illegality [3] 839:14 840:9,14

imaging [6] 806:12,25 807:2 812: 20 813:2 815:10 immune [1] 792:7 impact [2] 766:16 846:16 impacted [1] 805:17 impacts [2] 748:2 789:11 implement [1] 782:8 implements [1] 773:21 implicate [2] 775:3 847:24 implicated [1] 803:12 implicating [1] 779:17 import [1] 748:23 importance [2] 840:6 844:19 important [8] 745:15 751:8 774: 17 794:13 799:21 813:25 830:21 848:10 importantly [2] 747:24 749:23 imposed [1] 766:11 imposes [1] 836:5 improve [1] 770:6 improvement [1] 809:3 in-app [1] 757:10 in-house [1] 806:11 inability [1] 744:7 inaccurate [1] 803:6 Inacker [21] 733:19,20,20 780:12, 13 781:15 812:5,6,7,9 813:10 814: 8 **815**:5,18,21,23 **816**:1,4,10 **827**: 24 828:2 inadequate [3] 765:5 804:20 846: inappropriately [1] 794:22 incident [1] 799:16 inclination [3] 752:13 22 794:12 include [4] 794:20 827:3 4 844:14 included [2] 753:6 791:23 includes [2] 772:1 842:10 including [10] 739:17 751:23 752: 19 **783**:10 **797**:10 **811**:25 **817**:19 837:15 844:15 846:3 income [1] 827:21 incorporate [1] 795:10 incorporated [2] 776:25 777:6 increase [2] 738:6 757:7 increased [3] 761:9 785:23 799: 24 increases [1] 764:7 increasing [2] 737:10 769:16 Increasingly [2] 801:10 835:13 incur [1] 837:14 indeed [2] 776:15 829:8 independent [27] 750:19,23 767:5, 8 **780**:20 **805**:14,25 **806**:11,23 **808**:2 **810**:12 **811**:15 **812**:15 **815**: 13 816:4 817:13,19 818:25 819:9 **821**:24 **829**:12,13 **835**:24 **840**:24 841:3.24 842:5 indicated [1] 830:23

indicates [1] 817:14

individual [2] 737:16 748:21

industrial [2] 742:20 767:14

industries [3] 747:13 772:17 783:

industry [14] 741:6 750:12,13 751: 2,11 **757**:22 **766**:18 **781**:15 **786**: 22 827:10,17 833:13 834:5 840:2 inevitably [1] 792:25 infer [1] 832:8 information [23] 750:24 784:3 787:7 804:13 805:7 12 806:5 807: 7.8 **821**:18 **823**:14 **827**:2.3.4.5.9 829:5 839:20 840:23 841:1.2 842: 1.10 infotainment [3] 764:17 834:9 **835:**5 infringe [4] 760:20 762:17 789:5,7 infringement [9] 747:24 756:16 **760**:20 **761**:9 **762**:9 **764**:4 **793**:1, 10 828:15 infringing [12] 738:13 759:21 768: 2,8 784:10 825:16,21 826:2,3 828: 24.25 844:9 inherent [1] 739:22 inherently [1] 740:10 inhibited [1] 831:16 inhibiting [4] 796:13 800:8,12 804: initial [2] 766:3 796:20 initiate [1] 849:15 Initiative [2] 735:1 835:21 injuries [1] 814:23 injury [1] 813:21 ink [1] 796:5 inkjets [1] 801:13 Innovation [1] 735:5 Innovators [1] 735:5 input [1] 777:16 inquired [1] 830:13 inquiry [2] 768:23 817:25 insight 3 804:8 809:15 822:17 insist [1] 807:7 install [4] 780:5 801:6 810:3,3 installation [1] 805:12 installed [1] 759:19 installing [2] 778:9 782:3 installs [1] 810:13 instance [5] 753:24 776:25 786:17 800:5 804:12 instances [4] 820:2 823:2 12 825: 12 instead [3] 748:13 834:14 835:1 instructions [3] 828:21 829:5.8 insufficient [3] 795:20 812:18.22 insurance [1] 823:18 intact [1] 828:6 integrity [1] 749:24 intellectual [2] 825:9 830:23 intended [5] 743:19 775:25 798:7 825:17.18 intends [1] 793:5 intent [1] 798:4 inter [1] 803:24 interacting [1] 784:7

interesting [8] 742:11 743:5 769: 10 780:15,17 790:5 801:14 813: interestingly [1] 823:5 International [1] 733:25 internet [7] 742:22,22 743:1,14,16, 23 758:22 interpretation [1] 845:24 interpreting [1] 815:2 interrupt [1] 830:5 introduce [2] 732:16 733:1 introduced [3] 786:5 834:24 848: introductions [1] 733:7 intrusions [1] **753**:19 intuitive [1] 775:24 investing [1] 772:20 investment [1] 772:22 investments [1] 773:2 involve [1] 767:9 involves [2] 770:3 786:20 iOS [2] 802:5.6 IP [3] 826:5.8 827:22 iPhone [2] 766:24 801:10 iRobot [1] 801:3 IRP [1] 766:25 irrelevant [1] 830:1 isn't [11] 739:20 740:2 761:15 779: 7.23 789:3 790:21 818:3 820:24 842:17 845:1 ISO [4] 807:12 815:7 822:3.3 isolate [2] 759:10 20 ISOs [1] 811:25 issue [18] 731:21 736:20 744:4 751:7 763:9 781:8.15 782:19 791: 7 806:15 810:3 816:23 829:1 830: 12.19 840:18 841:4 842:8 issued [6] 795:19.19 817:9 818:5 821:12 830:13 issues [29] 731:17,18 735:14,16, 24 736:3,5,18 739:6,16 747:9 753: 1 758:21 770:4.8 783:5 797:18 **798**:2 **803**:12 **806**:17 **810**:21 **815**: 10 816:19.24 822:20.21 831:8 832:12 843:1 issuina [1] 849:12 itself [11] 762:21 764:15 774:3 776: 16 **784**:21 **786**:8 **790**:24 **793**:20 830:3 834:18 847:2 iail [1] 751:24

interested [3] 768:25 789:11 791:

jail-breaking [4] 762:12 791:16 **792:**25 **849:**19 jailbreak [1] 802:6 jeopardize [2] 755:15,20 job [2] 743:13 749:7 iobs [1] 749:23 John [5] 766:23 832:6 833:18,19 847:17 Joint [3] 735:10 821:20 830:14

interest [2] 793:23 825:3

illegally [1] 793:5

imagine [1] 847:22

jump [4] **783**:12,15,16 **809**:6 Jung [1] 783:8 Justice [2] 783:10 837:8

Κ

Kansas [1] 805:20 Kathleen [1] 733:13 keep [11] 737:10,25 741:15 751:14 **753**:2 **760**:5 **762**:23 **787**:16 **821**: 13 829:11 843:4 keeping [1] 798:5 keeps [1] 824:10 Kerry [1] 734:7 Kerwin [19] 733:23.24.24 804:17. 23 805:1 808:14.15 813:19 819: 17 820:7 821:6.9.10.11 822:8 830: 6,10 **831:**1

Kevin [2] 732:19 735:3 key [10] 745:18,21 774:1,4 776:23, 25 777:10 794:21,23 827:21 keys [19] 754:2 772:4,9,11 773:16 **777**:4,6,19 **779**:19 **781**:25 **785**:5, 12 787:5,14,18 788:24 790:8 818: 23 829:18

kind [39] 735:12 737:7.25 739:25 742:25 745:12 746:23 766:15.18 **767**:13 **770**:25 **774**:15 **775**:1 **788**: 13.25 790:9 798:1.21 800:21 801: 19.24 802:9 812:1 814:17 820:19 823:7 824:5 825:23 828:12 829:9, 22 832:19 833:18 834:13 836:3,8 845:8 846:9 848:3

kinds [4] 739:19 742:12 793:7 797:

knowing [1] 784:22 Knowledge [2] 733:14 754:22 Knowledge's [1] 783:20 Knupp [1] 735:9

Kyle 5 734:10 756:9 767:13 835: 10.19

LA [2] 734:19 785:2 lab [1] 781:11 lack [2] 789:10 815:11 laid [1] 772:15 land [1] 765:3 language [19] 761:21 791:23 792: 19,20 **793**:8,12,19 **814**:6 **831**:18 836:4 837:3,3,19 839:7,7 841:5,9 842:12,12 laptops [1] 801:21 large [1] 753:17 largely [1] 830:1 larger [2] 745:6 821:3 Last [17] 762:13 796:23 799:10 800:17 801:19 802:12 806:24 810: 4 811:24 830:8 831:3 834:6 843:3 845:18 848:3.4 849:18 late [1] 788:23 later [1] 793:9 law [12] 761:2 778:16 790:13 806:

13 **824**:22 **825**:4 **836**:4,13 **837**:5

839:9.17 849:2 law-abiding [1] 790:13 lawful [7] 760:12,14 763:2 764:8 789:12 807:24 836:12 lawfully [4] 740:17 744:6 764:6,9 lawn [1] 745:1 laws [6] 821:12 822:13 831:12 832: 16 **836**:6 **837**:15 lawver [1] 780:14 lay [1] 782:10 laver [1] 843:18 lead [1] 783:3 leads [1] 792:25 leaked [1] 787:18 least [3] 748:18 784:1 785:5 leave [2] 830:7 844:22 led [1] 823:2 left [3] 746:17 818:13 828:6 legal [4] 785:7,9 786:20 787:23 legislative [1] 798:4 legitimate [1] 777:5 lens [1] 766:8 less [8] 754:9.9 771:11 772:23 773: 7 778:22 784:24.25 letter [1] 784:12 letters [2] 840:6 849:12 level [4] 737:13 763:4 783:9 805:7 Lexmark [1] 797:11 liability [4] 836:3,6,14 837:14 Librarian [1] 798:14 license [11] 745:21 748:13 757:6 **766**:3 **784**:25 **785**:14 **827**:12.14. 20 828:19 20

licensed [1] 827:12 licenses [1] 757:5 Licensina [2] 734:18 757:14 lies [2] 813:17.17 light [3] 738:4,14 778:2 likely [2] 752:9 825:1 limelight [1] 786:17 limit [2] 745:24 746:2 limitation [8] 837:15 838:8,20 839:

15.15,19 840:9,15 limitations [3] **794**:10,11 **831**:11 limited [12] 737:6.8 739:9.11 749: 14 766:22 768:13 774:12 788:6 790:17 845:19 846:2

limiting [2] 749:18 792:19 limits [3] 752:15.15 827:7 line [4] 813:17 836:22.23 848:11 link [3] 732:1 795:20 796:12

Linux [6] 742:17,18,21,22 749:15 **756**:10

list [1] 837:16 listening [2] 731:24 752:4

literally [5] **731**:18 **759**:17,24 **778**:

literary [2] 739:9 809:14 lithium [1] 800:22 litigate [1] 842:17 litigation [1] 836:9

litter [5] 738:15 750:2 796:6.21

little [35] 741:11 742:7 747:6 753: 22 762:24 771:13 776:5.18 781: 19 785:1 786:5 788:23 794:19 795:21 798:22 802:21 804:7,8,17 **811**:11,13,20 **813**:17 **814**:21 **816**:

18,24 820:6 825:7 831:6,9 836:25 837:1 838:10 843:2 4

livestreamed [1] 732:10 LLC [1] 734:19

loading [1] 833:20 located [1] 805:19

lock [5] 743:17 755:16 790:24 791:

2 818:24 locked [1] 743:15 locking [1] 743:4

log [1] 743:17

locks [10] 743:19,19,22 744:1,3 747:12 753:16 774:18,22 790:9

logistics [1] 731:12 long [3] 767:9 793:4 823:4 longer [9] 749:6 772:19,22 774:1 **794**:2 **798**:24 **799**:1 **803**:5 **806**:20 lonaform [1] 796:20

look [17] 736:17 743:23 760:18 772:24 773:1 786:22 792:15.23 **796**:19 **797**:7 **807**:17,20 **814**:3 815:9 826:1 830:20 841:12

looked [1] 748:8 looking [9] 738:4,9 766:8 774:1

790:15 814:1 824:21,25 834:11 looks [1] 811:15

loss [1] 808:11 lot [22] 735:12 739:19 746:9 22 24 748:23 749:23 751:13 756:24 760: 18 768:14 772:25 779:8 792:24 813:24 815:12 816:19 819:24 822:

19 843:5 845:4 846:11 lot's [1] 781:22 lots [2] 778:25 802:13

lower [1] 806:1 luck [2] 767:18 820:15

М machine [7] 772:8,9 780:6,7 789:

14 819:20 828:20 machines [1] 806:21 made [8] 753:23 757:5 785:22 792: 13 838:9,21 839:11 848:15 main [2] 788:1.2 maintain [3] 752:20 805:6 821:16 maintenance [4] 744:18 804:15. 21 821:16 makers [1] 826:16 malicious [1] 753:20 malware [1] 743:10 Man [1] 801:16 management [2] 821:24 822:1 manner [1] 753:12

manual [13] 782:12 825:10,10,18 826:25 828:13,17,20,24 829:1,4,6,

manuals [19] 806:13 809:3.9.13.

20,21 811:8,10 825:7,8,15 826:4, 13,15,21 827:1,8,20 829:7 manufacturer [17] 743:12 767:11, 16 **771**:19 **772**:5 **773**:20 **801**:5 806:2 807:18,19 808:3 810:15 819:1 821:1,14 842:6 847:23 manufacturer-branded [6] 765: 16 766:20 767:4.7.17 818:19 manufacturer-provided [1] 766: 11 manufacturers [25] 743:4 746:7

750:22 771:12 780:25 782:23 783: 14 803:9.18.22 804:12 806:20 **807**:1,2 **809**:12,24 **817**:12,15 **818**: 15 **819**:7,7 **826**:16,25 **840**:22 **842**:

manufacturing [3] 772:1,6 773:

many [14] 738:2 761:6 762:11 780: 24 799:4 806:16 807:11.13 808:8 813:24 815:9 817:14 821:3.21 map [2] 735:14 842:24

Mark [1] 734:3

market [20] 738:1.24 739:7.17.20 740:2 765:12.19 766:7 777:11 786:25 787:24 788:11 805:15 807: 2,6 815:4 819:8 845:22 846:21

marketed [1] 738:1 marketing [1] 756:19 marketplace [2] 793:16,18 Massachusetts [2] 834:23 835:

massive [1] 806:25

material [4] 825:11.15.18 827:13 materials [2] 804:19 809:14

Matt's [1] 750:11

matter [5] 766:13 797:21.25 798:4 849:22

Matthew [1] 735:8 MAUDE [1] 807:17

McHargue [18] 734:2,3,3 769:7,8 780:14 804:16,25 808:21,25 809: 1,6,19 831:4,7,20 844:24,25

MDR [1] 813:20 MDY [2] 783:8 849:1

mean [15] 741:1 744:8 746:23 747: 10 748:20 761:4.25 773:20 776:

14 **791**:13 **792**:20 **794**:22 **801**:8 826:13.18

meaning [1] 766:22

means [4] 760:21.22 785:13 819:5 measures [2] 737:12 829:11

mechanic [1] 835:16 mechanics [2] 819:23 834:25 mechanisms [1] 829:22

media [5] 770:16 771:7 834:14,16,

Medicaid [1] 805:5

medical [26] 733:22 25 736:2 767: 6 7 **780**:19 **781**:18 **802**:19 **804**:6 806:22 807:12 817:8.17.20 818:6. 10.12 819:6.7.23 824:11 828:4

829:14 830:3 847:4 848:7 Medicare [1] 805:5 meet [5] 758:1 814:7,11,15 839:23 meeting [1] 849:21 meetings [1] 849:14 meets [1] 757:23 members [6] 756:23 806:16 807: 11 808:9 822:3 830:15 membership [1] 827:19 mention [5] 746:4 788:15 795:25 **812**:1 **847**:16 mentioned [14] 740:24 744:16 767:13 769:12 772:12 781:24 789: 17 **792**:20 **796**:21 **802**:18 **809**:9 817:4 831:7 832:13 menus [1] 820:14 Michael [1] 734:17 Microsoft [4] 798:23 799:2 803:3, middle [1] 837:20 might [28] 731:13 736:6 741:9.10 **745**:7,13 **752**:4 **754**:25 **755**:7,9 761:14 763:17 767:12 772:24 776: 10 777:13.19 798:11 811:24 816: 24 820:19 823:14 838:4 839:9 841:21 843:24 846:24 847:1 mike's [1] 804:23 millions [1] 788:12 mind [3] 761:23 763:6 766:5 minimal [1] 822:5 minimum [1] 808:3 minutes [1] 732:5 misdirected [1] 824:6 misleading [1] 841:23 missed [1] 838:4 missing [1] 838:13 misused [1] 776:9 Mitchell [1] 735:9 mitigate [1] 840:11 mobile [1] 834:18 mod [1] 778:5 model [3] 757:8 806:2 834:12 moderate [1] 731:13 moderating [1] 816:21 moderator [1] 816:15 modern [1] 838:12 modification [25] 735:22 753:6 **754**:17.25 **755**:3.9.10.11 **760**:12. 14 **761**:19.24 **762**:1 **763**:2 **765**:25 **767**:21,22 **768**:1,5 **770**:1,3,15 **837**: 18 839:7 844:7 modifications [8] 754:21 757:4 **762**:4 **794**:17 **797**:14 **844**:10,12, modified [3] 739:25 740:11 831: modify [5] 744:6 755:1 757:25 786: 2 795:7 modifying [2] 743:20 844:16 moment [6] 811:4 816:9.11.11.12. money [3] 746:2 772:21,25

monopolize [1] 801:11 month [2] 744:25 801:18 months [3] 799:11 818:14,19 Morgan [1] 734:24 morning [8] 732:19,21,23 733:3 **734**:3,16 **735**:8 **834**:11 most [10] 772:13 775:15 776:22 785:25 795:5 798:17 809:20 829: 7 17 834:23 mostly [1] 848:6 motherboard [3] 755:17 783:23 791.2 motion [1] 782:1 motor [1] 839:22 motorized [1] 765:3 MOU [12] 750:21 840:20,21 841:13, 23 842:1,3,9,15,18 845:3.8 move [10] 740:13 768:14 788:19 791:8 793:24 810:25 828:1 833: 11.16 834:3 moved [3] 834:19.21.22 moves [1] 824:9 movie [9] 772:1.3.25 774:3 777:9 784:22 826:16.17 829:7 movies [4] 771:25 786:11 790:21 824:13 moving [3] 751:14 765:20 817:24 MRI [1] 781:10 MS [157] 731:3 732:25 733:6,12,13, 15,16,17,19,23 **734:**2,6,6,7,9,12, 22 735:2,6,11 736:20,23 738:16, 17,18 739:3,4 740:12,22 741:8,13, 14.18 744:4 745:20 746:14 747:5 **749**:10 **750**:6 **751**:12 **754**:11.13. 14.16.24 756:4 758:14.20 759:2.4 **760**:7,8,16 **762**:19,20,22 **763**:1,6, 24 764:12.13 765:21.23.24 766:4. 6,12,13,14 767:19,20,22,23,24 **768**:10,11,13,15,16,17 **769**:6 **770**: 9 774:10,11 783:4 784:17,18 788: 18,18,21,22,24 790:2,3,4,4 795:16 796:10,16,18,19 797:17,19 799:24 25 **802**:18,25 **812**:6 **816**:9,11 **817**: 1,3 819:10 823:6 824:17,19,25 827:25 828:10,11 829:24 830:1 833:1.24 835:8.9 836:16.25 837: 19.22 838:1.3.15.15.18.23.24 842: 22 843:6.7.17.21.22.23 844:1.2.3. 5.6.23 845:15.17.23 847:13 848:1. 14 849:8 much [23] 739:6 750:8 756:19,20 **759**:23 **775**:19 **777**:13 **780**:23,23, 24,24 781:22 785:20 796:25 799: 13 800:19,19 822:2,16 834:6 839: 14 840:17 847:25 multiple 5 735:19 760:4 772:16 **794**:15 **797**:10 music [1] 824:13 must [3] 786:24 807:19 838:23 mute [2] 732:13 812:8 myopically [1] 748:20 myself [2] 787:3 838:5

nail [1] 824:1 name [3] 733:3 734:17.24 names [1] 783:7 nanny [3] 742:19 743:13 752:11 narrow [2] 737:8,21 narrowing [1] 740:21 national [1] 845:3 nationally [1] 845:8 nature [3] 739:22 829:1 844:19 Nebraska [1] 734:4 necessarily [4] 773:16 774:21 **814**:19 **825**:2 necessary [7] 755:3 798:11 814: 11 831:16 838:9 840:9 845:4 necessity [2] 768:19 799:10 need [37] 743:17 744:10 745:9,19 **754**:20,25 **755**:7 **757**:20,22 **763**: 18 769:16 775:11 781:4,9 787:8 799:18 803:19 804:1,2 812:19,21 813:8 819:20 820:12 831:22 833: 11 834:21 835:14,16,22,23 838:4, 5 **841**:13 **845**:6,11 **849**:12 needed [6] 741:22 742:4 802:11 818:21 822:11 832:14 needs [3] 808:6 841:2.14 net [1] 779:7 network [3] 759:16.19 767:15 never [5] 842:14 843:13 846:14 848:17,24 nevertheless [1] 837:14 new [27] 731:13 737:17 755:19 765:17,17 767:2 774:24 775:17 778:4 799:5,17 800:21 808:6 810: 6 819:4 829:21 833:10,10,12,17 834:9.12 844:15.15.16 846:18 next [10] 733:6 735:24 738:17 751: 16 770:11 779:3 791:8 793:24 794:8 795:11 nice [1] 801:16 Nicholas [1] 809:1 Nick [1] 732:21 nine [1] 807:3 nobody [1] 801:20 nodding [1] 845:17 non [2] 738:12 768:7 non-compliance [1] 806:8 non-diagnosed [1] 821:15 non-infringing [14] 737:1,5 738: 11 **744**:13 **761**:12.24 **762**:1.2 **768**: 6 796:4 818:8 825:1 828:18 844: non-issue [1] 779:13 none [1] 768:21 nor [1] 845:9 notably [1] 798:17 note [10] 752:25 753:14 756:9 774: 17 779:22 785:23 789:4 794:10, noted [1] 757:12 nothing [2] 840:10 841:15

noting [1] 795:4 notwithstanding [2] 742:9 806: 19 novel [1] 829:7 NTIA [1] 733:5 number [14] 737:10 740:9,10 753: 3 757:7 779:6,11 783:6 786:21 788:4,6 793:6,7 808:9 number-one [1] 793:1 numbers [2] 815:9,12

object [1] 741:9 objective [1] 817:14 obligation [1] 836:5 obstruct [3] 763:11.16.19 obstructina [1] 830:2 obviate [1] 763:18 obviates [1] 841:13 obviously [2] 760:2 845:19 occupying [1] 807:1 occurring [2] 807:22 829:17 occurs [1] 795:3 OCR [1] 823:21 OEM [7] 812:14 813:7 815:9 816:6 827:12 832:10 845:5 OEMs [5] 804:19 814:3.14 815:8 817:14 off-the-shelf [2] 780:5 787:12 offer [1] 787:8 offering [1] 803:7 offers [1] 813:6 Office [37] 731:4,22 732:9,18 733: 4 **736**:14 **743**:6 **744**:25 **751**:5,22 **752**:6 **757**:24 **758**:10 **760**:11,25 763:2 764:15 765:2 782:14 795: 19 **796**:24 **800**:4 **810**:19 **815**:1.17 818:2.4 823:9.21 839:25 843:19 845:14 846:14 848:8.11.22.25 Office's [3] 737:6 768:22 845:24 official [3] 798:20 799:2.18 offline [1] 784:10 often [4] 753:18 765:5 801:16 829: oftentimes [1] 820:11 Ok [1] 767:23 Okay [41] 741:8,14 747:5 749:10 750:6 754:11 760:7,9 762:19 767: 19,20 768:10,15 769:6 774:9 776: 1 777:23 778:24 780:11 784:16 788:17 791:6 793:21 794:5 799: 23 802:15 810:23 812:3 819:10 822:8 827:23 829:23 832:22 835: 7 836:16 837:24 839:1 843:22 844:2,5 848:1 old [1] 813:17 once [4] 755:2 810:3 819:17 849: one [72] 735:19 736:11 737:22 738: 18 **740**:12 **741**:19 **742**:4 **744**:15 **748:**10 **751:**16 **753:**2,8,15 **757:**6,6, 16 759:7.22 760:15 761:21 765: 21,24 768:9,11 769:11,23 772:13

775:16 **776**:7 **777**:8 **778**:1 **779**:12 **782**:6.10.11 **785**:24 **788**:22 **789**:4 **791**:13 **793**:4,6 **795**:25 **797**:9 **798**: 17 799:1,1 800:14 803:1,2 807:17, 21 809:6 811:5 813:19,20,23,23 **822**:12,18 **828**:22 **831**:5,11 **833**: 17,25 **835**:6,25 **841**:20 **843**:8 **846**: 8 9 847:15 848:16 ones [1] 786:16 onesie-twosie [1] 774:2 only [22] 731:25 739:11 745:17.20 **750**:13 **761**:24 **763**:14 **764**:9 **765**: 10 766:23 767:1 771:4 782:23 **783**:21 **789**:10 **805**:10.24 **807**:17 813:19 823:16 841:21 843:19 OnStar [1] 847:22 open [5] 756:15 766:3 783:1 793:2 836:10 operate [2] 777:3 803:25 operating [1] 769:22 operation [4] 739:13 740:25 741:4 771:5 operators [2] 813:22 814:24 opponents [9] 736:8 760:18 761: 6,9 **762**:16 **792**:2 **804**:11 **811**:14 837:19 opponents' [1] 791:11 opportunity [9] 740:14 802:16 **805**:2 **808**:17 **816**:13 **835**:11 **841**: 21 842:20 849:14 oppose [1] 841:9 opposed [3] 775:16 791:5 796:23 opposition [4] 734:13 785:3 797: 21 822:18 optical [33] 752:17 755:2.14.14.16. 19.25 771:25 774:13.18.21.23.24 775:2.5.8.9.13.14 780:7 782:9.15 **783**:2,23 **784**:1 **787**:10 **788**:1,3 789:13,14,23 791:2 795:1 optical-drive-driven [1] 774:20 option [2] 747:3 756:21 options [2] 799:3,3 Oracle [1] 844:18 order [14] 735:14 741:15 755:1 **758**:12 **783**:25 **789**:7 **811**:9.18 812:22 24 813:8 818:21 831:19 835:17 organization [3] 733:8 812:16 813:3 organization's [1] 767:9 organizations [10] 737:16 780:20 **807**:14 **815**:7,10,14 **816**:5 **817**:19 823:17 829:13 original [18] 740:5 753:7 759:2 780:25 782:25 794:20 795:7 804: 11 806:2 809:11,24 817:12,15 **818**:15 **820**:3 **821**:14 **828**:6 **845**:5 originally [1] 836:24 other [63] 733:11 737:15 739:19 **741**:19.21 **742**:6.8 **748**:10 **750**:3. 14 **751**:1 **752**:2.25 **753**:22.23 **757**:

765:4 768:6 769:25 772:12 774: 20 782:19 791:25 795:1,9,13 796: 6 **799**:7 **802**:13 **803**:12,25 **806**:9 **808**:12,23 **809**:14 **811**:12 **816**:3 818:10 819:24 820:20 822:6,11, 13,14 824:20 831:11 832:16,23 **834:**20 **836:**5 **837:**2,4,5,14 **839:**8, 11 842:19 others [8] 797:11 800:15 808:17 811:16 814:14 20 837:8 19 otherwise [4] 740:4 745:5 777:5 841.16 ourselves [2] 746:18 758:7 out [45] 731:23 738:18 744:19.22 **745**:3 **746**:11,12,12 **747**:2 **751**:9 **752**:6,22 **755**:2,13,25 **756**:7 **766**: 22 767:18 768:5 774:25 775:3,5 776:20 777:5,20 782:10 785:6 787:20 788:5,9,25 795:20 798:1 **799**:6 **803**:18 **810**:11.13.15 **818**: 15.20.24 820:14 830:7 840:18 847:19 outdated [2] 742:22 743:2 output [1] 778:23 outside [5] 739:21 764:21 767:15 799:3 832:17 over [18] 747:17 749:6 766:18 788: 24 791:3 795:12 799:10 800:17 **815**:2 **816**:3,14,18 **819**:24 **823**:22 824:2 835:21 843:2 849:10 overall [1] 793:15 overcome [1] 814:10 overridina [1] 840:6 oversight [4] 807:15 821:20 823: oversimplification [1] 786:25 overwhelmingly [1] 802:11 own [11] 732:5 745:10 765:14 775: 21 788:11 789:23 806:20 807:8 821:25 829:14 830:13 owner [9] 740:7 754:5 771:19.21. 23 825:19 832:5 846:1.2 Owners [5] 735:10 743:20 750:23 **754**:10 **772**:20 P

P.C [3] 779:15,16 802:2 p.m [1] 849:21 painfully [1] 808:10 pair [1] **755**:19 pairing [3] 774:14 775:10 780:8 pairs [3] 755:16 774:18 780:6 panel [1] 732:4 panelist [1] 731:20 panelists [1] 763:22 papers [1] 830:16 Paragraph [1] 837:13 part [30] 737:20 739:7 745:21 749: 3 **751**:17 **754**:21 **756**:18 **761**:15 763:13 768:22 785:21 788:3 809: 7,20 810:13 811:5 813:25 814:9 817:10 824:15 825:8 827:11.14. 18,21 829:21,21 832:15 833:8,12

parte [1] 849:14 participate [1] 849:14 participation [1] 732:2 participatory [1] 830:14 particular [9] 744:20 754:20 760: 11.17 775:10 776:24 777:17 809: 22 822:17 particularly [8] 746:23 750:12 **755**:24 **777**:17 **790**:15.24 **791**:11 805:5 parties [3] 743:22 746:5 753:20 partnership [1] 830:15 parts [5] 789:24 799:18 801:12 806:18 810:2 party [1] 817:13 pass [1] 835:21 passed [4] 744:18 834:14 835:1, password [8] 744:19,21 745:10 746:17 747:4 820:12,14,17 passwords [3] 821:4,5 829:18 past [7] 747:8,17 750:4 760:19 762:13 763:3 797:24 patched [1] 743:2 path [2] 737:6 776:14 patience [3] 830:9 842:23 849:10 patient [1] 781:8 patients 5 781:10,12 813:22 814: 23 824:10 pay [8] 745:22 746:3 748:13 756: 19,19 757:5,11 814:11 paying [3] 778:4 826:17 847:23 payload [2] 832:14 833:14 pavloads [1] 833:14 penalties [1] 812:12 people [39] 731:17.18 735:12 745: 18 **759**:25 **760**:19 **761**:2.11 **769**:2. 9 773:17 775:13 778:13 784:23 **787:**19 **788:**5.10.12 **789:**2.5.11 **790**:6 **797**:14 **800**:6 **803**:10 **805**: 16 **808:**23 **818:**13 **826:**14,17,20 829:13,14 830:18 831:23 835:22 **836**:9,14 **843**:3 people's [1] 824:13 percent [11] 750:18 767:8 807:1,3, 21 813:6.19.20.23 814:22 835:21 perform [2] 790:17 804:15 performance [2] 764:8 839:22 perhaps [4] 732:4 750:1 752:11 797:7 peripheral [1] 801:1 peripherals [7] 800:5,11 803:14, 16,17,24,24 permanent [1] 791:16 permission [4] 744:7 762:7,8 846: permit [7] 735:22 760:22,24 771:6 784:21 818:9 841:17 permitted [1] 764:10 perp [1] 786:17 person [3] 744:18 745:25 770:11

perspective [3] 779:23 845:16 847:9 pertaining [1] 805:12 pertains [1] 805:10 petition [1] 797:24 PHI [1] 823:24 phone [3] 738:14 834:15,15 photographic [1] 844:16 phrase [1] 763:4 phrasing [1] 836:10 physical [6] 739:14,21 740:4.5 **758:**3 **822:**20 pick [1] 738:18 picture [1] 793:15 pictures [1] 782:1 piece [3] 781:11 810:6 842:21 pieces [2] 788:8 813:1 piggyback [2] 753:22 754:16 piggybacking [1] 751:18 pin-outs [1] 827:3 piracy [14] 759:9 761:21 762:5 764: 14.19 776:15.17 777:13 784:21 **785**:23 **791**:4 **793**:1 **795**:3 **834**:17 pirate [2] 756:1 790:18 pirated [3] 753:12 755:11 759:18 pirates [1] 790:10 pirating [3] 786:9 790:7,10 pivot [1] 836:24 place [16] 740:5 747:22 749:22 **757**:12 **777**:11 **781**:1 **787**:16 **807**: 16 **815**:17 **823**:8,10 **826**:1,6 **827**: 14 838:20 845:9 placed [1] 759:16 places [1] 842:19 platform [5] 754:4 771:12 786:8. 10 **795**:5 platforms [1] 785:25 play [13] 752:17 755:11 763:23 **764:**5 **773:**18 **777:**8 **778:**11.22 **782**:1 **784**:10 **787**:12 **798**:2 **825**: playback [2] 785:25 786:7 played [3] 771:24 775:9 834:14 player [2] 773:15 778:10 players [10] 735:25 752:7 761:8 770:16.22 771:2.10 776:6 777:18 792:4 playing [4] 782:4 795:6 824:22 845:11 PlayStation [3] 779:12,12 780:4 please [9] 732:11 733:1 736:22 747:8 800:15 804:24 815:5 836: 20 839:12 plug [2] 774:24 820:21 poignant [1] 787:18 point [21] 750:10,11 751:9 758:7 **759**:20 **760**:2 **765**:24 **784**:19 **785**: 16 787:17 794:1 796:12 797:25 805:9 821:23 833:25 843:8 17 844:21 848:21 849:2 pointed [2] 749:11 840:18 points [5] 739:5 756:13 812:10

personal [1] 745:16

4.16 **758:**4 **760:**15 **762:**5.7 **763:**22

823:7 848:14 police [1] 793:6 policy [2] 734:8 803:3 politics [1] 835:19 popular [2] 785:25 795:5 port [1] 835:2 portability [1] 823:13 portion [1] 791:22 portions [1] 783:22 pose [1] 770:19 posed [1] 747:9 posina [1] **731**:14 position [2] 750:14 752:21 possess [1] 807:6 possession [1] 807:24 possibility [2] 776:17 832:2 possible [5] 761:19 776:14 777:14 812:25 817:5 possibly [3] 799:13 831:25 837:4 post-hearing [2] 784:11 849:13 post-warranty [2] 750:19 792:17 posted [1] 732:9 potential [3] 813:22 826:2 831:15 potentially [13] 755:3 770:6 771:1 **774**:5 **776**:8 **777**:19 **788**:12 **795**: 10 806:18 808:11 810:1 840:13 846:4 power [1] 807:7 practical [2] 737:13 766:15 practice [2] 747:12 823:23 practices [3] 744:2 765:18 806:22 precedent [1] 736:13 precisely [1] 742:15 prefer [1] 792:21 preferred [1] 806:2 premises [1] 767:14 prepared [1] 751:17 prescient [1] 818:12 present [1] 753:12 presents [1] 772:20 preserving [1] 790:11 President [1] 734:25 press [1] **741:**17 pressure [1] 752:23 pretty [4] 756:16 767:25 774:25 803:10 prevent [8] 743:10.20.22 747:23. 24 768:19 781:2 829:15 prevented [2] 844:10.13 preventing [6] 775:12,20 790:10, 13 804:21 809:17 prevents [1] 775:23 previous [1] 782:3 price [2] 757:1 808:1 primarily [3] 747:24 764:20 796:7 primary [1] 778:19 primitive [1] 746:25 printer [2] 796:22 797:9 printers [2] 750:2 797:9 prior [3] 748:17 754:19 765:1 privacy [4] 747:23 768:20 769:4 **823:**15

privilege [1] 818:25 probably 9 731:15 745:11 778:5 784:12 814:16 831:21,22 832:17 844:3 probe [1] 795:21 problem [10] 737:20 756:13 758:9 **772**:20 **786**:24 **788**:14 **792**:22 **807**: 10 24 824:15 problems [7] 742:25 746:9.13 756: 12 759:7 788:13 834:25 procedure [1] 782:12 procedures [1] 782:8 proceeding [3] 742:3 818:3 823:9 proceedings [2] 732:11 782:3 process [2] 741:21 772:6 produced [1] 740:1 product [7] 741:4 757:1,1 767:10 777:7 786:6 825:22 production [1] 798:25 productive [1] 731:11 products [9] 738:1 756:24 757:15. 25 759:9 772:14 15 777:5 814:7 professional [2] 745:13 788:15 program [1] 785:4 programming [2] 744:23 745:1 programs [8] 736:15 739:12,20 740:16 809:10,13 819:19 822:1 progress [1] 839:1 progressed [1] 749:8 prohibition [2] **796**:2,3 prohibitively [1] 842:9 proliferation 3 738:3 795:3 831: promise [1] 768:12 promote [1] 844:14 promulgation [1] 751:6 proper [2] 736:16 847:9 properly [1] 794:13 property [2] 825:9 830:23 proponents [4] 736:8 771:3 791: 14 837:20 proposal [1] 848:17 proposals [3] 735:21 736:9 848: propose [1] 837:9 proposed [13] 731:7 732:5 734:14 **735**:13.18 **749**:14 **764**:21 **771**:4 785:10 837:3.6 838:11 849:19 proposition [2] 773:5 848:8 proprietary [2] 827:2,9 protect [19] 743:8 747:22 749:23 **751**:3 **753**:19,25 **754**:8 **764**:3 **768**: 20,20 771:6,14,15 775:8,25 789:3 828:13 829:3,4 protected [7] 742:18 761:15 765: 10 790:21 791:1 825:8 827:9 protecting [8] 751:20 758:16 771: 1 **773**:15 **775**:7.12.19 **824**:12 protection [10] 737:11 743:7.8 **771**:17 **779**:24 25 **785**:9 **786**:19 789:15 829:10

protections [1] 753:18

protects [2] 774:15 775:10 protocols [1] 755:22 prove [1] 765:5 provide [20] 731:23 732:4 742:7 750:22 769:20 800:10.15 804:19 **813**:5 **814**:14 **816**:5 **817**:16 **818**: 20.22 819:25 825:20 827:11 831: 17 832:10 840:22 provided [9] 746:15 750:25 803: 17 817:11 840:11 841:3 842:11. 16 843:24 provider [3] 766:25.25 846:4 providers [6] 784:22 811:15 816:6 819:9 821:24 835:24 providers' [1] 785:14 provides [2] 772:11 777:13 providing [3] 804:13 806:4 807:7 provision [5] 749:5,6 842:3 845: 20 21 provisioned [1] 780:3 provisions [1] 842:10 PS4 [1] 788:1 pseudo-standing [1] 798:1 Public [5] 733:14 743:14 754:22 783:20 840:12 public-private [1] 830:15 publicly [3] 785:7,12 830:23 purchase [4] 757:10,10 766:3 775: purchasing [1] 807:5 purely [2] 737:13 801:11 purpose [31] 737:1,3 738:10,12,19 **739**:10 **750**:3 **752**:1 **755**:10 **761**: 24 762:2 4 9 764:9 783:1 790:17 791:10.18.21.25 792:9 802:9 818: 6 825:21 828:16.17.18 838:17 844:20.20 847:8 purposes [5] 731:8 753:23 760:23 **764**:14 **768**:6 pursued [2] 783:5 786:21 put [15] 741:10 743:7,25 745:24 **747**:18 **772**:8 **774**:24 **777**:25 **778**: 15 781:1 793:8 802:7 819:20 838: 20 846:11 putting [1] 845:9

Q

Q&A [1] 731:21

QSR [3] 814:3,12,16 qualifications [1] 811:18 qualified [5] 807:12 811:25 816:7 818:16 822:3 qualifies [1] 837:12 quality [8] 805:8 814:2,6 817:7,11, 16 824:8 830:16 quarter [1] 788:10 question [57] 740:12 741:18,24 742:10 747:15 748:12 751:16 756: 17 **759**:3,10 **763**:2,8,9,20 **765**:20 **766**:5 **770**:22 **774**:16 **776**:2 **777**: 17,20 **778**:12 **783**:18 **784**:11 **787**: 8 788:20 792:7.19 796:10 797:20 800:1.2 801:1 804:3 808:23 810:

24 811:6.7 819:11 820:10 824:20 825:6,24 826:2 828:3 831:5,8,21 832:21,25 833:1,2 839:4 844:9,11 845:21 848:6 questioning [2] 747:19 770:13 questions [17] 731:14 735:17 736: 1 **748**:9 **749**:11 **763**:7 **770**:19 **776**: 7 787:4 793:7 795:11 16 804:6 822:10 825:24 827:6 836:22 quick [5] 768:12.12 773:8 812:10 quickly [12] 768:16 778:18 783:4 **788**:19 **791**:8 **792**:13 **798**:9 **801**: 18 802:25 817:4 844:7 848:6 quite [5] 748:12 770:1 783:6 821: 11 845:2

R radiation-emitting [1] 805:10

radio [1] 751:21 rain [1] 810:12 raise [1] 731:16 raised [12] 751:13 760:11,13 764: 24 768:14 770:12 808:24 817:23 820:6 822:7 832:24 836:19 raises [1] 791:7 Rapid7 [1] 837:2 rates [1] 806:1 rather [4] 749:11 774:17 775:9 822:21 rays [1] 790:22 reach [1] 731:22 read [6] 810:1,1 826:15 828:21 837:6,9 readily [1] 781:6 Reagan [1] 731:3 real [9] 751:10 758:8 782:7 785:17 786:13 787:25 788:13 818:11 834: realities [5] 738:1 756:2 773:22 787:1 791:5 reality [3] 823:7 825:8 827:8 realize [2] 812:4 830:22 realized [1] 801:18 really [38] 731:9 737:9 738:4 739: 15,20 741:1 745:13 747:12 761: 15 **768**:18 **769**:12,20 **775**:3,12,19 **780**:9 **785**:16 **789**:11,13 **792**:22 793:14,16 799:21 807:16 809:22 817:4.24 820:16 823:24.24 824:7 825:2 829:9 830:2 836:7 843:18 844:7 18 reason [2] 758:24 793:1 reasonable [3] 768:3 842:11.16 reasoning [2] 836:23 849:4 reasons [1] 798:18 Reauthorization [1] 814:4 recall [1] 803:14 received [3] 753:5 822:19 840:6 receiving [1] 804:20 recent [4] 786:14 799:16 834:23 844:18

recognize [3] 789:4 801:7 810:5

recognized [2] 751:5 840:1 recognizing [1] 835:22 recommend [1] 835:11 Recommendation [3] 764:16 **795**:18 **800**:4 recommended [1] 838:7 recommending [1] 838:24 reconvene [1] 849:22 record [21] 735:13 744:8.12.16 **747**:21 **748**:17 **752**:8 **765**:6 **795**: 23 796:3.11 803:14 830:18 838:6 839:20 840:10 841:10.16 843:24 848:23 849:11 recorded [1] 732:8 records [2] 747:17 792:23 recycled [1] 803:11 recyclers [1] 788:7 reduce [1] 814:9 reduces [1] 754:9 reduction [2] 813:6 815:3 Reed [41] 734:23.24.24 741:10 756: 5,6 **758**:19 **759**:1,3,6 **760**:7 **769**:1 777:22.24 779:5 790:6 812:6 813: 11.13.16 815:6.7.15.20.22 817:4.6 22,25 820:9 822:9,25 823:4 824: 15,18,24 825:5 826:9,19,22,24 Reed's [3] 768:18 782:5 828:15 reemphasize [1] 848:10 reenabling [1] 789:15 refer [2] 791:18 796:1 reference [2] 786:9 822:6 referred [3] 734:19,20 823:2 referring [1] 823:14 refers [1] 758:4 refocusing [2] 817:24 829:9 refusal [2] 806:19 808:12 Regan [4] 756:14 824:18 838:2 840:17 regard [7] 775:25 797:22 798:2,15 799:4,8,9 regarding [1] 786:6 regional [1] 805:18 register [3] 795:19 835:10 838:7 regulated [2] 751:2 840:3 Regulation [3] 814:3 824:8 842: regulations [6] 751:4 804:14 805: 4 822:14 840:21 843:10 regulatory [5] 736:11 742:3 818:3 **839:**23 **842:**12 rein [1] 793:13 reinforces [2] 843:17 844:19 reiterate [3] 835:9 844:8 848:13 rejecting [1] 840:4 relate [1] 822:20 related [6] 736:3 764:20 782:3 800: 6 830:20 848:6 relates [4] 751:3 795:24 796:13 800:2 relating [2] 796:5 800:10 relation [1] 794:16 relationships [1] 799:15

relative [5] 739:19 809:2 810:22 830:12 832:12 relatively [3] 746:25 779:2 820:11 relaxation [2] 839:18 840:14 relaxing [1] 751:7 release [5] 754:5 771:23 784:25 **785**:15 **786**:23 relevance [1] 791:9 relevant [7] 755:24 761:16 765:25 **766**:10 **790**:15 25 **811**:23 reliant [1] 825:3 relied [1] 843:14 relieves [1] 752:23 relock [3] 755:1 774:14 787:9 relocked [1] 783:24 remain [4] 819:19 820:22,23 848: remains [2] 828:5.5 Remarketers [1] 734:1 remarks [1] 808:19 remedy [2] 806:6.9 remind [1] 769:9 removal [2] 836:2 839:6 remove [1] 779:25 removed [2] 812:11 838:19 removing [3] 794:4 812:25 838:8 render [1] 754:2 rendered [2] 754:9.9 renewal [1] 838:24 repair [131] 731:8 734:11 736:10, 18,25 **737**:3,15 **738**:12,12 **744**:5 **745**:12 **746**:9 **750**:19,20,23,24 **751**:19 **753**:3,5,9 **755**:1,14 **758**:24 **762:**14 **763:**11.16.19 **764:**5.11 **765**:13.14 **766**:2.7.11.17.18.19.21. 25 **767**:7.9.12.17 **768**:4.6 **775**:13. 22 776:10.16 777:18 780:19 781: 5 782:9.15 783:23 788:14 789:2.8. 10,12,17,20 790:14,18 791:22 792: 17,17 **793**:9 **794**:15 **796**:13 **798**: 20,24 **799**:2,3,10,18,21 **801**:20,23 **803**:8 **804**:6,9,15,21 **805**:16 **810**: 12,16 817:20 818:6,8,10,16,17,20, 22 **819**:8,9 **827**:7,12,15,20 **828**:7, 16,17 829:13 830:3 831:23 832:7, 12,20 **834**:21,24 **835**:15,16,18,24 **838**:10,17 **840**:23,24 **841**:3,6,6,25 **842:**5 **846:**4.12.21 **847:**10.18.23 repaired [11] 739:25 750:17 779: 24 783:25 792:14 799:1 803:2,18, 22 841:14.15 repairers [1] 831:15 repairing [6] 748:6 783:2 784:9 787:9 803:4 829:15 repairs 9 766:21,24 767:1 775:20 **789**:24 **824**:10 **827**:13 **831**:17,24 rephrasing [1] 766:5 replace [7] 774:13,22 782:9,15 789:23 802:3 837:4 replacement [2] 796:5 829:21 Replacing [4] 775:16 783:2 789: 13 **813**:1

replete [1] 839:20 replies [1] 797:21 reply [4] 783:20 841:20,21,22 report [4] 817:9,13 822:6 824:3 reporter [2] 732:11 816:16 reporting [1] 817:7 reports [3] 807:18,19 814:19 represent [2] 769:2 827:18 representative [1] 821:1 representing [9] 733:8,14,18,21 **734**:4.17 **735**:4.9 **822**:18 reproduced [1] 776:14 reprogram [3] 744:23 745:14 755: reps [1] 833:18 request [6] 758:6 774:12 790:16 **794**:13 **844**:8 **846**:6 requested [1] 752:14 requesting [1] 812:12 requests [1] 843:11 require [3] 755:9 765:13 821:13 required [3] 750:22 803:23 804:13 requirements [4] 814:2,8,12,15 requires [2] 805:6 840:22 requiring [1] 842:4 research [14] 736:14,25 738:8,8 **739**:8 **744**:9 **749**:3,3 **761**:5,6 **791**: 16.18 837:8.12 researchers [1] 744:11 reset [2] 744:20 746:17 resource [1] 827:17 resources [2] 773:2 840:8 respect [14] 736:8.19 748:6 754: 19,22,24 781:25 784:1 803:6,7,23 807:22 816:20 848:9 respects [1] 748:5 respond [14] 731:15 754:15 768: 17 **770**:20 **774**:10 **784**:19 **793**:23 **802**:17,25 **815**:5 **817**:4 **822**:11 839:10 848:15 responding [1] 760:17 response [7] 743:2 785:19 791:11 809:8 843:8,23 846:9 responses [2] 818:1 843:12 responsibly [1] 780:23 responsive [1] 832:24 responsiveness [1] 815:12 rest [1] 774:19 restore [8] 737:3 779:21 782:20. 24 784:2.6 787:12.13 restored [2] 779:24 820:2 restoring [3] 783:19 794:19,22 restricted [1] 737:8 restricting [1] 789:2 restrictions [2] 751:8 781:1 result [3] 773:4 786:7 795:6 resulting [1] 822:21 results [1] 814:22 retaliation [1] 806:15 retrieved [1] 794:24 review [2] 798:17 813:20 reviews [1] 798:7

revoked [1] 794:21 rewrite [1] 757:20 right-size [2] 756:25 757:1 right-sizing [2] 757:9,14 rightly [1] 839:25 rights [4] 765:10 819:5 823:22 830: risk [4] 821:17 822:5 836:9 840:12 risks [1] 840:4 riskv [1] 789:24 road [2] 735:14 842:24 Robert [1] 733:24 robot [1] 801:2 robust [1] 803:10 role [1] 824:22 rooms [2] 789:20 818:17 root [1] 807:9 Rosenbaum [17] 735:2,3,3 750:7, 8 751:18 831:4 833:2 836:17 837: 24 839:6,12,13 842:22 843:9 846: 9 11 roster [1] 737:18 route [2] 737:14 770:5 rule [2] 823:15 847:19 rulemaking [8] 731:5 762:11 795: 17.22 796:11 816:25 840:2 845: ruling [1] 832:1 run [3] 746:14 778:22 780:6 running [3] 742:21 759:7 824:16 rural [2] 805:18 807:6 S-M-B [1] 731:25

sad [1] 788:16 sadly [1] 806:5 safe [2] 817:16 824:10 safely [1] 780:23 safety [13] 751:4 757:12 768:20 770:4.8 781:8 805:8 817:7 822:15 832:16 839:24 840:12 843:9 sake [1] 815:25 sales [1] 801:12 salient [1] 753:15 same [29] 738:12,21 739:6 741:18, 25 742:16 747:16 750:23 761:4 762:10 774:22 775:3 781:25 806: 20 814:18,20 815:8 820:20 824: 20 832:7,9 835:6,6 836:23 840:24 845:2 847:6.7.8 save [1] 814:22 saw [3] 736:20 804:10 845:17 saving [16] 751:23 752:4 757:20 761:23 773:14 783:25 784:20 787: 22 792:3 793:3 796:24 802:25 804:11 813:8 838:12 843:9 says [5] 810:13 813:23 814:9 837: 11 849:1 SCADA [2] 742:20 744:5 scale [2] 788:23 845:7 scam [1] 779:7

scenarios [1] 782:10

schedule [1] 767:10

scheme [1] 749:22 school [4] 744:16,17 745:7 746:15 scope [8] 735:18 761:3 763:14 **764**:21 **784**:21 **814**:1 **838**:11 **847**: sea [1] 802:12 search [6] 778:1.15.17 786:4.6.11 Second [8] 763:21 801:1 813:25 822:16 826:1 836:18 838:3 843: secondary [1] 805:15 Secondly [1] 735:21 secret [1] 787:20 Section [7] 731:5 765:8.11 814:4 818:5 823:14 846:20 sector [4] 767:6 769:24 831:25 845:2 sectors [1] 760:4 secure [5] 754:4 757:13 772:23 **784**:24 **802**:8 security [26] 736:14,25 738:8 739: 8 **742:**25 **743:**3 **744:**2,9,10 **745:**5 **747**:22 **749**:2,3,22 **755**:15,21 **757**: 13 **761**:5.6 **791**:15.17 **802**:5 **829**: 18.22 837:7.11 see [36] 737:20 742:5 744:1 749:2 751:13 754:20 758:17 768:14 777: 22 786:12 792:16 795:9,22 796: 16 **797**:8 **801**:9,12 **802**:4 **803**:1,16 **804**:23 **806**:9,18 **807**:21 **820**:5,25 822:3 829:17 830:6,20 832:23 **833:**1,23 **836:**1,2 **840:**19 seeing [8] 733:10 759:12 802:8 **803**:15 **805**:13,14 **826**:17 **835**:12 seek [2] 786:17 809:2 seeking [2] 809:9 810:18 seem [7] 742:3 756:2 782:9 783: 18.24 792:3 826:14 seemed [1] 822:20 seems [5] 769:15 770:25 785:16 826:23 838:12 seen [5] 785:11 795:2 825:2 834: 23 835:20 Sega [1] 768:1 segment [2] 733:22 750:9 segue [1] 770:15 sell [3] 779:6 788:2,3 selling [3] 740:8 803:5 806:21 Senate [1] 811:22 send [2] 767:2 818:15 Senior [1] 733:3 sense [3] 741:3 742:2 775:24 sent [1] 843:11 separate [5] 739:20 771:6 792:5 823:25 825:23 separated [1] 847:19 separately [1] 823:15 serious [2] 813:21 814:23 servers [2] 784:8 833:20 service [39] 746:11 751:21 767:8 15 **780**:20 **781**:3.10 **802**:11 **807**: 25 809:2,24 812:14,15,18,20,22

813:5 814:15 815:13 816:4.5 817: 19,20 818:23,25 820:12,13,21 821: 4 828:13 829:7,13,19 832:5 835:2 845:5 847:17,18,23 servicer [3] 806:1 808:2 816:10 Servicers [4] 734:1 805:15 806:23 services [14] 758:17 765:13 14 **767**:4.18 **804**:15 **806**:12 **818**:20 **830**:17 **846**:4.13.21 **847**:19 **848**:9 servicing [7] 804:13,18 807:3 817: 8.11.17 830:21 session [2] 731:14.25 set [3] 745:1 829:5.8 sets [1] 793:16 setting [2] 757:24 773:7 settings [5] 745:3,5 747:3 820:18, Seventy [1] 750:18 several [1] 806:14 shaking [1] 801:24 share [3] 821:6 833:6 843:8 shared [1] 738:19 she's [1] 757:19 Sheehan [45] 734:6,7,7 736:21,23 **738**:18 **739**:4 **754**:14 **763**:1,6 **765**: 23 766:4,12,14 767:20,23 768:11, 15,17 **783**:4 **788**:18,21 **790**:4 **812**: 6 **817**:1,3 **819**:10 **827**:25 **828**:10, 11 829:24 830:1 833:1,24 835:8,9 **836:**16,25 **837:**19,22 **838:**15,23 **845**:17,23 **848**:14 Sheehan's [2] 823:6 843:17 shelf [1] 787:25 shift [1] 770:13 ship [1] 767:10 shops [11] 750:20.23 766:17 789: 18 **827**:12,15 **840**:24 **841**:3,6,25 short [4] 733:7 735:14 823:5 843:4 shorter [1] 762:24 shouldn't [4] 758:10,11 765:2 849: show [2] 748:9 800:11 showing [1] 741:25 shown [2] 799:12 844:13 shows [2] 752:8 796:12 side [5] 773:3.3 788:22 831:22 832: sign [2] 732:2,3 signal [1] 731:19 significant [4] 756:16 773:2 798: 16 **825**:14 significantly [1] 799:19 Silberberg [1] 735:9 similar [9] 736:24 738:20 739:2 **744**:12 **758**:18 **780**:13 **786**:4,6 839:5 similarly [2] 738:7 741:20 simple [2] 761:21 767:1 simply [6] 774:25 798:23 805:3 820:25 841:4 842:17

since [11] 755:24 761:9 772:17 785:5.12 795:22 798:17 806:24 810:22 815:4 840:17 single [4] 736:11 777:14 786:9 834:12 sip [1] 756:25 SiriusXM [1] 847:20 site [1] 779:5 sites [1] 779:8 sits [1] 737:22 sitting [2] 810:11 821:1 situation [6] 749:9 759:12 774:2 **775**:4 **821**:6 **833**:21 situations [2] 748:15 794:15 six [1] 808:2 sixth [1] 731:4 slowdown [1] 806:18 slowly [1] 732:12 smack [1] 745:25 smaller [2] 821:5 822:2 smart [4] 737:24 738:4.15 742:20 SMITH [68] 731:3,3 732:25 733:6. 15.19.23 **734**:2.6.9.12.22 **735**:2.6. 11 **738**:16 **740**:12 **741**:8.14 **744**:4 **745**:20 **746**:14 **747**:5 **749**:10 **750**: 6 **751**:12 **754**:11 **756**:4 **758**:14,20 **759**:2,4 **760**:7 **762**:19,22 **765**:21, 24 766:6,13 767:19,22 768:10,13, 16 **769**:6 **770**:9 **795**:16 **802**:18 816:9,11 824:17,19,25 838:1,3,15, 18,24 842:22 843:21,23 844:2,5, 23 845:15 847:13 848:1 849:8 so-called [1] 749:15 software [44] 737:2 10 739:13 741 7 742:14 745:24 747:1 751:3 755: 1.7 756:18.18.23 757:20 758:1.4.8. 11 759:13.15.17.24 762:8 763:25 **764**:1,8 **771**:4 **777**:1,7,12 **780**:6 **790:**23 **800:**21 **810:**4,9 **818:**10 819:19 820:22 828:5 832:7 839: 21 844:17.21 847:7 software-embedded [1] 758:23 software-enabled [7] 737:18 763: 10.15 766:16 768:2 847:5.11 sold [2] 739:24 740:10 Solutions [2] 733:22 780:19 solve [1] 792:22 somehow [2] 755:13 759:4 someone [12] 731:22 745:4.13 **746**:16 **758**:12 **761**:14,16,18 **769**: 12 773:14 793:9 829:19 someone's [1] 823:24 sometimes [1] 737:21 somewhat [1] 773:22 sorry [10] 794:3,6 808:16 809:5 815:24 824:18 825:17 829:25 830: sort [37] 736:10 740:21 741:9 742: 3.13 743:25 744:2 746:5.6 750:10 751:21 752:3.6 758:17 766:2 770: 24 771:11.12.13 776:10 782:11 791:9 792:4 793:19 800:2 801:5

9,20 839:6 840:16 841:14 843:3 845:17 sought [1] 817:10 sound [1] 792:13 sounds [1] 741:8 source [1] 794:24 space [9] 748:16 749:21 750:1 **771**:18 **783**:7 **785**:24 **795**:4 **823**: 22 837:7 sparked [1] 845:22 speaker's [1] 822:6 speakers [2] 747:9 751:25 speaking [7] 732:14 734:10 805:3 807:23 813:14 816:3 827:10 special [1] 818:21 specialize [1] 789:19 specific [15] 731:14 732:4 735:24 736:1 739:10,24 744:8 797:18 814:6 820:1 822:9,10 827:2,4 833: specifically [4] 749:15 785:24 792:24 795:4 specifications [3] 814:8 820:4 821:15 specificity [1] 763:5 specifics [4] 782:7 784:13 803:19 804:2 specter [1] 764:24 sphere [1] 800:20 spoken [2] 754:13 804:7 Spotify [1] 847:20 sprinklers [1] 745:2 Stacev [1] 733:3 staff [2] 811:18 848:22 stake [1] 791:5 stand [1] 749:10 standard [1] 822:4 standardized [1] 842:4 standards [3] 839:23 843:15 845: standing [1] 813:7 start [4] 763:8 770:5 793:10 839: 14 started [1] 732:15 starting [2] 733:9 802:4 state [10] 759:2 765:7 769:22 782: 25 791:23 806:10 811:22 828:6 834:9 840:21 states [1] 821:22 statistics [1] 813:18 statute [3] 793:15 798:3 845:24 statutory [6] 739:17 749:4 792:8 797:4 798:15 841:17 stay [2] 781:23 821:18 step [2] 760:23 768:3 steps [1] 829:5 Steve [2] 733:20 815:15 stick [1] 826:25 still [19] 738:11 740:3 741:19 752: 20 759:25 761:16 762:17 784:10 785:4 786:23 792:16 794:4.6 803:

819:22 820:3 822:15 834:16 837:

2 810:21 812:8 832:12 838:10 **845**:3 stolen [1] 777:4 stop [2] 781:16 830:4 storage [2] 773:21 789:20 stored [1] 787:5 story [1] 744:15 stream [2] 743:14 827:21 stressing [1] 738:19 strictly [1] 759:11 stringent [1] 839:23 structured [1] 758:15 structures [1] 823:8 studies [1] 784:22 studios [1] 772:25 study [2] 817:6,9 stuff [2] 812:1 847:12 subcategory [1] 739:9 subject [2] 763:25 849:15 submission [1] 796:8 submit [1] 814:19 subscription [4] 751:21 758:17 847:18 19 substantially [2] 742:15 806:1 substitute [2] 740:3 837:10 success [1] 772:16 successful [2] 772:13 786:19 sudden [1] 755:25 Suez [1] 799:16 suffer [1] 808:11 sufficient [4] 739:1 792:3 804:14 846:15 sufficiently [2] 771:21,22 suggest [1] 831:18 suggested [1] 797:23 suggesting [3] 841:16,23 842:15 suggestion [2] 841:8 842:5 suggestions [1] 749:14 summing [1] 847:4 superfluous [1] 843:18 supply [2] 788:4 799:11 support [7] 733:10 745:23 814:13, 15 **839**:18 **840**:14 **841**:11 support.xbox.com [1] 803:1 supporting [2] 754:22 795:23 supports [2] 745:17,20 survey [1] 805:20 suspect [1] 758:24 synonymous [2] 740:20,23 System [28] 734:18 742:20 743:15, 21 744:19,20,23 745:7,10,17 746: 10,20 748:11 749:24 755:16 778: 6 **783**:1 **784**:24 **811**:13,15 **814**:2 **817:**21 **834:**8,9,22 **835:**5,5,17 systems [15] **744:**5,11,25 **756:**3 **764**:18 **767**:14,16 **776**:6 **814**:6 824:8 835:12,13,23,25 838:17

Т

T.V [1] 786:11 T2 [1] 802:5 tailored [1] 736:16 take-home [1] 829:14

talked [6] 747:6 753:1 763:22 771: 8 835:4 837:4 talks [1] 786:11 tangible [2] 766:15 818:11 target [1] 771:21 targeting [1] 803:15 tech [3] 810:12,15 832:9 technical [6] 731:23 786:12.20 **787**:4 **819**:15 **831**:22 technically [2] 742:14 832:15 technician [4] 746:11 747:2 818: 16 835.2 technicians [3] 818:24.25 819:1 techniques [1] 802:8 technological [3] 737:11 758:24 829:10 technologies [2] 746:24 753:11 technology [6] 746:19 755:4 757: 18 **771**:17 **798**:9 **801**:17 telematic [9] 834:8,22 835:5,12,13, 17 23 25 838:16 telematics [6] 764:17 834:22 838: 9 840:17 20 841:2 temporary [1] 791:15 tend [1] 793:18 tension [1] 816:22 term [3] 741:6 845:25 846:1 terminal [1] 829:20 terms [13] 739:16 748:19 755:9 758:20 761:18 763:22 764:23 766: 1,3 825:21 842:11,16 844:4 Tesla [1] 835:14 test [1] 757:23 testimony [1] 846:10 testina [1] 791:17 Thanks [9] 776:20 777:21 795:14 **808**:14 **812**:3 **820**:10 **830**:9 **844**:2 849-17 themselves [2] 732:17 809:13 there's [46] 738:25 742:2 744:6 **745**:3,22 **746**:2 **747**:21 **748**:16 **749**:4 **750**:15,17,21 **752**:13,21 **762**:17 **763**:12 **766**:1,9,10 **769**:15, 18 **770:**3 **782:**7,21 **783:**11 **785:**22 **791**:3 **792**:24 **793**:7 **794**:12 **795**: 23 796:10 799:20 806:8 15 816: 19 **831**:10 23 **832**:11 **840**:10 **841**: 7 10 15 842:3 14 19 therefore [3] 773:17 786:24 846:1 they'll [1] 806:18 They've [3] 746:12 789:21 802:7 think's [1] 784:10 thinking [1] 847:20 third [4] 743:22 746:5 753:20 817: third-party [12] 769:16 814:17 817: 15,18 827:15 831:24 832:4 841:6 845:7 846:4.6 848:9

though 5 742:16 757:17 773:13

thoughts [3] 754:18 763:5 770:10

three [12] 732:4 737:17 738:3 798:

810:21 846:24

8 **800**:17 **801**:15,17 **802**:13 **807**:1 834:6.7 835:4 threshold [1] 798:2 thriving [1] 750:18 throughout [1] 818:7 throw [1] 799:6 thwart [1] 806:11 tied [2] 740:10 801:11 ties [1] 801:4 timing [3] 745:2,3 793:8 tired [1] 778:4 Today [13] 731:6.10.25 735:4 753: 2.4 771:8 777:3 790:5 791:14 795: 5 808:18 830:25 today's [1] 732:8 together [4] 773:4 788:2,8 845:11 tomorrow [3] 732:2,7 849:17 ton [1] 772:21 took [2] 744:25 840:3 tool [6] 769:17 774:7 775:23 777:1. 7 780:6 tools [20] 750:24 756:14.21 757:2. 7 **769**:13.20.20 **777**:3.12 **825**:16. 16.17 831:8 840:23 842:1.4.6.10 topic [5] 791:9 793:24 794:8 830:8 **831:**3 towards [2] 752:16 753:10 TPM [18] 752:8 759:11 760:21.24 **763**:12 **774**:18 **775**:1 **784**:23 **787**: 13 789:15 790:21 801:4 808:7 **811**:9 **818**:23 **822**:22 **828**:4,12 TPM-breaking [1] 757:6 TPMs [55] 738:21 741:22 742:2.6 **743**:6 11 **747**:22 **751**:20 **756**:15 **757**:2 12 **758**:16 **759**:8 14 **760**:19 **762**:7.9 **763**:10.15.17.19 **764**:3 **766**:9 **768**:19 **771**:1.6 **773**:14 **775**: 7,11,19 781:2 782:20 783:19 784: 3,9 785:9 796:3,12 797:2,11,13 800:11 802:2 804:8,20 809:17 812:10,24 819:11,17 823:1 825:9 829:15 830:2 844:10 traction [1] 820:18 tractor [4] 738:14 766:22 769:17 810:5 tractors [1] 847:5 trade [1] 799:15 traditionally [1] 743:5 trafficking [2] 845:21 848:12 trained [2] 746:7,10 transcribing [1] 732:11 transformative [2] 768:4 844:19 transmission [1] 833:10 transparency [2] 814:18 849:15 Transportation [2] 840:7 843:12 Transtate [1] 733:21 treat [1] 805:18 treatment [1] 745:7

tremendous [2] 808:18 842:25

trial [1] 806:14

trick [1] 779:9

trimmed [1] 836:15 true [4] 764:22 784:8 792:15 798: trusted [1] 772:19 trustful [1] 771:21 trustworthy [1] 771:22 try [11] 731:16 732:11 733:9 736:4 **754**:12 **761**:14 **762**:23 **779**:1 **781**: 23 793:13 843:4 trvina [2] 800:7 814:10 turn [13] 731:17 770:20 791:20 **795**:12 **796**:15 **804**:5.24 **806**:3 830:8 831:2 832:25 833:24 836: turned [1] 744:19 turning [1] 736:2 tweak [1] 761:21 two [11] 736:11 740:15 749:10 755: 18 **782**:10 **783**:7,22 **788**:8 **793**:7 822:9 825:23 type [2] 775:4 812:20 types [13] 742:8 744:11,14 766:21 **775**:20 **791**:25 **795**:13.18 **800**:13 819:18 821:15 822:13 823:2 typical [1] 793:16 U.S [2] 734:8 817:21 ubiquitous [1] 835:13 unable [3] 789:21 805:23 818:17 unauthorized [9] 743:22 773:18 777:2 783:3 786:1 794:23 795:6 **811**:14 **821**:24 unaware [2] 769:4 828:12 unclear [1] 737:22 unconscionable [1] 813:4 under [16] 737:5 748:24 750:21 **765**:11 **783**:5 **785**:10 **798**:14 **807**: 21 831:9.14 837:12.14 841:25 842:14 846:19.20 underlying [2] 790:20 793:17 undermine [1] 749:22 underneath [2] 759:16,19 understand [7] 754:14 766:4 770: 24 777:19 780:22 823:12 842:23 understanding [12] 755:18 774: 11 **775**:7,18 **782**:22 **784**:4,15 **796**: 24 798:10 799:11 803:21 827:11 understood [3] 740:25 768:7 798: undertake [2] 805:24 821:25 undertaken [3] 791:21.24 808:7 unfortunately [2] 805:21 845:1

unifying [1] 739:15

unites [1] 739:16

823:23

unlawful [1] 752:10

unlock [2] 743:17 774:13

unlocked [2] 741:22 783:22

unique [3] 739:19 774:19 775:6

unless [5] 779:24 787:12,13 793:4

unlocking [4] 741:20 743:21 755:

Heritage Reporting Corporation (202) 628-4888

unpatched [1] 756:10 unrelated [1] 840:4 up [48] 732:2,3,4 737:10,25 743:14 **745**:1 **747**:3,7 **748**:10 **753**:1 **754**: 17 755:4 756:15 760:9 770:14 773:8,10 778:2,8,14,25 783:1 785: 3,16,21 **788**:7 **791**:8 **793**:2 **794**:1, 4.6 **795**:10.15 **796**:7 **803**:4 **805**:13 **810**:13 **811**:21 **813**:8 **826**:25 **830**: 6 836:24 837:1 846:10 847:4 848: 7 23

19 849:19

unlocks [1] 745:4

upside [1] 745:25 urge [1] 830:19 useful [1] 752:5 useless [1] 740:11 user [3] 807:18 831:13 845:25 user's [1] 769:4 users [12] 737:16 747:23 748:13, 14 750:16 753:19 756:19 766:16 **769**:16 **831**:15.19 **841**:24 uses [7] 744:13 753:11 756:18 760: 6 **761**:12 **768**:7 **826**:3 using [10] 740:14 761:11 769:2 **782**:4,10 **793**:10 **797**:11 **836**:9 845:25 846:3 utility [1] 844:20

vacuum [1] 801:6 vacuums [2] 801:3,3 valid [2] 757:19 817:10 valuable [2] 816:5 827:16 value [4] 747:25 776:19 780:22 827:21 values [8] 754:1,8 771:9,14 772:2, 4 773:22 776:8 variety [2] 746:19 748:9 various [4] 731:7 777:2 785:13 821:12 vector [2] 778:13.19 vehicle [12] 751:19 758:15 764:17 765:3 791:22 810:4 831:13 835: 11 839:16,21,22 840:1 vehicles [10] 736:3 750:9 751:18 762:13 802:22 828:1 831:3,10 839:23 848:7 vendor [2] 821:24,25 ventilators [2] 818:18 820:20 venue [1] 825:25 versus [3] 786:12 808:2 817:12 via [1] 835:2 video [34] 732:9 735:25 747:20 748:6,16 749:20 750:5 752:6 754: 19,22 **755**:21 **761**:7 **770**:17 **774**: 19,20 **775**:6,15 **778**:8 **781**:17,23 **783**:7,21,25 **787**:9 **789**:19 **790**:22 **792**:4,14,23 **797**:22 **798**:16,18 **799**:8 **803**:15 view [2] 841:4 849:2

837:5 839:8 violated [1] 757:2 violates [2] 759:21 836:13 violating [3] 769:3,4 836:3 violation [2] 806:13 839:17 Virginia [1] 805:20 virtual [1] 732:13 virtually [1] 737:2 vital [2] 780:19 781:15 vulnerabilities [1] 743:3 vulnerable [1] 799:13

W

wait [3] 781:10.13 818:19 waiting [5] 778:4 780:12 784:17 789:8 818:14 walks [1] 786:17 wanted [34] 750:10 751:9 767:23 768:17 769:23 770:18,24 774:22 781:17 783:16 784:18 787:3 788: 21 **790**:3 **791**:7 **795**:21 **802**:24 808:21 817:3 828:3,14 833:23,25 836:18,24 839:4,10 843:7 844:21 **845:**18 **846:**8 **848:**9,13,22 wants [1] 777:9 warranty [5] 792:16 799:2,3 803: 18.19 watch [2] 737:24 805:16 watching [1] 731:24 water [1] 745:7 wave [3] 731:19 740:14 814:25 way [35] 731:15 738:22 741:4 744: 20 745:22 746:21 749:8 752:22 **756**:7,22 **757**:21,22 **758**:15,22 **760**:1 **761**:17,20 **762**:6 **773**:20 782:13 783:9 810:10 814:16,20 820:2 823:9.11 824:9.10.21 825: 10 826:16 836:6.11 843:14 wearable [1] 737:23 website [1] 732:9 websites [1] 803:16 week [2] 745:14 811:24 weekend [1] 745:12 weigh [1] 817:1 weighing [1] 828:23 weight [1] 846:11 welcome [1] 763:5 well-established [1] 807:14 West [1] 805:19 whatever [5] 760:9 809:16 820:25 **837**:13 **847**:24 whatever's [1] 811:23 wheelchair [3] 818:14 820:12.19 Whereupon [1] 849:21 whether [39] 735:18 737:22 738: 13,20,25 741:25 742:5,19 747:15 748:24 749:7 761:1 763:9 766:1,2, 9,10 768:23 769:1 778:16 782:23 784:9 791:20 796:3,10 797:2 810: 5 **818**:4 **824**:21 **825**:1 **827**:7 **828**: 23,24 832:13 841:1 842:8 844:9,

11 847:4

white [1] 830:16

whole [7] 744:19 755:15,20 775: 17 777:11 800:24 846:10 wide [2] 748:9 790:8 widely [5] 757:3 785:4,6 789:1 806: Wiens [34] 734:9,10,10 741:16,17 742:10 744:15 745:22 746:20 747: 11 **756**:9 **779**:3,4 **787**:2,3,11 **788**: 22.25 **790**:4 **800**:1.16 **812**:6 **819**: 14 820:5.10 821:8 832:25 833:5.6 834:2.4 835:7 847:14.15 Wiens's [2] 748:8 756:20 will [28] **731:**13 **732:**6,9 **744:**1,3 746:22 751:15 752:9 761:2 769: 20 771:23 778:17 779:8,9,10 782: 19 783:21 786:6 800:21 806:19 815:12 816:15 821:18,25 829:3 849:13,17,18 Williams [24] 735:7,8,9 741:16 **747**:7.10 **749**:18 **752**:5 **764**:23 769:1 781:21,22 783:13,15 784:4 **792**:11,12 **798**:21 **802**:16,23,24 804:4 848:2.5 Williams's [1] 768:18 willing [1] 784:25 willingness [2] 785:14 849:10 wipe [2] 744:22 747:3 wired [1] 835:2 wireless [4] 835:5,23,25 838:16 wirelessly [1] 835:3 wise [1] 748:18 wish [5] 731:14 732:1.4 754:15 808:8 within [7] 756:2 764:11 780:18 784:21 814:1 829:6 832:15 without [12] 740:11 774:25 782:16 784:9 789:22 804:1 807:8 816:15 818:13 826:17 833:10 837:15 witnessed [1] 806:24 wonder [4] 738:19 792:2,6,9 wonderful [1] 779:8 wondering [2] 751:16 831:14 word [3] 740:14 794:15 848:4 words [1] 837:10 work [25] 738:21 742:14.18 743:8 745:8 746:8 750:19 762:7 769:17 779:16 784:2 787:12 788:8 790: 20 791:1 793:11 797:3 805:24 816:16 819:12 824:4 829:1,12,12 845:14 worked [1] 760:3 working [4] 780:1 781:12 810:17 830:16 works [22] 738:25 739:9 751:20 752:2,10 756:2 762:6 764:9 773:4 785:15 786:25 787:6 790:11 792: 1 809:12.14 810:8 819:18 820:1 844.15 16 17 world [11] 737:18 743:23 754:4 785:17 786:13 789:18 800:18 24 801:17 834:7 847:22

who's [1] 816:21

worried [3] 808:10 826:16,20 wrap [2] 770:14 794:1 wrapping [1] 846:9 write [1] 837:13 writing [1] 757:25 written [1] 804:10

x-ray [1] 805:11 Xbox [15] 778:1,3,4,15 779:10,12, 12 780:4 786:3 795:7 798:25,25 799:1 803:1.2 Xboxes [1] 780:16

year [4] 762:14 793:9 806:14 834: years [14] 737:17 738:3 778:5 795: 2 **798**:8 **800**:17 **801**:15,17 **802**:13 803:4 819:25 834:7,7 835:4 Yep [1] 758:19 yield [1] 786:6 yourself [2] 732:13 733:1

Z

zero [1] 805:23 Zoom [1] 731:15

views [1] 732:5

violate [5] 761:17 778:11 831:11